



**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158-70 Main St.  
Edgartown, MA 02539  
508 627-6155

# ~Historic District Commission

## MINUTES

November 17, 2015



Members in attendance: James Cisek, Beverly Fearey, Edith Blake, Carole Berger, Susan Catling, Ken Magnuson, Robbie Hutchison, Ann Floyd/alternate & Cassie Bradley/alternate. Staff: Bricque Garber

Chairman Cisek called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm.

**Public Hearing 124 N. Water St. (20D-274)** Patrick Ahearn/Agent. Change to approved plan. Applicant proposes to add a front porch and move house back 10'6" from sidewalk AND add one foot to the width of the previously approved side porch. There was a site visit at 3:30 pm just prior to today's meeting Bricque Garber/ assistant, read the public hearing notice. Mr. Ahearn provided the members copies of the plans and made his presentation. He gave the history of the project as was previously approved. He provided a history of this house and some information regarding the addition of porches to neighboring houses on North Water St. He stated that the neighboring houses have had significant modifications. The abutting house on the north was the first as described by Edith Blake as the first summer house, in Edgartown. Mr. Ahearn noted the changes to the Harborview Hotel over time noting the large porch and described the historic houses on N. Water as living history and not museum pieces. He described that of the 37 houses on N. Water 29 houses have porches and most if not all have had the porches added over time as few if any are original further describing the history town and its man additions as where the old fabric becomes the new fabric. He showed pictures of many of houses on the street noting there are varied styles. This house is virtually on the sidewalk and provides no outdoor opportunity. The addition of the new porch will maintain the distance from the sidewalk as previously approved. Mr. Cisek opened discussion to the public asking if there was any public comment. Mrs. Forrester noted that she they did not expand the porch on her home and noted that the porch was existing when they bought the home, built in the 1920's. There being no further public comment letters from direct neighbors, Linda and Robert Forrester and Gene Barbato were read to the commissioners. Both abutters have serious

concerns about the proposed porch and the proposed expansion of the side porch. Both neighbors asked that the project not be approved by the HDC. Mr. Cisek invited comment and questions from the Commissioners. Edith Blake said that the porches are lovely but they are not historic to the houses. She believes that to be historic we should leave the house as is. James Cisek agrees and would like to see the house remain as is. There was further discussion regarding the measurements and dimensions. Noting that the primary house is moving by 10 feet but it is only moved 2 1/2 feet moved back if the porch is added and considered the new front of the house. James and Patrick discussed the porch and addition pros and cons. Ann Floyd asked Mr. Ahearn if he can date the addition of many of the porches. Patrick believes 50+ years. Edith said that most of the porches were added prior to the establishment of the Historic District but now that there is a historic district this house should remain as is. Patrick maintains that this porch is a modest gesture and believes it is important when considering the expansion of the district that the HDC be reasonable and recognize that this change is minimal and that houses should not be considered museum pieces and voiced concern about maintaining strict rules of no changes to the façade of historic homes. James Cisek said each project is taken on a case by case basis and he believes this house should not be changed. Carole Berger noted a large house on S. Water with a large wrap-around porch. There was further discussion regarding the measurements. Carole Berger and Ann Floyd asked about removing the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor railing from the front porch saying they would prefer a more simple design. Robbie Hutchison concurred. Mr. Ahearn agreed that the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor railing will be removed from the plan. Robbie Hutchison made a motion to approve the porch without the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor deck to assure the visual integrity of the front door & addition of 1 foot in width of the approved side porch. Carole Berger provided the 2<sup>nd</sup>. Those voting in favor: Beverly Fearey, Carole Berger, Susan Catling & Ken Magnuson. Those opposed: James Cisek & Edith Blake. Motion approved.

**28 S. Summer St. (20D-134) and 19 S. Summer St. (20D-189).** Garrett Conover. Applicant proposes to move 13x14 garden shed from 28 S. Summer to 19 S. Summer. Mr. Conover showed pictures of the garden shed noting that it is not historic but the will be removed if not moved. Members discussed the attractive little building and its relocation. Motion to approve moving the shed, Beverly Fearey. 2<sup>nd</sup> Robbie Hutchison. Unanimously approved.

Mrs. Forrester, abutter to 124 N. Water, asked for clarification of the vote to approve changes and raised a question regarding the previously approved side porch, specifically the upper deck and doors. She noted that the previous plan as approved did not include doors to an upper deck. Thus, Mr. Ahearn's plan was reviewed as compared with the previous approval for the side porch. It was noted that the Previously approved plan did not include a side porch-upper deck that was accessible from through doors but only showed windows. A note was made

on the plans and the assistant was instructed to email Mr. Ahearn ASAP to make him aware of that there was no approval for doors to an upper deck on the side porch. It was noted that the original plan was drawn by another architect thus Mr. Ahearn may not be aware of the original approval as pertains to the side porch.

**Street Signs:** Bricque distributed a bid and drawings of a proposed sign “ENTERING HISTORIC DISTRICT” for member comment. The members liked the mock-up and approved the creation of a warrant article for town vote in April. The warrant will request funds for 3 signs on posts. The warrant will be voted if/when the town approves the expansion of the current historic district.

**Minutes:** Motion to approve the minutes of 11.3.15, Ken Magnuson. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved.

Eugene Courtney attended the meeting and spoke to the members, asking for a review of his project at 6 S. Water at the December 1<sup>st</sup>. meeting. There have been unforeseen structural issues as the project has begun. Mr. Courtney said he will hire a structural engineer and obtain a report ASAP.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:10.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 12.1.2015