



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: bgarber@edgartown-ma.us

Historic District Commission

~MINUTES~

April 1, 2014

Members in attendance: James Cisek, Chairman, Beverly Fearey, David Thompson, Bill Bishop, Edith Blake & Robbie Hutchison. Absent: Carole Berger. Staff: Bricque Garber.

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Cisek at 4:00.

4:00 ~ Public Hearing 62 N. Water St. (20D-232) 62 N. Water St. LLC. Brooks & Falotico/Agents. Applicant proposes to raise and reposition the structure and do demolition, renovations and additions including a garage to a historic home commonly known as the Captain Warren House. There was a site visit today prior to the meeting. Mr. Cisek read the public hearing notice. Mr. Wolk, Owner, Ms. Brooks, Mr. Falotico & Mr. Sentz, Architects and Mr. Gillen, Landscape Architect, attended to discuss proposed plans. Mr. Gillen presented the plan for the house relocation and proposed new site on the lot showing the existing location of the house and fencing and the proposed location changes, further he described fencing and the parking area and sidewalks. He showed pictures of the proposed hardscape and fencing. He described plantings and the green space at front of the house.

Louise Brooks made the presentation for the architectural plans and proposals. She provided the drawings and renderings. She explained the reason for moving the house, noting that the house is currently on the set back and making it parallel to the house on the right will enhance the view down the street. The exterior will be left intact as it can be seen from the street. She stressed the desire of the group toward restoration. The house height will be reduced by 18" to make it Edgartown compliant. It was noted that the house is being converted back to a single family home. The rear yard will have a pool and as much green as can be obtained. Ms. Brooks explained that they intend to use all the old glass as can be salvaged. James Cisek opened the hearing to public comment. As there was no public comment, he opening the hearing to questions from the commissioners.

Beverly Fearey asked about the new proposed height of the building and was told that it has been lowered to comply with the height restrictions of the town. Bill Bishop asked about the actual moving of the house, asking what will happen to the main box when the house is moved, specifically the front porch roof and the pair of 'bump-outs' on the side.

Mr. Bishop further asked about the proposed vs. current trims. Louise Brooks described the movement to be pick-up and move and the plan to restore and replicate the trims that cannot be refurbished. Bill Bishop pointed out that the proposed changes may eliminate some of the trims as the design changes happen and his concerns with regard to existing trims and supports. Ms. Brooks said that the intention is to bring the house back to the original era as several eras are currently represented. The thinking was that the original era would be preferable. Bill Bishop continued to question the changes. The goal, Louise said, is to refurbish as much as can be refurbished. She has provided trim detail but can be modified if the commission would like. Bill Bishop asked the ridge height and asked how much lower the ridge of the new proposed addition is. The answer: 27 feet & 22 & 1/2 feet at the lowest point. Overall, it is lower than the current addition. James Cisek expressed a wish to see a restoration of the front of the house as it currently is. Noting that there is a mix of Federal and Victorian but there is a history there and a certain whimsy to the structure with the 2 eras represented. Edith Blake noted that many of the changes, over time, are historic to this particular house and add character to the street. Louise Brooks said they are willing to go either way with the front and side of the house, including keeping the 'bump-out', as is. She said they are happy to leave the bump and will submit revised drawings referencing the front of the house. Mr. Wolk questioned mixing styles but Louise feels that it could work to do a mix of the two styles. Bill Bishop wants to see a comprehensive trim detail. Mr. Wolk asked for guidance from the commission. Louise discussed the mixing of the two eras. James Cisek feels the box bay as is will add to the house. The windows were discussed and a promise was made to use what window glass can be used. Bill Bishop approves of the idea of front and side changes to better reflect the current house. James Cisek asked about the chimney, noting he would prefer the chimney on the first part of the addition be moved to the inside. His chimney questions were answered to his satisfaction and he withdrew his objection. Bill Bishop reflected that the 'jog' works well. James Cisek asked about pool equipment and noise. Louise Brooks said the pool equipment will be placed inside the basement or closet to reduce noise. Beverly Fearey asked about access to the rear for maintenance. Robbie Hutchison asked about hardscape. Matt Gillen reviewed the cobbles and granite. Robbie asked the applicant to please do all they can to preserve the antique look of the hardscape, as pictures were reviewed.

