



**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158  
70 Main Street  
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: [www.edgartown-ma.us](http://www.edgartown-ma.us)  
email: [bgarber@edgartown-ma.us](mailto:bgarber@edgartown-ma.us)

# Historic District Commission

## ~MINUTES~

June 3, 2014

Members in attendance: James Cisek, Chairman, Carole Berger, Bill Bishop, Edith Blake, David Thompson & Beverly Fearey. Absent: Robbie Hutchison. Staff: Bricque Garber

Mr. Cisek called the meeting to order at 4:03 PM.

**105 Main St. (20D-65) Daniel Santangelo.** Change to an approved plan. Applicant proposes a change of gutter material. Mr. Redfearn appeared as agent for Mr. Santangelo and provided information regarding the fiberglass gutters proposed. He provided a computer presentation showing buildings in historic areas of Massachusetts where the fiberglass gutters have been installed. He showed small detail photos from Edgartown, as well. Mr. Redfearn relayed that Mr. Santangelo has requested Boston profile G-75 series gutters. Mr. Redfearn detailed how the fiberglass will handle more water as it is thinner than a wood gutter and is much stronger than wood. Manufactured in Marshfield MA the gutter material is guaranteed for 25 years. Mr. Redfearn discussed the strength of Fiberglass vs. PVC. Bill asked about color and was told that the Color Gel coat can be had in any color. James Cisek explained the violation issue, noting this commission cannot approve mounting the gutters to an unapproved fascia boards. Bill Bishop likes the look of the gutter, as molded from wood. Mr. Redfearn was asked about down-spouts and told the HDC down-spouts are planned to be copper or galvanized. Motion to approve fiberglass gutter with galvanized or copper down-spouts, as presented, conditioned - that the gutter will be attached to wood fascia or installation to be delayed until there is a resolution of the current violation regarding composite trim/fascia, Bill Bishop. 2<sup>nd</sup>, David Thompson. Unanimously approved.

**19 Church St. (20D-116.1) Island Realty Trust.** *Change to an approved plan.* Oraibi Voumard/agent. Applicant proposes to add intermittent wooden posts and trellis. New cedar shingles to remain unpainted. There was a site visit prior to the meeting. Mr. Voumard told the HDC that based upon the prior conversations; he made the entry a bit smaller. Carole Berger noted that she likes the chunky style and thinks it gives the entrance some presence. When asked about the door (as discussed

in the meeting of 5.20.14) Mr. Voumard said that they have ordered a door that exactly mimics the existing door. Bill Bishop asked about stain for entry and trellis and was told there is no plan to add color. They will leave it natural and let it grey along with the new shingles and that he will bring a piece of the wood in showing the sealer or clear stain. Motion to approve as presented, Carole Berger. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Beverly Fearey. Approved.

**81 Main St. Dukes County Court House. (20D-121)** Martina Thornton, County Manager/agent. Applicant proposes to change approved ramp railings.

**WITHDRAWN.** Applicant will use Bronze rails as approved.

**86 N. Water St. (20D-254) 86 N. Water St. Trust.** Rob Thompson/agent. Applicant proposes renovation of attic & remove and replace roof window. Mr. Thompson described the work and location of the work to be done. It is clearly not visible from any public way. Motion to approve as not applicable. Bill Bishop. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Edith Blake. Approved.

**101 S. Water St. (29B-19) Michael Caruso.** Garret Conover & Patrick Ahearn/agents. *Change to an approved plan.* Applicant proposes an addition/change of door surround on home addition and change of porch columns. Continued from 5.20.14. There was a site visit prior to the meeting. Patrick Ahearn and Garrett Conover appeared to present the changes. Patrick presented that the originally tapered square column, planned for 2<sup>nd</sup> entry evolved since the project approval. Patrick saw these changes it as a minor detail changes, but acknowledges that these changes should have been brought to the HDC. Mr. Ahearn said that he sees the changes of column as more accurate to Greek revival period and that colored glass or detailed glass is more accurate. The addition of antique fan glass above the door was thought to be a minor tweak. It is clear that many of the members were not happy with the change to the door surround and transom. While Mr. Ahearn believes that for intents and purposes this wing could have been original to the house and think that these changes celebrate the front door, many members have a problem with the ornate glass and believe it is not in keeping with the historic part of the house. Mr. Ahearn recognized that they should have come in to get approval for the changes to the door but also believes these changes enrich the public realm as well as the comfort of the owners. James Cisek sees this entry as ‘taking away’ from the original house and makes the main house appear as secondary. Patrick said they will be replacing the antique class on main house. Further the “addition” door will have a screen door. David Thompson thinks the door looks prominent now but will grey and not compete so much with the primary entry. Bill Bishop prefers the original plans for the door as they blends better with the existing home and thinks that the eye catches on the 2<sup>nd</sup> entry as more important. Carole Berger thinks it is a beautiful door but does not like it for the addition entrance. Acknowledging that this may be more true to Greek Revival, but thinks this wing should complement the old house. Patrick noted that the carriage house is all Greek revival. Edith thinks it is currently accurate from a historic point of view and likes it very much. Carole thinks all should be a

complement to the primary house. Edith thinks the addition is perfect and really likes the changes. Further discussion ensued. All members were okay with the columns as they will be duplicated on the side porch (not yet built). Mr. Ahearn proposed the addition of a wood fan shutter to be inserted in the transom above the entry of the porch. The members like this addition. Motion to approve the fluted columns on the porch, with addition of identical columns on the side porch. Bill Bishop. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved.

Motion to approve door surround as presented, conditioned upon the addition of a permanent Wood Fan Shutter above the addition door (transom). HDC will review/approve the Fan Shutter. Bill Bishop. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved.

**101 S. Water St. (29B-19) Michael Caruso.** Garret Conover & Patrick Ahearn/agents. *Change to an approved plan.* Applicant proposes addition of guard railing/pool fence. There was a site visit prior to the meeting. Mr. Conover showed pictures of planned pool rail for the rear. He brought a sample of the railing to be black or green. James Cisek asked about the huge painted green wall and wondered why they did not continue with the stone covering for this wall, as it was believed that the stone would cover the entire wall. Mr. Donoroma attending the meeting and said they did the waterside in stone and the decided to cover concrete with green paint to be hidden with landscaping. Mr. Cisek noted that the HDC does not consider landscaping as a structure, noting that trees and shrubs die. Mr. Donoroma said that the wall will not be seen and that it is a condition of his landscaping contract, with the home owner, that the painted wall will not be seen and will always be covered with plantings. Motion to approve rear pool railing, painted green. Bill Bishop. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Beverly Fearey. Approved.

### **New/Old Business:**

*Minutes: 5.20.14 Motion to approve 5.20.14 minutes, Edith Blake. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved.*

*It was voted that James Cisek will retain chairmanship with Carole Berger as vice chair.*

*Respectfully submitted:*

*Bricque Garber*

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 6.17.14  
*James Cisek, Chairman*