



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: bgarber@edgartown-ma.us

~ Historic District Commission ~

MINUTES

November 18, 2014



Members in attendance: James Cisek, Beverly Fearey, Edith Blake, David Thompson, Carole Berger, Ann Floyd, Ken Magnuson. Staff: Bricque Garber

Troy Bettencort, approved as a new HDC member, but not yet sworn in, attended as observer

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Cisek @ 4:01.

PUBLIC HEARING ~ 8 Peases Point Way South. (20D-19) John Ettinger & Linda Simson. Matt Cramer/Agent. Applicant proposes 100% demolition of existing home and construction of new, 2 story home & detached Garage/Carriage House. Mr. Cisek read the public hearing notice for 8 Peases Point Way South. Mr. Cisek explained that the Applicant/Architect would speak first. Then the meeting is opened for public comment. First those in favor, then those opposed. Then the public part will be closed and the board will discuss the application.

There was a site visit just prior to the meeting. Several members of the public attended the meeting. Mr. Regan & Mr. Cramer appeared to discuss the project and made presentation as architects representing the project. Mr. Regan introduced the owners, John Ettinger and Linda Simpson. Mr. Ettinger provided a history on their ownership and association with Marthas Vineyard. They have owned the property since 2008 and rented the house for a decade before buying. Mr. Ettinger said that the frame cannot be preserved per the engineering report. Mr. Regan then presented the plan for the planned new home. He discussed his notes from previous meeting and related his history with the project, saying that the goal is to construct a year round family home, noting that the existing house is failing. The plan is to create a new Greek revival style house and preserve green space. He said they have chosen to do something reminiscent rather than a renovation due to the poor condition of the house. He referenced the engineers report, presented to the members, prepared by Siegel Associates—Structural Engineers, saying all must be redone and there is nothing to preserve.

Moving on to the new home proposal, Mr. Regan displayed existing site plan and the proposed site plan. He said they will preserve the foot print of the existing

façade and will maintain current landscaping and existing fencing. Mr. Regan said that the house will have a primary presentation is on Peases Pt. Way with a secondary presentation on Main St. He proposes to change the location of the curb cut. The new house will be a full 2 story home without dormers. He displayed and described all elevations. The new house is planned to be white painted clapboard with true divided light (TDL) windows and doors.

James Cisek opened to the Public. Those in favor: Skip Tomassian, direct abutter, said much old construction is poor and he has no objection, noting that the owners have lived with the property for a long time. John and Patty Hayes of 111 Main St., Mr. Hayes spoke in favor of the plan having viewed the plans and said they are fully supportive of the plan. Letters of support, were read, from: Mary-Kate McKenna, Catherine Foster, Robert and Elizabeth Bostrom, James & Carole Wolf & Julia Livingston.

Comments in opposition. Patrick Ahearn, abutter at 70 Davis Lane, said he troubled by the scale of the project. Mr. Ahearn noted a prior relationship with Mr. Ettinger and Ms. Simpson but said this is about the proposed scale of the project. Mr. Ahearn, who is an architect, said that he designed the house next to the subject house, modeled on the subject house, respecting the 26 ft. roof height. He said that historically, as wings were added over time the additions were stepped down in height. He said that he believes the Greek Revival style is good but objects to the proposed height of the building at 32 feet. Mr. Ettinger said that he believes he should be allowed to present his prior business disputes with Mr. Ahearn. Mr. Cisek did not agree and moved back to the public hearing. Alice Mattison a 40 year resident of 100 N. Water St. said she is opposed to the demolition. Mr. Cisek asked if there was any further public comment and, their being none, closed the public hearing.

