



**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158  
70 Main Street  
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: [www.edgartown-ma.us](http://www.edgartown-ma.us)  
email: [bgarber@edgartown-ma.us](mailto:bgarber@edgartown-ma.us)

## **Edgartown Historic District Commission**

**~MINUTES~**

**November 5, 2013**

Commissioners present: James Cisek, Chairman, Carole Berger, Beverly Fearey, Robbie Hutchison, Bill Bishop, Edith Blake & David Thompson. Staff: Bricque Garber

Chairman Cisek brought the meeting to order at 4:00.

### **1.– CPC Applications.**

Kristy Rose gave the Commissioners an overview of the reasons for the applicants to come to the HDC. The duty of the HDC is to determine if the applications are of the historical significance. Kristy explained that the cost of the project is not at issue for this body but rather if the HDC views the project to be historically significant to Edgartown.

- Cemetery Commission, Preservation of Gravestones – Liz Villard. Asking for funds to bring expert into local cemeteries to find out what needs to be done to preserve and repair gravestones. - *Voted as historically significant to the Town of Edgartown.*
- Fireman's Association, 1855 Hand Tub (pump Truck) - Andy Kelly spoke in conjunction with Museum looking for funds for restoration of Hand Tub. Found someone to do the work in main to repair rotted bottom. - *Voted as historically significant to the Town of Edgartown.*
- Town of Aquinnah, Moving the Lighthouse – Richard Skidmore. Mitsy Pratt. All town CPCs are being asked for support as the Gay Head lighthouse as an island resource. Light house was significant from 1799 for all ships coming to the island, and brought people to the entire island as tourist as well as early whaling. The light was key to the early industry in Edgartown town. Part of the fabric of the island. Gay head light has been used to advertise a shared past for all islanders. – *Voted as historically significant to the Town of Edgartown.*
- Edgartown Town Hall – Restoration & display of the Enid Yandell Plaster Relief – Kristy Rose told the HDC that the plaster relief was rescued from the Edgartown School. Enid Yandell was an island artist. The plan is to restore and frame the object

and hang it in Town Hall. - *Voted as historically significant to the Town of Edgartown.*

- MV Agricultural Society - Preservation of Records – Susan Klein. Susan Klein told the commissioners that the MV Agricultural Society has books that are very brittle. They want to take the old premium books, treasurer, inspector & secretary reports, and photographs from 1855 to scan and preserve. She showed a few examples from 1896. The existing records are savable but need to be preserved and digitized. - *Voted as historically significant to the Town of Edgartown.*
- MV Museum – Whaling Log Books – Bonnie Stacy. Whaling log books. Request for conservation. Want to preserve and digitize the materials. 5 books Captains' and Log Keepers books are connected directly to Edgartown - *Voted as historically significant to the Town of Edgartown.*
- MV Museum – Marine Hospital Roof & Chimneys – Dan Waters. Restorations and rehabilitation to the slate roofs in Vineyard Haven. Marine Hospital in VH is the outgrowth of the public hospital for mariners. Funded by a tax of mariners. Hospital in good shape but for the roofs. Hospital was for seamen and locals and had the Island's first x-ray machine. Asking for a small portion of the cost of rehabilitation of the hospital. *After discussion Ms. Fearey made the motion to deny as not historically significant to Edgartown. Bill Bishop – 2<sup>nd</sup> Denied.*

**22 Winter St. ( 20D-214.1)** Laura Scheuer. Fred Walters/agent. Applicant proposes to construct a 2 story, 3 unit, building. Continued from 10/22/2013. The members of the Commission had a site visit today, where the perimeters of the buildings and the height of the buildings were displayed. Site inspection was completed prior to the meeting. Here to answer questions. Bill noted the property was staked as to the ground size and locations of the proposed buildings. Carole Berger noted her reservations with the mass of the project and the designed height of the buildings, noting the buildings that are very tall. And, that they are 1/3 taller than they are wide. The members agreed the height of the 3 story buildings seems too tall and the mass of the 3 buildings too much. It is noted that this is a residential intervention in a business area. Beverly Fearey noted that the buildings in the Canada (spelling corrected to Cannada) project (referenced by Mr. Walters) are different in character and are considerably smaller. Bill Bishop said that it looks like too much building on too little space. And, since this is the first time members are able to actually see the size of the buildings as staked, he finds the buildings to be over large without much green space left. It was noted that the front view of the project will be impacted by the many cars in front of the building. Carole Berger told the applicant that the HDC cannot redesign the project but find it very large and expressed a hope that the applicant might consider reducing the size and scale of the buildings. Ms. Berger further noted that the next meeting, is the public hearing, and as the views of the board are known, perhaps the applicant may want to reconsider proposed plan. *Continued to the Public Hearing 11.19.13*

**75 S. Water St. (20D-336)** Federated Church. Herb Ward/agent. Applicant proposes to remove shed- not to be rebuilt **and** remove privacy fence - not to be rebuilt. Shed and fence

were built in 1979-1988 and are not historically significant. Want to remove both fence and do some landscaping. Motion to approve as presented Beverly Fearey. 2<sup>nd</sup> – Carole Berger. Approved.

