

## **Edgartown Historic District Commission Minutes 4/3/2012**

Commissioners present: Carole Berger, James Cisek, Beverly Fearey, Edith Blake  
Staff: Bricque Garber

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Cisek at 4:02 PM

- 1. 4:00 29 Church St./Visitor's Center (20D-115)** Town of Edgartown. Applicant proposes addition of a spiral staircase to rear of the building. Pam Dolby for the Town of Edgartown explained that the spiral staircase is necessary to provide egress from the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor of the building of the VTA. Lenny Jason, Edgartown Building Inspector, has said that a spiral staircase is the only style which can be built in the limited space without involving other buildings. Pam acknowledged that a spiral staircase is not in keeping with historic but is only reasonable choice and noted that this will not be seen from a public way. The color for the staircase was discussed as there are several color options available. Angie Grant of the Vineyard Transit Authority said that any color is okay with the VTA Eddie Blake suggested white. James Cisek noted that white may look dirty quickly. Carole Berger suggested grey and Mr. Cisek agreed. Beverly Fearey made a motion approve the application with grey as the color. A 2<sup>nd</sup> was provided by Eddie Blake. The vote was unanimous.
- 2. 4:10 Public Hearing - 85 N. Water St. (19B-5.2)** Booker Massachusetts Trust/Dudley Cannada-agent. Applicant proposes to add 3 dormers, replace some windows and replace roof. Dudley Cannada for the applicant presented the plans and photos of the property known as the Wheel House. He noted that the house is visible from N. Water St. and can be seen from the Marina across the rear yard of the neighbor. Mr. Cannada proposed replacement of the slate roof with a replicated 2 color reproduction slate roof, made from recycled tires. He reported that the existing slate roof is colored lilac and grey and the new roof will be custom matched to create the same look. He noted that this new roof product is very good for impact. Mr. Cannada said that the only window trim replaced will be on the doors and will replicate the existing with wood. The home currently has aluminum siding which is no longer available and thus will be matched painted wood where needed.

There are three dormers proposed, one facing N. Water St., and the other two located between the gables. There will be a change to three windows from small to longer windows and shutters will be changed to be the right size for the new windows. Additionally there will be changes to two windows on porch that cannot be seen from the public way. There will be no changes to 2<sup>nd</sup> floor. Beverly Fearey asked about the shutters and was told that in various places there are sets of windows with existing single shutters. Beverly & James Cisek asked about eliminating some shutters. Dudley said he would be glad to remove these shutters but noted that the front dormer does need a shutter which will be a full

closing shutter. James Cisek asked about the brand of windows. Dudley said he will bring the window specs to the commission when they are selected, noting that this house takes beating from the weather and he needs to research the window products available. Bricque Garber read a letter of support from an abutter. There being no further public Comments, the meeting was closed. Eddie Blake moved to approve Eddie, Beverley Fearey provided the 2<sup>nd</sup>. The vote was unanimous.

- 3. 4:25 55 Main St. (20D-210)** Lucky Seven Realty Trust/Patrick Courtney-agent. Applicant proposes to paint exterior trim, replace awnings and build a fence on the roof to screen views. Mr. Courtney made his presentation for changes to the building known to some members as the Old First National Bank building. He plans to paint the existing metal trim, black but will not use high-gloss paint, noting that it is currently dark green. He brought a paint sample (color name Beluga). Patrick said they will replace the existing awning (currently green) with a new grey color, (fabric swatch in file) with matching trim. No signage will be on the awning. He proposes to paint the small overhang over front door with a light blue color. He brought aqua blue color choices for the commission to review. He had tried to match the blue color to those he saw used for a similar purpose, at properties at 112 and 80 North Water St.

Patrick described the building of a privacy screen on rear of the building. He said it would be built with pressure treated wood and stained dark green. The screen will be 15 feet long 4 feet tall with a 3 inch elevation to allow for water run-off. The screen will allow privacy for neighbors and conceal the 2 air conditioners from view. This fence will be only on the back of the building and cannot be seen from close-up but can be seen from further down Summer St. There was discussion and it was moved to approve the application with the approval of the blue green color to be continued until members have had a chance to view other properties with similar colors. Further discussion about the privacy fence showed that some members could not visualize the fence. Patrick did a rough sketch of the fence and noted that it does not run the whole length of the rear of the rather it covers approximately 1/3 of length of the building. James made a motion to rescind the original motion to approve and continue the application until 4/17/12 with a site visit to be scheduled on that day. Patrick said he will bring a more detailed drawing. Beverly provided a 2<sup>nd</sup>. The vote to continue was unanimous.

