



Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: 508 627-6155

Website: www.Edgartown-ma.us

Email: HDC@edgartown-ma.us

Fax: 508 627-6173

Historic District Commission Public Hearing Regarding Proposed Expansion Minutes 7.14.15



Members in attendance: James Cisek, Carole Berger, Robbie Hutchison, Ken Magnuson, Susan Catling, Edith Blake & Beverly Fearey. Staff: Bricque Garber
There were 28 members of the public in attendance.

James Cisek called the meeting to order at 4:00PM and read the following: *The Historic District Commission is proposing an expansion to the current Historic District for the express purpose of preserving the landmarks and features that connect Edgartown with its historical roots. It is not the intention of the HDC to prevent growth but to allow for thoughtful consideration of change. The Historic District Commission does not want prevent changes nor do we prevent construction but rather help to guide changes, making sure the significant Edgartown homes are preserved. We are concerned, and recent demolitions have shown, that without an expansion of the district, many lovely homes will be lost forever through demolition and major alterations. We are interested in your views and want everyone to have an opportunity to speak.*

Mr. Cisek thanked Bricque, the HDC Assistant, for work on this project.

Public input regarding the expansion.

Ann Vose - Has a history on another Historic commission. She is happy to see expansion and wants more consideration of the view from the water which is a public way. She sees massive expansions in evidence in Edgartown. She would like to see expansion to beyond Beach to the end of Dunham Way.

Mildred Merritt - Question as to what was criteria for expansion area. James & Carole explained the desire for a clear boundary for signage. (You are now entering the Historic District) and that this additions will create a district more in line with the originally proposed district of 1987. The commission likes Peases Point Way as a clear a boundary line, though they noted that there are many 100+ year old homes that will still be outside the protection of the Historic District. It was noted that there may be modifications to the current proposed map. There was some discussion regarding the process for a demolition permit.

Chris Scott of 36 Pierce Lane. - Asked if this is a final map. He was told this is not the final map. Mr. Scott noted that Pierce Lane would be a good inclusion to the District. Commissioners agreed that pierce lane would be a great addition.

Ben Hall Sr. - Mr. Hall thinks there are more new reproductions than truly historic homes. Thinks they are lovely and believes that most people try to comply with historic precedent. He asked if zoning created the criteria. He noted that he had made relatively minor changes to

siding in the district and it took him a long time to gain approval and suggested that the HDC Administer be empowered to approve of minor changes, as the process can be lengthy for small repairs. He was told that such changes in the HDC structure were currently being implemented and some items could be “fast tracked”. Mr. Hall believes that most people will/and do respect the age of buildings. And, he believes that some “bold” personal expression in the district should be allowed. He suggested the addition of an architectural consultant. Susan Catling noted that over time a changed style ages and becomes part of the history of the town.

Trudy Carter – Noted that many small cottages have been torn down. Small cottage on summer was torn down. She hopes that this will not happen in the future. She wants to know what the HDC can do to enforce rules. Where are the “teeth”? There was discussion about a specific home that may have been demolished, perhaps in 2009? The members of the commission remember that it was not demo but there was a big renovation to the Arts and Crafts house. Homes are rebuilt and renovated as much as possible. Carole Berger noted that there are hearings for all major renovations. She further noted that what has happened on Fuller St. is terrible.

Dudley Cannada – Has worked with many Historic Districts including this one and finds that Edgartown is consistent and does a good job in considering renovations. He said that the HDC is effective in keeping the ‘new’ in context with the historic structures. Having worked with many historic commissions he finds this commission is reasonable and said they works well with the property owners. He thinks the current process it is working very well but has seen eight (17th and 18th century) amazing old buildings torn down as they did not have historic protections. There are many fine homes that are not protected and could be brought into the district.

Carole Berger said that this commission will talk about composite materials as the HDC is reconsidering some composites for some applications. She further noted that any home that will be newly included in Historic District will not be required to make changes. The HDC is sensitive to the concerns of those homeowners that will be included but do not have homes over 100 years. If a home was built in 1989 the HDC will look at renovations to be consistent with the existing home. This HDC is trying to preserve the historic nature of the town. There is no guarantee of the suitability of construction styles for renovations, for homes outside the district.

Diane Durawa - Her house will be included but the house across the street from her is being referred to the MV Commission to hear a demolition request. It was noted that it is procedure for homes not in HDC that are over 100 years to be referred to the MV Commission for demolition consideration.

Jay Kaufman- Noted there is controversy wants to have a walk around to see what homes may be included, and what houses are outliers.

Mr. Hall - Discussed color and thinks and noted there was a time when not all homes were white. Edith Blake described how homeowners mixed paint in early days (made from milk and corn husks, linseed oil and there were more colors. When she was a child there were pastel colored homes.

Gino Courtney – He has 10 buildings in the HDC. Over the years there have been changes in the processes of HDC and he feels it has improved over time and he supports moving on for bigger district. He thinks there might be advantage to the use of ‘new’ materials.

Maggie MacDowatt – She thinks there is a financial burden in being in the Historic District.

Ann Vose – Suggested that a notice be sent to potential buyers in the district.

Brian Byrne - Asked for a time line regarding for moving forward. Bricque explained the process of what needs to be done prior to a Warrant vote at the town meeting in April. It was decided to send a notice to all persons in the current and proposed district, notifying them of the continuation of this public hearing on August 11th.

The chairman asked if there were any other questions, there being none the Public Hearing was closed.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:49PM

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber
Assistant

Approved: _____ date _____
James Cisek, Chairman