**46 S. Summer St. (20D-177)** Meetinghouse @ Federated Church. Herb Ward/agent. Applicant proposes to install a pole in parking area to protect corner of building. (work completed). Applicant proposes addition of parking signs in lot. Mr. Ward told the commission that the bumper pole, painted yellow, was put there to stop cars from hitting the edge of the meeting house. The yellow color was chosen for ‘caution’ and is easy to see. He showed pictures of neighbor’s fence with caution signs and described recent damage to the neighbor’s fence from cars backing into the fence. After discussion, the parking signs will be taken to the sign committee for approval. The post is approx. 5 ft tall. After discussion it was suggested to continue this application to allow applicant to explore possible alternate solutions for the corner post. Motion to continue, Carole Berger, 2<sup>nd</sup> – Bill Bishop. Approved.

**29 Simpson’s Lane (20D-224)** Donna & Frank McPartland. Seamus Mullen/agent. Applicant proposes to replace fence in kind. Wood painted white. Seamus appeared to discuss the replacement of the fence with exactly the same fence. Wood to be painted to be exactly the same. Motion to approve as presented, Bill Bishop. 2<sup>nd</sup> - Robbie Hutchison. Approved.

**29 Main Street (20D-204) Stephen Berger.** Bill Bishop/Martin Berger -Agent. Mr. Bishop is involved in the project and has recused himself from hearing this application. Applicant proposes to replace roof, replace cedar sidewall shingles and replace front window and trim. Carole Berger was recused from the hearing. Martin Berger presented the plan as maintenance issues with the house. Roof is to be replaced in kind, same color, architectural asphalt. Replace wall shingles, in kind, cedar allowed to weather on the left and rear walls. Replacement window to be 4” larger than existing to will allow more light. Window - Andersen 9 over 9, SDL with factory applied grills. No wall detail will be disturbed. Overhang/lead trim to be removed and replaced with shingles. All trim wood painted white. Robbie Hutchison made the motion to approve as presented with new window as long as it does not interfere with the pattern of the decorative shingles. 2<sup>nd</sup> – David Thompson. Approved.

**105 Main Street (20D-65)** Daniel Santangelo. (Change to an approved plan). Applicant proposes the addition of Solar Panels. Mr. Santangelo showed drawing which will be hardly seen from the street on the Garage shed dormer. James Cisek asked for the panel to be put on the roof so it can be seen in a site visit by the commissioners. It was explained that this was the process used in a previous approval for the installation of solar panels. Motion to continue so the commissioners can see a panel on the dormer to determine look from a public way Bill Bishop, 2<sup>nd</sup> Carole Berger. Approved.

**105 Main Street (20D-65)** Daniel Santangelo. (Change to an Approved plan). Applicant proposes to change material used for fascias and soffits to a composite material, i.e. PVC. (work completed). Mr. Quale, Architect for the applicant explained that his planned trim was intended to be PVC but acknowledged the error on the application as a miscommunication

between himself, Mr. Santangelo and the HDC and asked the commission to allow Mr. Santangelo to leave the PVC as installed and continued the project with wood. Chairman Cisek told him that there was no miscommunication with this board as application 'called out' wood trim. There was no composite trim material on the application or the plan that was approved by the HDC. Further, this body would not have approved PVC trim for this project. Mr. Quale defended the composite product. Bill Bishop explained that this would not be consistent with the past HDC rulings and would not be fair to other applicants who have had to remove Azek, applied without HDC approval. Mr. Bishop said the approval of this application would not be proper given past rulings. Mr. Bishop further stated that these materials are not in keeping with the surrounding historic homes. Edith Blake concurred with Mr. Bishop. Carole Berger noted that the composite material is inconsistent with the construction in the Historic District and the material is not compatible with the materials used on the main house of which this is an auxiliary building. Carol Berger made a motion to deny the application. 2<sup>nd</sup> - David Thompson. The vote on the motion to deny the application was unanimous. The applicant was told that he may appeal the decision.

After Mr. Santangelo and Mr. Quale left the meeting, there was a discussion about the windows and dormer on the pool house. The building inspector had advised that the windows are not Andersen. The dormer on the pool house had been removed from the plan as a condition of the approval. The assistant was advised to send violation letters for the windows and dormer.

### ***New/Old Business:***

*Alternate position on Commission – Bricque told the Commissioners that we now have 2 applications for the position of alternate on the HDC. The commissioners would like each of the applicants to come to a meeting in December so the commissioners can meet & talk with them.*

*Minutes 11.22.13 Motion to approve the minutes, Edith Blake. 2<sup>nd</sup> Robbie Hutchison. Approved.*

Meeting adjourned. 6:05

Respectfully submitted,

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved \_\_\_\_\_ 11.19.13  
James Cisek, Chairman