



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: bgarber@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission Minutes

Tuesday, February 5, 2013

Commissioners in attendance: Carole Berger-Chairman, Mary Sullivan, Robbie Hutchison, Beverly Fearey, James Cisek, David Thompson & Edith Blake-Alternate. Staff: Bricque Garber

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Berger at 4:01 PM.

- 1. 4:00 – Public Hearing. 105 N. Main St. 20D-65** Daniel Santangelo. Applicant proposes to construct a new 660 sq. ft. two bay garage with 900 sq. ft. guesthouse above and construct a new 450 sq. ft. pool house with covered porch. Carole Berger read the public Hearing Notice. Present neighbors: Mr. Santangelo appeared with his plans & pictures and described the history of his current plan. He showed pictures of properties in the area that have similar design elements to his current plan. He described the garage and the configuration of the proposed buildings on the lot. He told the assembly that the lot is quite large and lacks only a few sq. ft. from being sub-dividable into 2 lots. He described the setbacks as greater than required by code. He explained why he has chosen to build before remodeling the main house. He showed a plan for garage with and without cupola and showed a shift of location of the future pool. (building the pool is not part of this application). The meeting was opened to members of the public for comment. Present abutters: Nancy and Howell Kelly and John and Pat Hayes. Mr. Hayes is concerned about the main house, specifically the front façade and fence. Would like to see some focus on the fence and façade. Mr. Santangelo answered that the inside presents so many issues that the main house must be done in total and not piece-mill. He agrees with the assessment that the siding and fence are in poor shape but said that there is no easy fix. Nancy & Howell Kelly, live behind the house, and asked about the heights of the buildings. Mr. Santangelo answered that the height is approximately 26 feet, the new building is much lower than the main house. Nancy asked about the pool house and was told there is no 2nd floor and no stairs. Mr. Santangelo further described the layout of the buildings. Nancy asked about basements. Mr. Santangelo said there are no basements. There was some conversation about landscaping. Mr. Santangelo is a landscaper and will consult with the neighbors when he completes his land Mr. Santangelo said the fence needs to be removed or replaced. He said it will be replaced but not immediately. Mr. Kelley wanted to further discuss the fencing and landscaping. He is concerned about the height of a future fence. He said that there would be no fence on the Kelly side of the property, to accommodate more sunlight. Nancy asked about a time frame. Mr. Santangelo would like to build these two buildings at the end of the coming summer. Mr. Kelly asked about roof material for the main house. Mr. Santangelo said he plans asphalt as existing a clapboard front & shingles on sides. The new buildings, too, will be clapboard on

front and shingles on the side as called out on the plans. He said he would not rent the house next summer. As there were further questions the public hearing was closed. Robbie asked about access to the main house after the new buildings are in. Mr. Santangelo said he can use the temporary driveway. Beverly Fearey asked about repairing the fence at the front of the house on Main St. Mr. Santangelo said he will replace the fence in front if he can do it without damage to the new fence when he begins work on the main house. He said that he wants to look into changing the whole fence rather than doing a repair. James Cisek said that he does not want to look at the existing front fence all summer it is in very poor condition and an eyesore. Mr. Cisek further noted that the focus of the HDC is the appearance of buildings in the district, and that fence pieces are missing. He asked that the fence be repaired or replaced. Carole Berger said that this house is in the Historic District and we extremely interested in the look of the front fence. Mary Sullivan noted that the relationship of the new buildings to the old buildings is very important and shares concerns that this is home represents entry to Edgartown. Further she wants clarification of the time for the fence repair. Mary stated that she is not inclined to approve this application at this time. Mr. Santangelo said that he will repair fence for the summer with the understanding that the whole fence needs replacing. Mary Sullivan thinks that Mr. Santangelo should want to do fix or repair the fence. James Cisek asked why not replace the fence? Mr. Santangelo said that he will replace fence. Mary Sullivan asked, when? Mr. Santangelo said he would make inquiries as to fence materials, but did not give a specific date for repair or replacement.

