

# Edgartown Historic District Commission

## Minutes

March 7, 2012

Commissioners in attendance: James Cisek, Chairman, Bill Bishop, Robbie Hutchison  
Carole Berger & Mary Sullivan

Staff: Bricque Garber

The meeting was called to order by Chairman, James Cisek @ 4:04 PM

- 1. Public Hearing 117 North Water St. (19B-5.2)** Edgartown Lighthouse Nominee Trust, Townsend Morey Jr., Trustee/Patrick Ahearn, Agent. Mr. Ahearn for the applicant passed out drawings of the proposed boat house to be built at the rear of the property and described that this building is in keeping with a similar building at 115 N. Water, noting that this will be a slightly smaller building than the Gendell's building and that the height and roof pitch match the Gendell's building at 115 N. Water. Mr. Ahearn said that the pitch is also consistent with roof pitches on the main house. He described that the foundation will be brick veneer matching the main house and that the building meets the zoning requirements. Mr. Cisek asked if the proposed boat house is in the flood plain, Mr. Ahearn said he believes it exempt as it is a non-habitable building. Paul Brewer Concerned about the break-up of so many rooms wand asked why it is not one room. Mr. Ahearn said that there are divisions for storage purposes. Mr. Reed Silva delivered letter to be read, the assistant read the letter to the commission as well as other letters and e-mails from abutters and neighbors. Mrs. Joan Norton voiced objection to the project. The public meeting was closed. Robbie Hutchison addressed public view concerns. James Cisek said that the plan looks better than was originally presented but is still concerned about the size of the building. Bill Bishop asked if this application has to go before the conservation commission. Mr. Ahearn said the zoning requirements are met for a boat house and he believes that this building is exempt from Con-Com but will check. Mr. Ahearn addressed open space concerns from the commission, including lawn and beach grass, saying that this building is set further away from the harbor than the neighboring guest house. Bill Bishop pointed out that the drawings show a design layout that looks more like a cottage than boat house. Bill Bishop noted that the objections of the neighbors must be considered. Carole Berger said the plan looks like a habitable structure and noted that the letters from neighbors question the use of the building as a cottage versus a boat house. Mary Sullivan noted that, usually Zoning Board of Appeals hears applications first, but Mr. Ahearn said that this project is exempt from ZBA. Mr. Silva said that he believes it should not be exempt from ZBA approval. Bill Bishop made a motion to continue the application in order to gain some more information

regarding Con-Com and ZBA. Mr. Ahearn said they could make the building smaller to provide more side yard setbacks and said the building could be 6 foot shorter and 4 feet narrower. Mr. Ahearn can provide a smaller version of the building at the next building. MS. Hutchison provided a 2<sup>nd</sup> to continue the application until 3/20. The vote was unanimous. The application is continued to 3/20/12

2. **Public Hearing – 31 S. Water St. (20D-326.1)** Colonial Reproductions, Norman Rankow. Mr. Ahearn agent for Mr. Rankow described the project saying that they looking to remove 2 sheds and build an open air cabana next to the existing swimming pool. He noted changes from the plans presented after conversations with abutters noting that they will now lower the ridge height from the current plan and change the fireplace to be gas, rather than wood to avoid smoke moving toward abutters. Mr. Ahearn said that the sheds were built in the 70's and are not historic. Louise Oliver, abutter said that she came to the meeting from Washington DC with concerns including, height of the structure, smoke from the fireplace, setbacks, easements and restrictions. After discussion with Mr. Ahearn, Mr. Ahearn has agreed to make changes that address her concerns, including moving the sewage pipes and pump. Ms. Oliver said she is satisfied with the agreement reached, regarding the changes to the plans and changes to the project to allow for access from her property, consistent with the existing easement. Mr. Cisek noted it is good to hear that the neighbors have worked together to resolve concerns. Ms. Oliver said that she still has some concerns about the ridge height, pitch & size of the cabana but on the basis of the agreements reached, with Mr. Ahearn, will not voice objection to the project. Mr. Ahearn said that the roof pitches are consistent with existing structures. There was some discussion about the roof height and Ms. Oliver urged that the roof be as low as possible. The public hearing was closed. Mr. Cisek asked about chimney materials and was told it will be brick. Mr. Ahearn was questioned about the new location of the pool equipment after the shed; currently housing the equipment is removed. Mr. Ahearn said that the equipment will be in the same area but does not need to be inside a structure and will screened with shrubbery noting that the new equipment is much smaller and quieter than older equipment. Bill Bishop asked for the height of the cabana. Mr. Ahearn said that the height of cabana will be changed from the planned 12'6" to 11'10". Bill Bishop made a motion to approve the plan conditioned upon a change in the roof height and the change of fireplace to be gas. The 2<sup>nd</sup> was made by Robbie Hutchison. Approved 5-0.
3. **34 S. Summer Street/Gazette Bldg. (20D-136)** MV Preservation Trust, Bob Avakian, Agent. Meg O'Conner presented drawings for the project, saying that