In directing the discussion to the commission, Mr. Cisek said that thinks it would be a shame to enter a Historic District without historic homes but only replicas of historic homes. Beverly Fearey is disturbed by the idea of demolition and believes the planned house is too huge. James Cisek noted, his opinion, that the main box of the house should be maintained and that historic houses are retained and fixed and renovated, all the time, everywhere in historic areas. Mr. Ettinger proclaimed his disagreement and said that he believes that the Mr. Cisek and the commission are substituting their judgment for that of the engineer. There was some discussion regarding keeping the "historic box" of the house. Mr. Ettinger and Ms. Simpson made additional arguments for demolition. Ann Floyd discussed the fascia and other details with Mr. Regan. She said that she believes the house, as planned, is too massive and that Main St. and Peases are both at the entrance of the Historic District, making both views very important. Ms. Floyd believes the historic character is "not there" in the new house plan. Edith Blake noted that she does not like the look of the house, describing it as "not pretty" and she does not like the high roof line.

Carole Berger said that she does not see anything reminiscent of the current historic building, in this design, and is not in favor of the demolition. Mr. Ettinger defended the size saying this plan is less dense than most other sites in the neighborhood. Carol Berger said she sees nothing to remind her of the old house and would like to see a plan that works with the “main box” of the old house. Ann Floyd believes the proposed placement of the Carriage House obstructs the view from the sidewalk.

Ken Magnuson sees the house as dilapidated and he does not see a problem with demolition. Discussion between commission members, regarding the proposed construction, continued. Mr. Regan told the Commission that he does not agree with Mr. Ahearn as to the scale of the proposed new home and noted the problems inherent with the flat drawings in trying to visualize a project. He does not think the proposed new home is massive and further suggested they could produce a computer model which, also, is not a great but may be better than a flat drawing. James Cisek said, again, that the commission would like to see a plan to preserve the box of the main house. A tense and strongly opinionated discussion between Mr. Ettinger and Mr. Cisek, continued regarding renovation vs. demolition of the historic house. Carole Berger made a motion to deny the application as presented. Edith Blake provided a 2nd. The motion was approved and the application was denied. The members were individually polled for their vote and all members voted to deny the application. Mr. Ettinger requested a copy of the original survey documents from the time of the establishment of the HDC. Bricque said she does not have this document in her files but will look for the requested document and send a copy to Mr. Ettinger and Ms. Simpson, when available.

96 South Water (29B-11.121) Edward Goodman. John Magnuson/Agent. Applicant proposes replacing wood sash. Change to an approved plan. Applicant proposes changing window manufacturer to Andersen 400 series, as was originally approved. Motion to approve as presented. Carole Berger. 2nd Beverly Fearey. Unanimously Approved.

31 Dock Street (20D-305) Seafood Shanty. Matt Byrne/Agent. Applicant proposes to add navy blue awnings over 2 decks. Motion to approve as presented. Beverly Fearey. 2nd Ken Magnuson. Unanimously Approved.

83 N. Water St. (20D-285) Barbara Jordan. Chris Royal/Agent. Applicant proposes to replace French Doors and ½ round (fan) window in kind and replace cedar shingles. Chris Royal appeared to discuss the replacement of windows as to replicate existing. Pictures were reviewed by commissioners. Motion to approve as presented. Edith Blake. 2nd Beverly Fearey. Unanimously Approved.

60 Winter St. (20D-111.2) Sherry Purdy. William Gazaille/Agent. Applicant proposes to replace 3 skylights & add a 4th skylight. Project was presented by Mr. Gazaille. Pictures and drawing were viewed by commissioners. Motion to approve as presented. David Thompson. 2nd Ken Magnuson. Unanimously Approved.

New/Old Business:

Warren House Windows – A picture of proposed rear windows was presented but the manufacturer was not clear. Bricque will seek further clarification from the Architect.

Expansion survey mailing. The commission previously voted to send a preliminary questionnaire to homeowners in the proposed HDC expansion area. Voted to send mailing at the end of January.

Pagoda Tree. The HDC has provided a letter to the conservation commission stating HDC support of any Con-Com decisions to protect the tree. Patrick Ahearn told the commissioners that the owners will abandon the currently approved garage plan in favor of using the existing foundation. Mr. Ahearn will provide an application and drawings for the change to garage/carriage house, for the next meeting.

Minutes: 11.21.14 Motion to approve the minutes as written, Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Carole Berger. Unanimously Approved.

The meeting was adjourned @ 5:21.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber
Assistant

Approved: _____ December 2, 2014
James Cisek, Chairman