James Cisek asked about shingle color for the new buildings and said he would like to see shingle stain colors samples. James commented that perhaps gable dormers rather than shed dormers might be built be a better look. Mr. Santangelo said that he prefers shed dormers noting that the Kelly's have shed dormers. Carole Berger also prefers the shed dormers, saying they are a more simple design. Robbie Hutchison is concerned about the tree at driveway area and wondered if the tree might create too tight a turning radius. Mr. Santangelo does not think there is a problem and does not believe there is any concern for the loss of the Tree. Carole asked about the cupola. Mr. Santangelo said he would like to keep the cupola and his original plan was to have the cupola, but will forgo the cupola if the board prefers. James, David and Robbie do not like the scale of the cupola. Mary said does not support the project so the cupola does not matter to her. Mr. Santangelo said he "is not married to the cupola". Mr. Santangelo said he will use the plan without the cupola. Robbie asked about the flower boxes and wants assurance that they will be added as shown on the plan. Carole asked about the chimney materials. Mr. Santangelo asked if there is a preference for stone rather than brick? Carole would prefer to see brick as brick is on the main house. Mr. Santangelo said he is okay with the brick. Robbie Hutchison made a motion to continue the application to Feb 19th for discussion of: the dormer (shed vs. gable dormers) including the pool house, cupola- with or without, chimney material and a time frame for replacing or repairing the fence. 2nd, Beverly Fearey. Unanimously voted to continue to 2.19.13 .

- 2. 4:15 – 44 Main St. (20D-196)** New Moon Property LLC. Tharp Group/Pamela Scott – Agent. Applicant proposes renovation of Edgartown Books facade & replacement of existing addition for bookstore & coffee café uses. Robbie Hutchison recused herself from hearing this application as she is a consultant on the project but will speak to the landscaping plan. Pam Scott and Susan Mercer- Manger. Pam Scott showed plans and pictures of the original building. She described that this is a two phase project. Phase one is temporary for the summer 2013 season. Phase 2 plans were presented but will be further discussed in future meetings. Edgartown books has 2 back wings that are vacant. They want to use vacant back wings spaces in for coffee this summer. No construction will be done other than the 2 doors. The age of the rear wings is unknown but believed to be mid century. There will be no seating inside. Only change is barn doors on both sides and parking lot screening with lattice. Will bring in baked goods for the coffee shop. Entrance will be from terrace. Pam noted that this is

the first phase of the project and the big project will commence in the fall and after Columbus Day which will include demolishing the back wings and replacing with new construction. The new construction will be 16% larger and would be in kind with the existing. They plan to create a formal coffee shop with access from the bookstore and to the park and terrace. There was discussion about the screening. Pam said they are here today seeking approval for phase 1. Courtyard material hardscape primarily brick with some blue stone including handicap access. They plan to enclose the trash and air conditioner area. Walkways will be brick with Lattice fence and planting. With fence will look like a continuation of the pictures from the 1900's. Motion to approve of the temporary hardscape terrace and brick walkway, Mary Sullivan. 2nd David Thompson . Unanimous. Discussion of the fence is continued to the next meeting on 2/19/13.

- 3. **4:30 – 96 S. Water St. (29B-11.121)** Edward Goodman. Applicant Proposes to build a white, wood fence similar to those in the neighborhood. (completed) Motion to approve fence with painting to be done when weather permits. Mary Sullivan. 2nd Robbie Hutchison. Approved

- 4. **4:45 – 74 N. Water St. (20D-243)** Sunderland Family Trust. John Shepherd – Agent. Applicant proposes to remove and replace painted shingles with natural cedar shingles and repaint front porch (white) as existing. Motion to approve Mary Sullivan. 2nd Robbie Hutchison. Approved.

New Business:

Minutes 12.18.12 & 1.8.13 Cont 2.19.13
HDC Bylaw, Section 9A – Ordinary Maintenance – Warrant Article - Cont. 2.19.13
HDC member project assignments & overseer reports - Cont. 2.19.13
Historic District Guidebooks and CD's - Workshop/Q&A with Chris Skelly-May? - Cont. 2.19.13
Ordinary Maintenance approvals form - Cont. 2.19.13
Propose April Meetings 4/2 & 4/23 - Missing 4/16 - Cont. 2.19.13

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ date _____
Carole Berger- Chairman