

# Historic District Commission

Minutes 1.17.2012

In attendance: James Cisek, Chairman, Bill Bishop, Mary Sullivan, Robbie Hutchison & Edith Blake

Staff: Bricque Garber

Called to order by Chairman Cisek @ 4:00 PM

**Public Hearing. 117 No Water St. Edgartown Lighthouse Nominee Trust, Townsend Morey Jr., Trustee:** Proposed construction of a new 806 sq. ft. guesthouse. 19B-5.2Mr. Cisek read the Public Hearing Notice. Patrick Ahearn, Arch presented plans for the applicant. The site plan was drawn by Schofield, Barbini and Hoehn, Inc. The building plan was prepared by a Patrick Ahearn, Architect. Townsend Morey III was in attendance. Mr. Ahearn explained that this guest house must be lifted on brick piers creating an overall height 20' 6" at the ridge and a side wall height 16 feet, saying that the 16 feet side wall height is not dissimilar to Glendell's cottage next door. He further explained that this proposed cottage has been pulled back on the lot in an effort to avoid impact on Glendell's cottage and that the Glendells are in support of this construction and have provided a letter of support. Neighbor, Tom Taylor, had provided a letter of support, too. Mr. Ahearn explained that the materials used are similar those used on neighboring properties. Steven Saxonis is the property manager for John Connors of 111 & 119 N. Water. Mr. Saxonis explained that Mr. Connor's view will be affected by the proposed structure. Reid Silva of Vineyard Land Survey, explained that he was asked by Mr. Connors to attend this meeting and asked to deliver a letter. Mr. Paul Brewer stated that he believes this construction is a poor idea and creates a bad precedent as looking under buildings is not attractive and he feels that this is not a good precedent to set in this area. Letters in support from Martha Gendell of 115 N. Water St. and Thomas M. Taylor of 63 Fuller St., were read to the commission. A letter of objection from Abutters, Carolyn Connors & John Connors of 119 N. Water St., Sheila Connors of 111 N. Water Street & North Water Street Neighbors: Hope Whipple #114, Lorna Garron, #72, Linda & Bob Forrester #128, Drew and Kim Conway #67, Mr. & Mrs. Peter Lawson Johnston #118, Elizabeth Hayman #109, S. Bailey & Joan Norton #90 and Larry and Linda Smith, was read to the commission by the assistant. Mary Sullivan asked if, since it is a very low site, it is possible that the structure be built lower or on the ground? Mr. Ahern answered that this is the required minimum height and added that virtually every house that is existing in the area could not be built today as it is a state requirement that that determines the elevation. He further said that it is not an architectural choice but this height is now required. He gave several examples of existing cottages. Mary Sullivan noted that if this is determined to be suitable for the lot then the commission decision regards only the design. Mr. Cisek noted that this lot is 50 sq. ft. too small for this type of construction and that this application would need to go to the ZBA. Mr. Ahern believes it should go to HDC first. Bill Bishop said that he understand why it has to be this high but does not think this fits with any of the cottages in the area and believes that the letters should be considered as there are several people in the area that are not in favor of this. Mr. Bishop agrees that this will set a precedent. Robbie Hutchison expressed that she likes the upper living space design but not the lower half and was uncertain how the lower half could be improved given the flood requirements. Mr. Ahearn asked, if the applicant returned with a plan for a building that sits on the ground, not used as habitable space but only boat house, if that would be more acceptable to the commission and satisfy the concerns of the abutters. He was advised that he could certainly withdraw the plan and submit a new plan. Mr. Ahearn said that rather than risk a rejection, perhaps he should withdrawn application and come back with something that

may be more acceptable. After some discussion with his client, Mr. Ahearn said he would like to withdraw application. The application was withdrawn.

**86 North Water Street –Palmer. Replace a 6 x 4.6 kitchen window with a 6.8 x5.6 door. Agent Terrance Donahue.** Mr. Donahue is the agent for this project. The commission accepts that the window is not visible from the public way and therefore he can go forward with the replacement of the window with the described door. Mr. Donahue discussed the replacement of roof with red cedar shingles and noted the windows and trim detail will not be changed. Mr. Donahue is anticipating that there may be some additional repair needed but will not know for sure until he begins the roof replacement. Mr. Donahue noted his understanding that if further changes are needed he will return to this commission. A motion to approve the roof replacement was made by Mr. Bishop, 2<sup>nd</sup> provided by Ms. Hutchison. The vote to approve was unanimous.

