



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: bgarber@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission Minutes

Tuesday, November 20, 2012 @ 4:00 PM - Town Hall

Commissioners present: Carole Berger, Mary Sullivan, Beverly Fearey, James Cisek, Robbie Hutchison, Edith Blake. Staff: Bricque Garber

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Berger at 4:02 PM.

1. **4:00 – 62 N. Summer St. (20D-101)** Sharon Rosenfeld Scott. *Agent – Bobby Fuller, Fullers Energy. Continued from 11.5.12.* Applicant proposes to install a flush mount solar energy system on the roof of the home. A site inspection was done today at @3:30. Mr. Fuller appeared to answer questions. Robbie said she prefers the look of the black edged panel, wanted to know how much less energy is generated by the black edged panel. Bobby Fuller said the difference is only 5 watts. James said the look of this installation has negligible impact and these installations should be considered on a case by case basis. Robbie said this one is a unique situation as it can be hardly seen as it is such a low pitch. James noted it is very flat for a roof and made a motion to approve plan as presented with panels to have a black frame. 2nd Beverly Feary. Unanimously approved. (Mary Sullivan abstained from the vote as she was not at the meeting for the presentation).
2. **4:15 – 93 N. Water St. (20D-281)** 93 N. Water St. Trust/Brien O'Brien. *Agent - Sean Murphy.* Applicant proposes installation of metal Balcony on 2nd floor or south facing elevation. Existing balcony. The balcony in question was put on the house without the okay from the HDC and has been the subject of a violation. Sean Murphy appeared for the applicant.

Carole Berger read a chronology of the balcony discussions and votes by the HDC:

- 7/6/11 - Commission reviewed photos of installed brass balcony along with other elements of the home, not in the approved plans. Hearing continued.
- 8/2/11 - Public input from neighbors, the balcony issue was continued.
- 9/6/11 - Ms. Feary moved to remove balcony and asked applicant to submit a plan to replace. Voted to unanimously approve.
- 6/5/12 - Minutes reflect the following statements by members. 1) Ms. Fearey said that the balcony is not in keeping with the house. 2) Ms. Hutchison said that they basket style balcony has significantly changed the rear of the house, from the plans, and was not approved. 3) Ms. Berger noted that this balcony would not have been approved had it been on the plan and it is totally inappropriate for the Historic District. 4) Mr. Cisek said that the balcony should be removed. The applicant was told that the balcony would be allowed to remain through the summer season but the owner must provide a plan for replacement by September 1st, 2012.
- 9/1/12 - No application has been filed and the balcony remains in place.
- 10/2/12 - HDC hears a new application for the existing approved balcony to be modified with a cedar wrapped top rail. Application was denied and a denial letter mailed to the application.
- 11/20/12 - A new application to retain the existing balcony is received. Ms. Berger noted that this balcony was previously denied and that the denial is valid today.

Sean Murphy said that he is formally asking to leave the balcony in place. Reasoning that the balcony is important to the owners and they have done much to correct issues in the past. The owners do not think it is out of character in the neighborhood and while the material is not usual the commission is not supposed to deny based on material alone. Carol Berger related that the denial deals with both design and material. Mary Sullivan noted that she believes that the history is valid but any board should weigh the merits as the case evolves. Carole said that she believes there that is no reason to change the vote as the structure has not changed. Mary Sullivan said that she believes she board should not be beholden to history and that Sean Murphy and his client have the right to appeal. Carole does not think there has been any change since the original decision of the commission. James Cisek said that he thinks this balcony is inappropriate for the character of the house. Robbie Hutchison said she is not opposed to the material but is opposed to the style and it was not approved. Mary Sullivan noted that there is a documented history regarding this balcony and we have held other to the plans as presented. A motion to deny the application for the brass balcony, as inappropriate for the design of the house, was made by James Cisek. 2nd, Beverly Fearey. The vote to deny the application was unanimous.

