



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: bgarber@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission

~Minutes~

July 16, 2013

Commissioners in attendance: James Cisek-Chairman, Carole Berger, David Thompson, Edith Blake, Bill Bishop, Robbie Hutchison & Beverly Fearey. Staff: Bricque Garber.

Chairman Cisek called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM.

Public Hearing –101 S. Water St. (20D-19) Michael & Bernadine Caruso. Patrick Ahearn-Agent. Applicant proposes a new foundation to existing house, addition of a new wing & porch, and construction of a new carriage house and fence. There was a site visit just before the meeting. Chairman Cisek read the Public Hearing Notice. There was a site visit prior to the meeting. Mr. Ahearn presented his plans for the project. Robbie Hutchison recused herself from the hearing as she is involved with the project. Patrick Ahearn made his presentation of the plans noting that this involves a restoration of the original home which was moved to this site in 1955. He told the commission and attendees that the cinderblock foundation has failed and they are proposing to lift the house and put it back on a new foundation. The façade will be a pure restoration of the existing house. The dormers are maintained and replicated in the new carriage house. The parking court will be brick and there will be a brick sidewalk. There is a landscape plan to be submitted to the Conservation Commission including a plan to remove the invasive plants. The pool area will be screened from public view. Natural shingles on the addition will weather to grey. At the last meeting there was a suggestion to add dormers to the addition. Mr. Ahearn brought a drawing showing 2 dormers on the front and 2 on the back side noting that they would be jr. versions of the dormers on the house. The owners are happy to add the dormers to the plan but the plan without dormers is fine, as well. Three letters of support, from abutters, were read to the commission. Frederica Carpenter, an abutter voiced her concerns regarding the size and scope of the project and interruption of harbor views and loss of the natural look from the street. She has concerns about the wetlands and was told that landscaping and the wetlands will be addressed by the Conservation Commission. Peter Braun, abutter, said that his concerns were essentially the same as those expressed by Ms. Carpenter. The addition of such a large addition and the impact on the view. He asked if the additional space might be obtained by an addition to the rear of the building? Jane Zimmerman, abutter, has concerns about the wetlands over growth and the pond. She was told that these issues will be addressed by the Con Com. Chairman Cisek asked if there was any further public comment. There being none the public hearing was closed. David Thompson said that he thinks the dormers seem break up the long blank roof line of the addition. Bill Bishop asked the height of the building after it is raised 20 inches to accommodate the new foundation? Patrick told him the height is 24 feet for house, 21 ft. to the ridge of the addition, and the carriage house 23 ft. from the new finished grade. The new grade is approx 21 inches above the sidewalk. Patrick

said they may build a small brick curb with the fence above. Bill Bishop would like to see the height of the buildings marked for a visual and the foot print of the addition and the carriage house staked on the ground. Patrick noted that the wing is 41 ft. from the sidewalk, the wing set back is 22 ft from the front of the house and is 3 ft. lower than the main house and the carriage house is set back 14 ft. from the street. Carole Berger noted that it is nice that the size of property affords these generous setbacks. Bill noted that there are no measurements on the plans and requested a set of plans with the building measurements. Patrick was asked to stake the buildings on the ground and 'mark-up' the height of the wing addition before the next meeting on August 6th. The issue of the dormers, on the addition, was discussed with the commissioners being split on their view of the dormers. The dormers will be further discussed at the next meeting. There will be a site visit prior to the meeting on August 6, 2013. Bill Bishop made a motion to continue this application until the next meeting. 2nd - Beverly Fearey, Unanimously approved. A site visit will be held prior to the meeting.

44 Main St. (20D-196) *(Continued from 6.2.13)* New Moon Property LLC.

Edgartown Books-Behind the Bookstore. Susan Mercier/Pam Scott- Agents. Applicant proposes addition of sail cloth awnings over outdoor eating area for the 2013 Season. There was a site visit before the meeting. Robbie Hutchison recused herself from the hearing as she is involved with the project. Pam Scott presented the application and asked if this application should be for a Certificate of Appropriateness or non-applicability. It was explained that any addition to a historic structure or any tent (not attached) that can be seen from a public way comes to the HDC for a Certificate of Appropriateness. This applies to seasonal tents. Bill Bishop noted that this sail has not been tested by strong wind, or tropical storms. He asked if there was someone who can take the sail down if strong winds are predicted. Pam said that they will be removed if necessary as there are local guys that can take them down. Beverly Fearey made a motion to approve the seasonal application, with removal of the sails on or before October 24th, 2013. If the owners want to reinstall the sails for the 2014 season, they will bring a new application in the spring. Conditioned that the sails will be taken down if there is a high wind or tropical storm.

2nd - Carole Berger. Unanimously approved.

53 S. Water (20D-330.3) Paul Ronan. Howard Miller - Agent. Regarding replacement of a perimeter fence. Robert 'Red' Ward was asked, as the Edgartown Viewer of Fences, to comment. Mr. Ward told the HDC Assistant that he could not see the fence and noted that the shrubbery hides much of the fence. Mr. Miller and Mr. & Mrs. Ronan related that the fence cannot be seen from a public way. The fence contractor showed the piece of the composite fence material used and noted that the fence was repaired and not replaced. Mr. Ronan said that the fence has been up since 2000 and that the fence has been repaired often. Last fall one section of the fence had fallen down. Mr. Ronan asked the fence builder to fix and replace the section with something that will not fall down. Mr. Ronan was told there was no approval for replacing part of the fence and further that composite materials have not approved for fences, by the HDC. Carole Berger noted that she can see the fence from Cooke St. as it runs along the back of the property. Mr. Miller brought pictures of the fence saying that Rogers' window will open. Mr. Larkosh, Attorney for the Rogers, disagrees with the history of this fence as related by Mr. Ronan. He told the commission there was an agreement between the parties regarding the fence height and that that agreement has been violated. The parties were told that this commission has no jurisdiction over the parts of the fence that cannot be seen from a public way. It was further noted that this is a dispute between neighbors. James Cisek is, however, concerned with the section of fence that can be seen from a public way and asked that that section be replaced with wood, asking that the Mr. Ronan take an application and apply for replacement of the sections of fence that can be viewed from a public way. Bill Bishop suggested that the neighbors work toward a solution, as the previous agreement cannot be

enforced by the HDC. Carole Berger made a motion to require the Ronan's to fill out an application for replacement of the parts of the fence that can be seen from a public way. Beverly Fearey- 2nd. Unanimously Approved.

Old/New Business:

1. Minutes 7.02.13

Motion to approve July 2nd minutes, Robbie Hutchison, 2nd- Carole Berger, approved..

2. It was brought to the attention of the HDC that an outdoor shower has been added to the property at 105 Main St., without approval. The assistant will send a letter to the owner.

3. Bill Bishop moved that Edith Blake attend the Zoning Board of Appeals meeting as a representative of the HDC, regarding the proposed demolition of the house at 9 High St. 2nd- Beverly Fearey. Approved.

The meeting was adjourned 5:40

Respectfully Submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ date _____
James Cisek-Chairman