**Public Hearing – 20 S. Summer St., Carol Latman. Extensive alterations to a mixed use building. Proposing to build a mansard roof over a center deck, enclose breezeway and change picture window to bay windows to match the front of the building. Agent: Doug Best.** Mr. Cisek read the Public Hearing Notice. Doug Best, General Contractor, provided drawings to the members, showing what is existing and what is proposed. Mr. Best noted that they are attempting to renovate and the mansard roof will wrap the primary 2<sup>nd</sup> story. No change will be made to the footprint. He noted that the height falls within maximum height requirement and said further that the majority of work will be internal. The bay windows will replace current windows to bring these windows conformance with existing windows. Bill Bishop said that the view from parking lot will be vastly improved and he likes the view from the front. He suggested that they might consider facets to the bottom of the windows to match the faceted front windows. Robbie Hutchison asked is there is still room for the shrubs. Mr. Best answered, yes. Mr. Cisek asked for the brand of the windows and Mr. Best said they are Anderson windows. Discussion ensued as the members reviewed the plans. Edith Blake said she would like to see the roof lowered. Mr. Best said that would be structurally problematic and if lowered it would not line up with existing roof line. Mary Sullivan said she likes the roof line. Robbie Hutchison said that she likes the view from Parking Lot and likes roof line as drawn. Mr. Best noted that there would be an interior room (headroom) problem if the roofline was brought down. Bill Bishop asked if anyone has an opinion on the bay windows. Ms. Hutchison said she likes the bay windows. As there was no further comment, Bill Bishop made a motion to accept plan as proposed. A 2<sup>nd</sup> was provided by Mary Sullivan, the vote to approve was unanimous.

**Public Hearing – 6 South Water St. Eugene Courtney. Demolish and Rebuild a mixed use building.** Mr. Cisek read two Public Hearing notices regarding this property, one for demolition and one for a rebuild. The demolition hearing had been continued due to lack of a quorum on 1/3/2012. Letter from Civil Engineer, Kent Healy was read by Mr. Cisek. Further Mr. Cisek noted information provided by Jean Hathaway regarding the history of the building. It was noted that Ms. Hutchison and Mr. Cisek did conduct a site visit and found the concrete blocks to be in poor condition. Mr. Cisek stated his opinion that the building is not architecturally significant nor is it historically significant. Bill Bishop agrees the property is in poor condition and has no historical value and thinks it should be taken down. Robbie Hutchison agrees the building is in very poor shape. There was no public comment. Motion to

allow demolition was made by Ms. Hutchison, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Bishop and voted unanimously to approve.

The Presentation for the rebuild was made by Patrick Courtney. Plans were provided to the commission for review. Edith Blake asked why the front has a jog and is not flat, Mr. Courtney answered that the small jog is to allow for walkway. Mr. Courtney said that the primary change from the existing building is that 8' will be added to allow for stairwell. There was discussion about the rooflines and the pitch. The windows were discussed. It was suggested that pictures of the windows would be helpful to the commission. Mr. Eugene Courtney showed the commission a sample of the shingles and brought a sample window by Harvey. Steven Cleary, of the Victorian Inn, an abutter, voiced concerns about the screening of the kitchen, concern about the need for a wheelchair ramp, and has questions regarding the kitchen venting. Patrick Courtney said that the venting will not be visible from a public way. He said that there will be residence above the commercial kitchen on the first floor. Bill Bishop said that if there are any changes that will affect the current plan, such as a need to add a ramp those changes will need to be brought back to the commission. Mr. Cisek asked for more detail from the architect specifically detail at the area of the gutters, rakes and windows. Mr. Bishop requested that the plans show dimension and size of the details. There was discussion about the shutter color. It was decided that the shutter color will be Edgartown Green. Ms. Sullivan noted that there several outstanding questions, including: ramp information, vent, trim and window detail, gutter material, door specifics including the type of door, shutter description and color, size and location of all of the windows, dimensions for window trims, corner boards & rakes. It was requested, by the commission that these details be addressed by the applicant at the next meeting on 2/7/2012. It was further requested that the height of building be shown on the elevation. The application was continued to Feb. 7, 2012.

**71 Main Street – 71 Main Street Association LLC (Alchemy Restaurant)** Replace window in 2<sup>nd</sup> floor lounge area. Replacing a 120"x64" window with same size material and color window. Agent: Peter Marzbainian provided pictures and window specifications and described the window. He asked if he can replace existing trim with Flat Stock trim. Mr. Bishop told him yes, the commission prefers Flat Stock trim but no Azek trim. Mary Sullivan made a motion to approve the window replacement, Mr. Cisek provided a 2<sup>nd</sup>. The vote to approve was unanimous.

**Minutes:** Minutes from meeting on 12/20/11 were approved without amendment

The meeting was adjourned 5:28 PM

Respectfully Submitted:

Bricque Garber  
Assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ date \_\_\_\_\_  
James Cisek, Chairman