



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158-70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155

~Historic District Commission~
MINUTES
August 18, 2015



Members in attendance: James Cisek, Beverly Fearey, Carole Berger, Edith Blake, Susan Catling, Robbie Hutchison & Ann Floyd. Absent: Ken Magnuson. Staff: Bricque Garber

Chairman Cisek called the meeting to order at 4:05 PM.

Public Hearing continued from 8.4.15. 124 N. Water St. (20D-274) Frank & James McKay TTE. Chuck Sullivan/Agent for Wilson Saville. Applicant proposes to remove shed and bunkhouse and deck and add an addition at the rear, add a porch & patio and relocate the driveway. Continued from 7.21.15. Mr. Sullivan provided an updated plan dated 8.10.15 which provides a change in the proposed widow's walk. He showed the site plan and reviewed the plan for changes to the house. Proposing to move the house 30" off the sidewalk, lifting the house by 12 inches and removing a porch, addition to the rear, new porch, new dormer and widow's walk & chimney. Mr. Sullivan noted, in response to concern about the widow's walk, it has been reduced by 15%, and the railing to be 20" with a revision of the post detail to reduce post by about a foot. Chimney added to match the current chimney, would not be operating as a chimney but will mask vent and exhaust pipes. There was some confusion regarding the proposed windows. For clarification the windows proposed are aluminum clad with wood sash, simulated True Divided Light similar to a Marvin or Pella. Mr. Saville spoke to the commissioners telling the commissioners that they own other historic properties (off Island) and have preserved buildings. Mr. Saville; "Why this project?" "it's about the view". He went on to explain that the house is severely neglected. And, they have been diligent in responding to HDC concerns about the plans for the house. They are undertaking this project as a family home. They believe the plan is in accordance with the neighborhood and original character of the house. He is seeking approval.

James Cisek opened the hearing for public comment. A letter was read from direct abutters, expressing concerns about the shade tree, the widow's walk, chimney and the scope of the renovation. Mr. Sullivan spoke to the tree concern expressing the desire of the owners, not to damage the tree. The plan is to begin the construction in the fall. Beverly Fearey asked about the elevation. Chuck said the added height elevation will be 12 inches. James Cisek asked how much of the original house will

remain. Chuck said all will remain except the porch. Mr. Sullivan noting the commission's concerns said that the widow's walk was lowered and will be reduced to 9x11. Discussion ensued re: the widows walk. Sarah Barbato spoke as a direct abutter on the south side, questioning the moving of the house. Her family has concerns regarding the windows, deck and widow's walk. Chuck said the widow's walk has been reduced so that only 2 or 3 chairs would fit on the deck. There being no further public comment, the public hearing part of hearing was closed.

Robbie Hutchison asked the neighbor's why they are concerned about moving the house back? It was noted that increasing the mass changes the profile of the neighborhood and the street. Chuck explained the disruption in the side walk is a primary reason for moving the house back. Susan Catling does not think it is appropriate to move the house to save the disruption of the sidewalk. Discussion ensued. James Cisek noted there is no guarantee that the sidewalk is not disrupted in the moving of the house. There was further discussion regarding moving the house back on the lot by 30 inches. Lively discussion ensued. Carole Berger thinks from a human standpoint the heavy sidewalk traffic can be intrusive and understands why they want to move it back a bit. Susan Catling noted Secretary of Interior guidelines and Ann Floyd said that the guidelines are recommendations and houses in Edgartown have been moved historically. Beverly Fearey and Carole Berger have done much research and noted that it is historically incorrect to have a widow's walk on this roof style. Ann feels that this widow's walk is not very visible but still struggles that it is not historical. Carole is very concerned by the widow's walk. She researched and there is no example of a widow's walk on this roof style having reviewed the current village and 200 pictures. Edith said that gable ends facing the street are inconsistent with widow's walks. Beverly asked for trim detail. There is a split in the board's recommendations regarding the widows walk. Carole noted that it is lower but it is not on the main body of the historic home but is still not historically correct for this house. The written history was read to the commission as provided by the current owner. James mentioned an email received from Ken Magnuson, who could not attend. Ken wrote that he is concerned about the widow's walk, as well. Robbie Hutchison made a motion to accept the current plans as presented with the height elevation to be one foot and the home to be moved back on the lot by 30 inches including the widows walk as revised. 2nd, Ann Floyd. 3 votes in favor: Ann Floyd, Robbie Hutchison & James Cisek. Opposed: Carole Berger, Susan Catling, Edith Blake & Beverly Fearey. Motion not approved. Carole Berger made a motion to approve as presented conditioned on: 1) the height elevation (from existing) of no more than 12 inches. 2) The house to be moved back from the sidewalk, no more than 30 inches and 3) Removal of the widow's walk from the plans. 2nd, Beverly Fearey. 4 votes in favor: Carole Berger, James Cisek, Robbie Hutchison & Beverly Fearey. Opposed: Susan Catling & Edith Blake & Ann Floyd. Motion Approved.

69 S. Water St. (20D-333) Continued from 8.4.15. James Shane. Bobby Fuller/Agent. Applicant proposes to install 10 solar panels on the roof of the porch. There was a site visit just prior to the meeting. Mr. Fuller appeared. Motion to approve as presented Beverly Fearey. 2nd, Carole Berger. Unanimously approved.

39 School St. (20D-138) Michael Smith. Jim Bishop/Agent. Applicant proposes to enclose screened porch openings with windows. Mr. Bishop explained that the owner wants to enclose the screened porch with windows. It was determined that this porch is not visible from the street. Motion to approve as presented Carole Berger, 2nd Ann Floyd. Approved.

38 N. Water St. (20D-216) Colonial Inn. Earl Matthews/Agent. Move exterior wall by 6 feet. Wesley Doyle, manager of the Colonial inn appeared to show photos and discuss the plan to move. It was noted that the wall is barely visible. Roof is planned to continue slope as existing. James Cisek noted a concern about continuing the roof at the current slope, having appropriate head room to be code. There was discussion regarding moving the conduit. Applicant requested to continue until the next meeting to confer with designer. Continued to September 1st. 2015.

100 Main St. (20D-58) Matt Dyroff. Applicant proposes to enclose side porch, add 3 windows and 1 door. Change to an approved plan. Not visible from a public way. Mr. Dyroff presented his plan to changes to the approved plans. He will be enclosing a very small porch and adding add 3 windows, a previously approved window will become the door. Old door to be used. Motion to approve Beverly Fearey. 2nd, Susan Catling. Approved.

New/Old Business:

Review window schedule– The window schedule for the Captain Warren House was reviewed and 62 approved.

Expansion Map. The map dated 8.11.15 was approved as the “final” map with one addition. (parcel 20C-8 just behind 20C-10).

Minutes: 8.04.15 Public hearing minutes: Motion to approve with a correction as to spelling, Robbie Hutchison, 2nd Susan Catling. Approved.

Motion to approve minutes of 8.4.15, Susan Catling. 2nd, Ann Floyd, Approved.

James made suggestion for a possible Facebook page for Historic District. Robbie suggested awards for folks for have done a great job with their homes (this was done in the past). Both suggestions will be discussed further at the next meeting.

Adjourned. 5:40

Respectfully submitted:
Bricque Garber

Approved _____ 9.1.15
Chairman