



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158-70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155

~Historic District Commission~
MINUTES
October 20, 2015



In attendance: James Cisek, Carole Berger, Ken Magnuson, Susan Catling, Edith Blake, Robbie Hutchison. Staff: Bricque Garber

Public Hearing: Public Hearing. 22 North Water St (20D-214.2) CF House Inn, LLC. Patrick Ahearn/Agent.

Applicant proposes a one story addition to create new retail shops and expand restaurant access; and add 36" white fence. There was a site visit just prior to this hearing. Mr. Cisek read the Public Hearing Notice: Mr. Ahearn handed out and described the plans for the addition to the Sydney Inn building. He described a current conflict of entering the restaurant and Inn through the same door. The side of the property facing Winter St. is virtually abandoned, overgrown and has no sidewalk. Across the street are attractive buildings anchored by Christina Gallery. He noted that when Vineyard Vines left Nevin Sq. the commercial area was impacted. He said that this is a chance to bring this side of the street into the commercial space and provide a sidewalk and a better entrance to the restaurant. When the restaurant renovation was done some years ago was not very successful and resulted in the kitchen being viewed from the street. Mr. Ahearn said that the 2 major trees will be retained and several trees will be added. He described the street front façade as is planned, noting that the windows as well as green awnings mimic those across the street. He said there will be no neon signs or fluorescent lights. Mr. Ahearn said that there is no 2nd floor access from rooms, and the rail as shown on the plan, is a design detail. He further noted this will clean up the side of the building as it is currently problematic. He described the details of the plans as presented. James Cisek opened public hearing for public comment. Carole Beecher manager of the Sydney further described the issues with the restaurant and inn entrance. She noted that her highest rated guest rooms are above the bar. Michael Brisson from Letoile said that he is indeed in favor of the project which will include reducing noise and will allow for a bathroom and the addition of 10 seats. James asked if there was any one who wanted to speak in opposition or support of the project. There being no public comment the public portion of the meeting was

closed. Commission members were invited to comment. A letter read from Ann Floyd, who could not attend the meeting. Robbie said she thinks this is a good & creative solution for the hotel and restaurant, as well as the public and helps to enhance a more commercial presence. Robbie detailed her impressions and believes the historic house will still read as an old house. Beverly agreed with Robbie but wants to see the project with no fence. My Ahearn agreed and the fence was removed from the application and the plans. James believes this addition to a historic house, diminishes the historic house. Would like to see it staked out. Robbie thinks this one is anomaly as it has been commercial for so long. It was noted that this house is in the center of the Commercial District and in the center of the Historic District. Patrick described this as no longer a residential house but is more a restaurant and inn. He noted that probably half the buildings on Main St. were houses at one time but is now commercial use. He illustrated his point with the Warren house as a library or the Yellow house as commercial and office space noting that this is in B-1 zone and saying he thinks the greater good theory should apply here. Patrick illustrated that the spaces around the buildings are very important as well, and this property has a very distressed side yard. It was noted that this project will help retailers maintain a viable down town that reinforces a year round life style. Edith does not think it is balanced. Carole likes it very much. Motion to approve Carole Berger, 2nd Robbie Hutchison. Voted to approve: Carole Berger, Beverly Fearey, Edith Blake, Robbie Hutchison, Susan Catling & Ken Magnuson. Opposed, James Cisek. Approved.

Old Whaling Church/MV Preservation Trust. (20D-62) Applicant proposes to repair and restore clock tower with historically accurate materials. Meg and Chris Scott appeared to discuss and passed out images. The paint and repair to be made as needed. Marine plywood was used in the 80's. The marine plywood is gone, there is mold and it is deteriorated as shown on the photos provided. Proposed to restore exactly as is and they will use best grade of Mahogany available. Motion to approve. Beverly, Robbie Hutchison 2nd. Approved.

124 N. Water St. (20D-274) Patrick Ahearn/Agent. Change to approved plan. Applicant proposes to add a front porch and move house 10'6" from sidewalk. Mr. Ahearn passed out plans for the changes and described the plans that were approved previously. This is a new buyer and a new application. Mr. Ahearn noted that there are many porches on North Water St. and these front porches are now part of the fabric of the streetscape. He noted that most of the houses on N. Water, of various styles, have front porches. He is proposing that the front edge of the porch will be 4 1/2 feet from the sidewalk. Also, the side porch will be expanded from 7 ft to 8 ft. This is the plan as applied for but noted they may return to make a future application for addition of a carriage house. The previous approval was read. Mr. Ahearn noting that 30 inches set back, as previously approved is fine with the buyers, as long as a front porch is added. There was a question about the tree on the side where the side porch. Motion to send to public hearing James Cisek, 2nd Ken Magnuson. Unanimously approved to send to public hearing on November 17th.

105 Main St. (20D-65) Daniel Santangelo. Applicant proposes to remove and replace fence with composite wood. Continued from 10.6.15. James asked Dan if he was familiar with a product called Borel made from Potash. Dan said he was not and has only used Azek –type composite. Gate hardware of Black Cast aluminum is Dan’s first choice for gate hardware. Robbie would like to see a more historic gate hardware/latch. Mr. Santangelo has no problem using a historic latch. The members discussed the proposal. Robbie noted that the composite it is more expensive than wood and is an investment. Robbie likes the proposal as does Beverly. James discussed and questioned the construction and specifically the rough edges. Dan said all edges will be sanded primed and painted. Edith Blake made a motion to accept the fence as presented by the application and additional descriptions provided by Mr. Santangelo. 2nd, Robbie Hutchison. Unanimously voted to approve. It was further noted that this board wants to work with homeowners and understands the costs associated with maintenance. This house is a gateway to down town.

70 South Water St. (20D-170) David Hedley. Harry Garvey/Agent. Applicant proposes to relocate pergola, add 2nd floor deck, windows & door AND add roofed, guest house terrace with fireplace, pool & basement for pool equipment and generator, replace existing window with French doors. Bricque noted that this plan is subject to the ZBA approval and there will be a public hearing. Members reviewed the plans. It was noted that this project is barely visible from the public way. Motion to approve Beverly Fearey, 2nd, Susan Catling. Unanimously approved.

100 Main St. (20D-85) Matt Dyroff. David Brodsky/Agent. Change to an approved plan. Applicant proposes to remove and replace non-historic shed, in kind adding Historic windows and door (from the main house). Motion to approve Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Susan Catling. Approved.

Expansion: Preliminary Report approval. Motion to approve as presented and send to the Massachusetts Historical Commission, Robbie Hutchison 2nd, Beverly Fearey. Approved

New/Old Business:

Minutes: 10.6.15 Carol, 2nd Bev. Approved.

Adjourned 5:25

Respectfully submitted:
Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved _____ 11.3.15