Chairman Cisek's final comments concerned preservation noting that this commission is most concerned with retaining the historic aspects of Edgartown historic homes with an emphasis on restoration rather than reproduction. Mr. Wolk, the owner of the house, reiterated, that this is ultimately his goal. Motion to continue to the next meeting to allow for new drawings to reflect changes as discussed and a comprehensive trim detail list as agreed to by the applicant, Bill Bishop. 2nd David Thompson. Continued to April 15th at 4:00 PM.

4:20 ~ 105 Main St. (20D-65) Daniel Santangelo. Addition of 2 granite posts at Peases Point road side of property. Continued from 3.4.14. The Landscaping plan was displayed and questions asked and answered for those people who have not reviewed the plan. Bill Bishop asked if the planting will go up to the posts. Mr. Santangelo said yes and added that the posts will be 3 feet high. Robbie Hutchison asked why there is a 2nd post in the location shown on the plans.

Bill Bishop asked if a drive way and new curb cut is proposed in the area designated. Robbie Hutchison said that she does not see the 2nd post being put in the ground until a curb cut, in that location, is approved. Dan Santangelo wants to place the 2nd post to protect the propane tank and septic from cars. Mr. Cisek suggested a temporary fence or post until the curb cut is approved. Robbie Hutchison thinks the 2nd granite post definitely designates a curb cut where there is no approved curb cut. James Cisek thinks the posts are too large and are inappropriate. Ms. Blake agrees with Mr. Cisek. Bill Bishop has no problem with the post at the driveway to the garage, but is not in favor of the 2nd post. Motion to approve one granite post at the new garage, Bill Bishop, Noting that any 2nd pillar approval would be contingent upon Edgartown Selectman's approval of a curb cut. Post to be 3 feet high from existing grade. 2nd, David Thompson. Yea votes: Bill Bishop, Robbie Hutchison, David Thompson & Beverly Fearey. Nay votes: Edith Blake and James Cisek. One post approved.

4:25 ~ 105 Main St. (20D-65) Daniel Santangelo. Remove and Replace 2 doors on residence with Simpson wood doors. There was a site visit to view the doors, just prior to the meeting today. Mr. Santangelo showed commissioners the doors at the site visit. He explained that the locks are not functional the doors are not insulated. Proposed doors are pre-hung colonial, fir or pine doors, painted Essex green. The door is a Simpson door # 31606/6 panel doors. Bill Bishop noted that this is an old door and asked about having the door refinished or rebuilt. Mr. Santangelo said that a custom built door "is not an option" and is not cost effective. A discussion ensued and Mr. Cisek and Mr. Bishop made suggestions for saving the door. Motion to replace the side door with the proposed 3130 door with trim remaining the same with exactly the same detail, was made by Beverly Fearey. 2nd, David Thompson. The motion was unanimously approved. A lively discussion resumed regarding the front door. Mr. & Mrs. Santangelo said that the current door is not working well and there is concern about the welfare of their children and proposed that any liability resulting from the use of the door might be the responsibility of the HDC.

Mr. Cisek reminded the applicants that they purchased a historic home in the Historic District and are responsible for restoration of the historic details of the home. Mr. Santangelo said that he does not want to go to the expense of having a custom door made. He said that he is renting the house and needs better security. James Cisek suggested refurbishing the front door. Bill Bishop and Edith Blake think the existing door is gorgeous and should be preserved understanding that the jam and lock need to be replaced. The applicants believe refurbishing the door is unacceptable. Mr. Cisek called for a motion and as no motion was made to approve the application, the application was denied.

4:30 ~68 Winter St. (20D-110.1 – 110.6) 68 Winter St. Realty Trust/Thomas McGrath. (*Edgartown Lodge*). Applicant proposes renovations/maintenance. Applicant to provide renderings of proposed deck and rails. Continued from 3.4.14 Mr. McGrath provided HDC requested renderings of the rails and decking. Motion to grant final approval to the project as presented, Beverly Fearey. 2nd, Edith Blake Approved.

5:45 ~ Carol McManus (20D-116.2) 17 Church St.-Espresso Love. Jevon Rego/agent. Applicant proposes the addition of screen panels on existing porch, solid light panels all trim flat to match existing and replace decking with 1x4 mahogany. Bill Bishop made the motion to approve as presented, noting the applicant should check with the building inspector regarding a possible requirement for safety glass, Robbie Hutchison. 2nd, Edith Blake. Unanimously Approved.

New Business:

Minutes: 3.4.14 Motion to approve the minutes as written, Beverly Fearey. 2nd, Bill Bishop. Unanimously Approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:20.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber

Approved: _____4.15.14
James Cisek, Chairman