



## Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission

Post Office Box 5158

70 Main Street

Edgartown, MA 02539

# ~Historic District Commission~

## MINUTES

September 15, 2015



Members in attendance: James Cisek, Beverly Fearey, Edith Blake, Susan Catling, Ken Magnuson, Ann Floyd. Staff: Lucy Morrison.

Chairman Cisek called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM.

**4:00 PM – 34 South Summer St (20D-136) MV Preservation Trust. Mike Lynch- Agent. Replace black asphalt roof shingles and replace rotten trim with pre-primed pine painted white.**

Susan Catling recused herself from the meeting. Meg O'Connor, from the MV Preservation Trust, presented the application to replace the roof and repair other minor rot damage on the Vineyard Gazette building. There will be no change in the materials used; the roof will be done in the same basic black shingles. There was no record of when the roof was done last. Beverly Fearey moved to accept the application as presented. Robbie Hutchison seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

**4:01 PM – 22 North Water St (20D-214.2) CF House Inn, LLC. Patrick Ahearn- Agent. One story addition to create new retail shops and expand restaurant access; replace 36" white fence.**

Patrick Ahearn distributed the elevations, plot plans and pictures of the property. There will be no changes made to the front of the building. The addition would be on the Winter St side of the building. Currently, the only entrance to L'Etoile is shared with the Edgartown Inn, which has proven inefficient and confusing. Nevin Square has noticed a drastic decline in business since Vineyard Vines moved to North Water St. The proposed addition would provide storefront access to L'Etoile, independent of the inn, and space for two other retail shops. The new entrance to L'Etoile would allow for a handicapped accessible bathroom, which is currently not available. There would also be a covered pathway to serve as a service lane for deliveries to the three commercial establishments. The two other retail shops may help bring business back to Nevin Square. The application also includes installing a sidewalk, replacing a white picket fence and planting new trees. Mr. Ahearn stated that the application would make a subtle and important change for the functionality of the building and the public good.

Mr. Cisek expressed concerns about adding commercial space to a historic building in the middle of town. Mr. Ahearn stated that the property is located in the B-1 Commercial District, that the façade of the building will be preserved, and that the side of the building is not currently being utilized to its full potential. Robbie Hutchison agreed, that as is, the side of the building does not represent the personality of the building.

Mr. Ahearn stated that the commercial district is meant to have commercial activity, and to encourage business. He commented that providing the restaurant with street frontage and small shops will not overpower the historical nature of the building in any way.

Mr. Cisek stated that the application proposes a drastic change and urged the Commission to hold a public hearing and a site visit.

Robbie Hutchison noted that the proposed design was an interesting approach, and appreciated that the addition was kept to one story, so that the second story of the historic building would still be visible. Beverly Fearey agreed.

Ann Floyd moved to hold a public hearing and conduct a site visit. Edie Blake seconded, and the motion passed unanimously, 7-0.

### **New/Old Business: 2 Beach St**

Mr. Cisek explained that he attended the MVC meeting regarding 2 Beach St on August 24<sup>th</sup>, but there was no opportunity to speak. The MVC decided to refer the application to a public hearing on October 1<sup>st</sup>. The HDC will write a letter to the MVC explaining the reasons why the building should be preserved. Susan Catling stated that it was not clear that the HDC, or the state historic register, were obligated to do anything other than submit the application. She stated that Bricque's letter was vague, but expressed concern about the building being demolished. Edie Blake stated that the Beach St house represents that particular street at the time that it was built. She suggested that the HDC start with the history of the building, noting that it was made from debris from an old ice house, and find out where it was moved from. The Gazette article mentioned a book that may be helpful. Edie stated that a lot of houses were made from ice house debris, but that most were torn down by 1945. George Davis was present on behalf of the abutting neighbors. The HDC welcomed his comments. Mr. Davis suggested that the HDC have a strong statement with detailed reasoning about the need for historic preservation. He mentioned the case of 4 Beach St, the house next door, where the Planning Board conditioned that at least 25% of the structure be preserved for historic purposes. Mr. Davis encouraged the HDC to request similar conditions on this application, and suggested that an HDC member be present at the hearing to read the letter. Patrick Ahearn mentioned that he had reviewed the proposed plans, and noted that they were not radically different from what exists, and did not understand why the building could not be renovated instead of completely demolished. Mr. Cisek noted that there will not be another HDC meeting before the MVC hearing, and encouraged the

Commissioners to get together beforehand. Mr. Cisek decided that a letter will be written by October 1<sup>st</sup>.

**Minutes 9.1.2015**

Mr. Cisek was not present at the last meeting, and abstained from voting. Ken Magnuson moved to approve the minutes. Susan Catling seconded, and the minutes were unanimously approved, 6-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Cisek moved to adjourn. Ann Floyd seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 4:39 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,  
Lucy Morrison

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 10.6.15  
*Chairman*