

Edgartown Historic District Commission
Minutes
March 20, 2012

Commissioners present: Carole Berger, James Cisek, Bill Bishop, Edith Blake, Beverly Fearey & Mary Sullivan Staff: Bricque Garber

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Cisek at 4:00 pm.

1. 4:00 117 N. Water St., (19B-5.2) Continued from Public Hearing 3/7/12

Edgartown Lighthouse Nominee Trust, Townsend Morey Jr., Trustee/Patrick Ahearn-agent. Applicant proposes construction of a new 864 sq. ft. boat house on grade. Mr. Cisek noted that the project needs to be heard by the Conservation Commission but not the Zoning Board of Appeals. Mr. Ahearn passed out new plans, further reducing the size of the building to 778 square feet. Mr. Ahearn explained that he is here to talk about the historic merit of the proposed boat house, citing that it is consistent with other buildings in the HDC. He described most of primary structures on North Water as having auxiliary structures and that many neighbors objecting to this boat house, are people who don't want this property to have what they have. Mr. Ahearn said he is 'on the record' noting that the concerns of others are inconsistent with the neighborhood properties. Mr. Ahearn said he looked closely at scale and character of other auxiliary houses in the area and came up with a scale that would work well to maintain the character but at the last HDC meeting, he decided to further reduce the size of the building noting that the neighbor's guest house is larger and that this structure, from a historical point of view, is consistent with the harbor experience and neighboring structures. He noted that the pitch is consistent with roof pitch on main house. He further stated that the materials to be used are consistent with materials used on other buildings in the Historic District.

Mr. Ahearn said he does not think we are here to debate the use. Mr. Morey added this building will be used for generational use and that he is an avid fisherman. He said that he intends to use the boat house for storing his many fishing rods and accessories. Paul Brewer asked if and how boats are going to get into the building. The commission explained that it is not our purview to discuss the interior of the building. Paul Brewer asked if they can put whatever they want inside, including beds? Bill Bishop said that if use becomes an issue, in the future, he could bring it up to Lenny Jason the building inspector. Mary Sullivan told Mr. Brewer that the HDC purview is exterior only. Steve Saxonis asked about utilities to the boat house. Mary Sullivan explained again, that "all we do is the outside." Three new letters were read by the assistant, two opposed and one in support of the application. Mr. Cisek asked if there were any more comments from the public in attendance and there being none the public hearing was closed.

Bill Bishop asked if grade was the same. Mr. Ahearn answered yes and the building is located behind the neighbor's guest house. Mr. Ahearn noted that most of neighborhood

guest houses are further forward on the lot. James Cisek said that he approves of the change in plan to make the building somewhat smaller. Mr. Cisek said that the Conservation Commission will be ultimate decider. Bill Bishop asked if Mr. Ahearn had checked with the building inspector and determined that this application does not have to go to ZBA, and was told, by Mr. Ahearn, that it does not as it is a boat house and not a habitable dwelling. Mr. Bishop noted that this plan does “fit in” with other buildings in the area. Mr. Bishop asked Mr. Morey, “for the record” is this really going to be a boat house? Mr. Morey described his fishing interest and noted there will be a changing room but he plans to sleep on his boat. Mr. Bishop pressed for a yes or no answer and was told **yes**, it is a boat house only and no one will sleep there. Ms. Fearey made the motion to approve. Carole Berger provided the 2nd the vote to approve was unanimous.

- 2. 4:15 34 S. Summer St./Gazette Bldg. (20D-136)** MV Preservation Trust. Bob Avakian, agent. Continued from 3/7/12. Applicant was asked to provide plan for the addition of a fence & landscaping around the approved emergency generator & to provide window specifications for proposed replacement windows. Meg O’Connor presented the plan for the fence saying they would like to let the fence be natural wood to weather, and provided pictures of a similar fence. Mary Sullivan said it looks nice noting that the hedge alone would need more time for growing. Mary Sullivan made a motion to approve as drawn with the taper. 2nd James Cisek. Unanimously approved with no change in the roof. Window specifications were provided and approved.
- 3. 4:30 11 North Water St. (20D-313)** Island Food Realty LLC. Jonathan Koerner, agent. Applicant proposes to reconfigure front entrance, replace existing awning and add a new awning. Jonathan presented plans to commission for review. He noted that the front is currently pretty ugly, with Wal-Mart door and windows from the 70’s. Mr. Koerner’s plan is to bring it “back” and make the building more accessible and functional. There was discussion about awnings and windows, noting concerns about windows opening out, versus opening toward the inside the building.

James Cisek said that he thinks that there are enough changes to the building to move the application to public hearing on April 17th. There was discussion regarding doors opening in rather than out as regards any safety issues. There was further discussion about windows and doors including stacking windows. Mr. Koerner said that they will further examine the windows plans, and will make change to the HDC application and initial the changes. Bill Bishop asked for trim detail when they return on April 17th. Mary Sullivan asked the applicant to try to anticipate commission questions for the next hearing and bringing sample of the awning material. Mr. Bishop asked the applicant to look at corner boards and make them wider. Ms. Sullivan moved to send the application to public hearing. 2nd Bill Bishop. The commission voted to move the application to a public hearing.

- 4. 4:45 43 Main St. (20D-208)** Hall/Seagate. Paul Maggi, agent. Applicant proposes to paint, change awning and add new sign. Mr. Maggi explained that his goal is to dress up the existing store front of Old Scrimshaw gallery. He is doing the work for J McLaughlin, a clothing store. He told the commission the sign will be printed on the dark blue awning, and provided a picture and fabric sample. He said that the awning

will be a simple retractable awing. The front door is currently green and will be replaced with a new green door. There will be wood planters painted dark green. Eddie Blake questioned why they are going to cover wood paneling with planters. Ms. Fearey said that many others have planters and she does not see a problem with the planters. The motion to approve was made by Mr. Bishop, 2nd Mary Sullivan. Unanimously approved

- 5. **5:00 29 Church St./Visitor's Center (20D-115) Town** of Edgartown. Applicant proposes addition of a spiral staircase to rear of the building that will not be seen from a public way. A letter was presented from MVTa saying that the building inspector has determined that egress is needed from the 2nd floor of this building. Discussion ensued noting that a spiral staircase is not typical, nor historic. Although it is not visible from a public way, Bill Bishop suggested that they look at the project and see if there is another alternative for this staircase. The commission voted to continue this application to the meeting on April 3rd.

Minutes –Minutes from meeting on 3/7/12 were approved.
The meeting was adjourned @ 5:00PM

Respectfully submitted,
Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ date _____
James Cisek, Chairman