the addition is failing; the doors and windows are rotted. She noted there will be a slight change of roof pitch that would impact one window. She was asked if there will be new shingles and answered, yes. (see application) She was asked by Mr. Bishop for the manufacturer of the windows and answered that they will, most likely be Anderson windows with one set of French doors in center, and the other windows fixed. Pictures provided show the generator on the west wall with a privet hedge, planted last year. Meg noted that the picture was "Photo-shopped" to show the generator in place on the wall facing the back yard of the Residence House. She provided letter from Generator Company describing the generator. There is not currently a fence, around the generator, in the plan but they are willing to put one up if the board desires. Mary Sullivan said that the commission would like to see the exact window specifications showing factory installed grills. Robbie Hutchison said she likes the plan for the addition. James Cisek, asked for screening and/or fencing around the generator and those specifications for the windows be brought to the next meeting. Robbie Hutchison made the motion to approve the construction of the Davis Lane side of the building. James Cisek provided the 2<sup>nd</sup> followed by unanimous approval conditioned on fencing and window specifications. Meg O'Connor said she will bring drawings for fencing and window specs to the next meeting on 3/20/12.

4. **59 School Street (20D-143 & 146)** MV Historical Society/ MV Museum. Na Nancy Col showed the site of a proposed, 20x30 tent on an aerial photo. The temporary tent will be used for 7 weeks for summer programs. Ms. Col noted that only part of the temporary tent will be in the Historic District. She described a white canvas tent with clear roll up sides. Mr. Bishop wanted it be clear that this will be a one-time deal and any other proposed tents will need to come back before the commission. Motion to approve, Carole Berger. 2<sup>nd</sup> Bill Bishop. Approved 5-0

5. **85 North Water St. (20D-284)** Broker MA trust/ Dudley Cannada, agent. Mr. Cannada passed out drawings and photographs for the commission to review. Describing the house as a conventional 4 bedroom home with aluminum siding and a slate roof which is in very poor condition. Mr. Cannada proposes to replace the existing slate roof with a replicated slate roof. He brought a sample of the simulated slate which is made from recycled car tires. He noted that the simulated slate has a 50 year warranty. The principle addition to the house will be 3 dormers, one on north water and 2 between the existing gables. Some window sills will be lowered on the 1<sup>st</sup> floor and nothing will be changed on the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor. Three windows will be replaced in the upper gables. Mr. Cannada said that the existing house has aluminum siding and the owner wants to retain the

siding. James Cisek noted that this house has one of the last slate roofs in town. Mr. Cannada talked about the problems with trying to repair slate roofs and said that the new roof will be replicated in color to make it very true to the existing slate. Bill Bishop asked if the side of dormer will be wood. Mr. Cannada said, yes, it will be wood and painted to look like the aluminum siding, which is no longer available. Carole Berger said that the current siding is chalky looking. Mr. Cannada agreed that the siding should be painted. Mr. Cisek made a recommendation that the application be sent to a public hearing. Carole Berger made a motion for a public hearing on this application. Mr. Bishop provided the 2<sup>nd</sup>. The vote was unanimous.

6. **6 S. Water St. (20D-188)** Eugene Courtney. Patrick Courtney proposed 3 modifications to the approved plan, including the size of the ground floor windows from 8 feet wide to 5 feet wide, a change in manufacturer of windows from Harvy to Anderson, and the extension of the lower awning style, copper roof to wrap around the edge and down the, parking lot, side of the building. Robbie Hutchison made a motion to approve. Mary Sullivan provided the 2<sup>nd</sup>. Approved 5-0

**Minutes:** The minutes from the 2/7/12/ Meeting were approved.  
The meeting was adjourned 5:18 PM

Respectfully submitted,  
Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ date \_\_\_\_\_  
James Cisek, Chairman