- 4. 4:40 51 Winters St. (20D-109.2)** St. Andrews Church-Parish House. Applicant proposes to replace and repair rotted 2<sup>nd</sup> floor railing. Frank Welch and Wesley Brown showed the members plans for the parish house. They noted that the original construction was poor and was this leak was not properly repaired so it now needs replacing, noting that it has been leaking since 2001. Mr. Welch explained that the original design is tricky and that the railing was built into the roof and not sealed properly. The rubber roof was caulked and capped but was not overlapped and began to leak at the joints. Water got behind the flashing and flashing needs replacing too. They said they will duplicate the

original railing with wood. They noted there will be no Azek. Motion to approve was made by Ms. Blake. The 2<sup>nd</sup> was provided by Ms. Berger. Approved unanimously.

- 5. 4:50 128 N. Water St. (20D-275)** Robert & Linda Forrester/David Dutton-Agent. Applicant proposes to replace existing fence with one of the same style and color, with 2 gates. Ms. Blake noted this house was the first summer person's house built in Edgartown. David Dutton made his presentation with photos and drawings. He proposed new 6x6 posts and new pickets. He noted that the existing fence does not date from the time of the construction of the house. There was a discussion regarding the fence details including post caps and gate posts. Mr. Dutton would prefer to build the fence with Azek and brought wood and Azek pieces to the commission, for comparison. There was a discussion about new Azek products. Mr. Dutton noted the advantages for builder and the property owner saying that wood fencing can be damaged by water getting behind the paint and that Azek does not absorb moisture. He said that the Azek would be painted.

David believes that Azek is a better product than wood. Nevertheless, he understands that this commission will not approve Azek products and he plans to use pressure treated wood and painted white. He explained that he will prime and paint the wood before putting the fence together then repaint after the fence is built. Beverley said she thinks the commission should review the Azek policy in the future but at this point cannot the commission cannot accept Azek so painted pressure treated, painted wood will be accepted. Motion to approve was made by James Cisek. 2<sup>nd</sup> Beverly Fearey. The application was unanimously approved.

**5:00 20 S. Summer Street (20D-132)** Bruce & Carol Lattman/Doug Best-agent. Applicant proposes 2 changes to a previously approved plan: Change in window style and placement and relocating an exterior staircase. Doug Best and Bruce Lattman made a proposal to the commission for the changes noting that Carol Lattman does not think the light from the approved windows, is not good for retail as too much light fades clothing. They proposed to change from the approved windows to fixed transom windows. Mr. Best said that from the parking lot, the windows look similar. There was discussion about the new wall and existing windows. Mr. Best showed picture examples of a neighboring property with similar window and described Marvin, all wood, windows. Carole Berger and Eddie Blake said that they do not like the style of the proposed, divided light, window as it is not in keeping with the rest of the building. There was discussion about the privet hedge, as described by Mr. Best and Beverly Fearey noted that shrubbery is not a consideration in approving changes to a building. There was much discussion about the proposed windows noting that none of the other windows are divided light. Beverly noted it is clear that no one on the commission is wild about the new plan. It was decided by all parties to continue the window

design to the meeting on 3/17/12, when Mr. Best will propose a couple of variations.

Mr. Best then described his plan for relocation of the stair case from the edge of the building as approved, to the center of that side of the building. He provided a drawing for review by the commission. Mr. Lattman feels the change of location will avoid any possible conflict with neighbors. A motion to approve was made by Ms. Fearey, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Ms. Berger, unanimous approval.

- 6. Minutes** – Approval of minutes from meeting on 3/20/12. Motion to approve James Cisek, 2<sup>nd</sup> Carole Berger. The vote to approve was unanimous.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:28.

Respectfully submitted,

Bricque Garber, Assistant

---

James Cisek, Chairman

date