



**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158  
70 Main Street  
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: [www.edgartown-ma.us](http://www.edgartown-ma.us)  
email: [bgarber@edgartown-ma.us](mailto:bgarber@edgartown-ma.us)

# Historic District Commission

## ~MINUTES~

May 20, 2014

Members in attendance: James Cisek, Carole Berger, Robbie Hutchison, Edith Blake and David Thompson. Absent: Bill Bishop & Beverly Fearey. Staff: Bricque Garber.

Mr. Cisek called the meeting to order at 4:00.

**105 Main St. (20D-65) Daniel Santangelo.** Discussion regarding gutters. Mr. Santangelo appeared with Joe Redfern to discuss the material he plans to use for the gutters and presented his contention that 'wood profile', as described on his approved plan, designates a composite material made to look like wood. Mr. Jason, Edgartown Building Inspector attended the meeting. Mr. Santangelo referred to several versions of his building plans where the words composite, Azek or fiberglass were used, but the version viewed and approved by the HDC used the words 'wood profile'. Mr. Santangelo contends that 'wood profile' means composite made to look like wood. James Cisek explained that without the words composite or fiberglass added to the description, a local lumber company takes the words, "wood profile" to mean wood, as did the members of the HDC.

Joe Redfearn represents the gutter company and brought samples of fiberglass gutters. He explained that this product is often used on historical homes. He said that the fiberglass appears as wood because it is molded from wood and it handles water well. He made the argument that fiberglass is preferable to Azek as a gutter material. Mr. Redfern showed a slide presentation of old homes where they have installed fiberglass gutters and explained the advantages of using the fiberglass product. Mr. Santangelo prefers to use this product rather than wood which may break down easily. Robbie Hutchison asked about the use of these gutters in the Edgartown Historic District. Mr. Redfern said that the product has been used here but did not provide addresses citing privacy issues.

After the presentation Mr. Santangelo & Mr. Redfern left the meeting. The rest of the applications for this agenda were heard. As a final item, Mr. Santangelo's gutter issues were discussed. There were two arguments presented by Mr. Santangelo. 1) The wording of "wood profile" on approved plans. 2) The viability of fiberglass gutter installations in the Historic District. Regarding the approved application, the members do not agree that

the wording designates a composite gutter and see the wording on the approved application as a purposeful intent to mislead the commission. Regarding the viability of the product for use in the district, Mr. Santangelo is encouraged to provide an application for a “change to an approved plan” to change the approved gutters to fiberglass.

**16 Simpsons Lane. (20D-220.5). Lisa Murrell. *Change to an approved plan.***

Applicant proposes to add a perimeter/pool fence. Tim Amaral from Off Shore Pools appeared to discuss the fence, presenting pictures of the neighboring fence. The fence as applied for is intended to be white. Robbie Hutchison asked if the fence, in Essex Green, might be a better choice and be less visible. Tim called Mrs. Murrell, (owner) and Mrs. Murrell agreed to paint the fence Essex Green. Motion to approve the fence as presented in Essex Green, Carole Berger. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Robbie Hutchison. Unanimously Approved.

**67 Simpsons Lane. (20D-103). Wayne Royal. The Good Neighbor Fence Co./agent.**

Applicant proposes to change the existing low stockade fence to wood picket fence, painted white. Motion to approve, Carole Berger, 2<sup>nd</sup>, Robbie Hutchison. Approved

**7 Winter St., Winter St. Condo Trust.(20D-215) Christina Cook/Agent.** Applicant proposes to change the sign hardware for the CB Stark sign. Christina presented the proposed new sign hardware as black wrought iron which is up a bit higher on the front of the building than the old sign holder. Robbie asked how far it extends from the building. Christina noted the old sign holder was 41 inches. The new one extends approximately the same distance but is higher on the building. There was some discussion. Motion to approve as presented David Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup> Robbie Hutchison. Approved.