3. **4:30 – 71 S. Water St. (20D-335)** Damien & Hilary Brier. *Agent - Patrick Ahearn*. Applicant proposes to build a “Nantucket” dormer at existing 3rd floor roof on the south side. Patrick Ahearn for applicant. Mr. Ahearn showed plans to the commission. James asked if the roof would be raised. Patrick no. James noted that it is hard to see from a public way. Beverly said that she thinks it will look much better. Mary made the motion to accept as presented. James 2nd. Unanimous.
4. **4:45 – 92 S. Water St. (29B-11.21)** John Quigley. *Agent – Flaherty Brothers*. Applicant proposes to remove and replace grey asphalt single roof & trim. Mr. Flaherty appeared with samples of the pewter grey shingles. He noted that the roof was approx 30 years old and leaking. Motion to approve. Robbie Hutchison. Mary Sullivan, 2nd. Unanimously approved.
5. **5:00 – 7 S. Water St. (20D-323) Harborside.** *Agent - Jefferson Mercier*. Applicant proposes to remove and replaced rotted sidewall shingles with T-111 in area of no sunlight as shingles rot quickly in this location. A site visit was done today at 3:30. Beverly Fearey and Carole Berger noted that this area cannot be easily seen. Ms. Fearey made the motion to approve the use of T111 siding for the lower level south side, utility area. 2nd, James Cisek. Unanimously approved.
6. **5:10 – 131 N. Water St. (20B-107) Harborview/Huxford Cottage.** *Agent –Scout Construction*. Sean Murphy for the applicant showed photos and Applicant proposes to install a 15 lite door as egress from room 93. Motion to approve Beverly Fearey. 2nd Mary Sullivan. Unanimously approved.
7. **5:20 – 41 Dock St. (20D-304)** Bill & Olivia Weeks. *Agent-Michael Forgione*. Applicant proposes to remove and replace white cedar sidewall on NE side of building & East side of building facing the Harbor. Michael Forgione appeared for the applicant. Due to storms and floods the work is needed and the building has not been shingled since late 70’s. He said that the shingles are falling off and has created an eyesore. He has done power washing on the worse parts on Harbor side & on the ‘Chappy’ ferry side. Mr. Forgione proposes to tear off the sidewalls and replace with new shingles. The commission asked if the applicant would consider re-shingling all sides. Mr. Forgione said that owner wants to only do only 2 sides this year. James made the motion to approve. Mary provided the 2nd. Unanimously approved.
8. **5:30 – 67 Winter St. Chadwick Inn (20D-105.2, .2, .3) Jane St. Realty LLC.** Applicant proposes to repair exterior siding, add 2 doors and paint building white. Patrick Ahearn brought photos of the building and described the purchase of the property and subsequent economic issues. He said that the owners now plan to bring the property up to code. He noted that the floor has collapsed and that the building will be repaired and fixed up over a period of time, from

the inside out. Lenny Jason, Building Inspector, said that this application needed to come to this commission though much is not seen from a public way. The house can only be seen from west elevation due to trees. Mr. Ahearn noted that the owners have recently obtained funding to bring the building back and get it stabilized. James noted that there should be no Azek. Robbie noted that the commission is happy that this building will be fixed up. Motion to approve as presented was made by Robbie Hutchison for repair and stabilization of the building with the change of a window to a door. All work to be done with like kind materials. Mary Sullivan 2nd. Unanimously approved.

9. *New Business:*

- *Minutes 11.5.12. Motion to approve Robbie Hutchison. 2nd, Mary Sullivan Unanimously approved.*
- *Committee question: To clarify procedure for questions that may be appropriate for Town Council. Bricque explained that the Town Administrator will look at the questions and if she cannot answer the question, she will advise taking the issue to the Selectmen for approval to go to contact Town Council.*
- *A letter will be sent to the owner of the property at 33A North Summer St, regarding light fixtures which are currently in violation. The tenant has not presented the commission with a viable alternative to the fixtures and has not attended the past 2 meetings as requested.*
- *HDC boundary discussion ensued as the commissioners worked with maps and proposed possible borders for the extension of the HDC. Bricque will request new maps for continuation of this discussion at the next meeting.*
- *The file for the O'Connor & Chatinover fence on Simpson's Lane, will closed as the fence in violation has been removed. As no new fence has been built, Town Council advised no further action at this time.*

The meeting was adjourned at 5:20

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber
Assistant

Approved _____ date: _____
Carole Berger, Chairman