**19 Church St. (20D-116.1) Island Realty Trust. *Change to an approved plan.***

Oraibi Voumard/agent. Applicant proposes to add intermittent wooden posts and trellis. New Cedar shingles to remain unpainted for the 2014 season. Bricque explained that the meeting today has only a quorum as members are missing and offered the applicant the option of continuing the hearing. The applicant did not request a continuance. Oraibi described the new posts and trellis. He noted that it will not be tied directly to the building but rather be free standing. Oraibi showed computer generated pictures& a “mock-up” picture. James Cisek sees this plan as a bit too modern in design. Mr. Voumard said they are trying to better designate the entry & are looking to create a very simple not fancy look. Oraibi said they could use plants to soften the edges. David Thompson feels a curve would be more inviting. Edith Blake agrees with David. The arbor would be approx 8 feet wide. James asked about staining the wood. Oraibi said they will use a clear stain to get a natural wood look. Members think there should be softening of the edges. James Cisek suggested a continuation and a site visit for the next meeting. The applicant agreed. Motion to continue, Carole Berger. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Robbie Hutchison. Approved to continue with a site visit before the next meeting June 3, 2014.

Mr. Voumard asked to allow the new shingles to be left unpainted noting they had planned to replace some shingles and paint to match but then re-shingled the entire building. He further said the unusable front door is failing (not plan to use this door). He said that he can screw door shut or change door. He showed a picture of a possible replacement door. To be voted on June 3, 2014.

**81 Main St. Dukes County Court House. (20D-121)** Martina Thornton, County Manager/agent. Applicant proposes to replace handicap ramp. *Continued from 5.6.14.* Lenny Jason appeared having discussed the project with Martina and described the railing as Bronze. They propose to add bench for public (attorneys & clients) at area of stairs. Brick pathway to match existing brick & Mahogany ramp. Motion to approve as drawn with Bronze railing, Mahogany decking and brick pathway to match exiting brick as closely as possible. Robbie Hutchison. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved.

**Edgartown Lodge. Tom McGrath.** Change to approved lanterns. Approved lanterns were not available and were 32" (too large) these are 27". Motion to approve change of Lanterns as presented, Robbie Hutchison. 2<sup>nd</sup>, David Thompson. Approved.

Carole Berger had a question about shutters depicted in drawings in Real Estate advertisement. Tom told the commission there are a few errors in the Real Estate drawings.

**53 Peases Point N. (20D-104)** Lawrence DePaulis. Fred Keillor & Tom O'Hanlon/agents. Applicant proposes to remove and replace 6x8 ft. storage shed. Fred and Tom showed pictures of the shed as it existing. Roof line will change to pitched from simple shed roof, but shed will be the same configuration & foot print as existing. 4 pitch on the roof. They plan to construct the walls off site and be built quickly with demo. of 1/2 day. Door will be centered. Motion to approve as presented, David Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved.

**101 S. Water St. (29B-19) Michael Caruso.** Garret Conover & Patrick Ahearn/agents. *Change to an approved plan.* Addition/change of door surround on addition and change of porch columns. Robbie Hutchison was recused. Applicant asked to be continued for full Commission to address the violation. Continued, with a site visit, to June 3<sup>rd</sup>.

**101 S. Water St. (29B-19) Michael Caruso.** Garret Conover & Patrick Ahearn/agents. *Change to an approved plan.* Proposed modification to pool house plan. Garry Conover appeared to discuss a change to the approved pool house. Robbie Hutchison was recused. Carole asked for orientation. The site plan was reviewed. Mr. Conover said the location will not be changed. The difference will be overall height of the building. By removing the cupola and changing to a hip roof. The building will move lower by 24 inches (steps down to the entry) and change to roof line would reduce the overall height of the pool house. James asked about putting the window and planter box on the street side so it does not look like a storage shed from the street. Mr. Conover said they are happy to move the window and planter box. They can lessen the height and retain the gable roof if desired. Carol likes lessening the height with a window & flower box on the street side. Motion to approve of the plan as presented lowering the building with a change to a hip roof, no cupola, window, flower box and shutters facing the street. Carole Berger. 2<sup>nd</sup>, David Thompson. Unanimously Approved.

Mr. Conover told the commission there is some ongoing discussion about fencing to be considered. He will make an application for the proposed fencing for the June 3<sup>rd</sup>, agenda. Mr. Donoroma brought a few current pictures of the project as it is progressing.

**New/Old Business:**

Edith has a good idea to add 2 pictures to all applications. One picture of the front of the house and one picture from street showing the house in context on the street. (a few neighboring properties in photo) Motion to make this change for all applications, Edith Blake. 2<sup>nd</sup>, David Thompson. Approved.

**Minutes: 5.6.14.** Motion to approve as amended (correction of address from Summer to S. Water. - 3<sup>rd</sup> agenda item). Robbie Hutchison. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved.

Meeting adjourned: 6:14

Respectfully submitted:  
Bricque Garber

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 6.3.14  
*James Cisek, Chairman*