

Edgartown Historic District Commission Meeting

April 7, 2015

Commissioners in attendance: Carole Berger Vice-Chair, Ken Magnuson, David Thompson, Robbie Hutchison, Edith Blake. Staff: Lucy Morrison

Carol Berger called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM.

Public Hearing: 28 South Summer St (20D-134) Amity LLC. VL Architect- Louis Lisboa and Gerrett Conover. Applicant proposes a 60% demolition and rebuild at the rear of building and construction of a 1,182 square foot two-story addition. New foundation and roof elevation. Carol gave the applicants the option to continue the hearing since there was not a full Commission present. The applicants decided to proceed and presented the plans. The Commission was concerned that the architecture of the addition overshadowed the original building. The applicants wanted the addition to be completely different from the original structure to help the original stand out from the new. The Commissioners understood, but did not want to see the addition over-embellished, and would prefer the applicants show reverence to the simplicity of the original architecture. The raised roof, trim, bump out windows, columns, and trellis over the garage entrance were questioned. Mr. Conover mentioned that the columns support the façade, but other options can be explored. Carole stated that the windows ought to match the main house. Research has indicated that the house may have been built as early as 1705, which would make it the oldest house in the center of the historic district. Bricque Garber took pictures of other houses and structures along South Summer St to show that this application is introducing a new concept, and that no other house has a garage directly on the street. Robbie Hutchison mentioned that the original house did not have a garage, since there were no cars or even electricity at the time of construction. The Commissioners urged the applicants to design the addition to honor the original structure, not compete with it, and remove some of the details. The Commissioners approved of the weathered shingles. Robbie noted that the proposed lighting fixtures blend well with the neighborhood, and do not need to be exactly the same as everyone else's. The windows will be wood painted white, and the shutters will be the typical mahogany painted dark green. Robbie Hutchison moved to continue the application to the next meeting. David Thompson seconded, and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

10 Main St (20D-323.1) Harborside Condominium Trust. CB Stark. Adam T. Inc- Agent. Applicant proposes install planter boxes, awnings & light fixtures. Adam Hayes presented more documentation on lighting and fixtures. There will be two lights shining up at the sign and another downward facing light over the door. Robbie claimed that the proposed downward lighting fixture was too contemporary, and asked if it came in a different finish. David agreed that the white finish was too busy. Carole mentioned that a hanging fixture would be more appropriate, since there is a good amount of space available. The Commissioners also thought that the spotlights were too big. The specifications showed a six-inch base with four-inch LED bulbs. Mr. Hayes suggested that it may be the picture that makes the spotlights appear so large. Ken stated that he didn't have a problem with the spotlights, but would like to see something different for the underneath light. The Commissioners

suggested a lantern style feature piece in a metal finish. The Commissioners approved of the choice of planters. Ken Magnuson moved to approve the spotlights and the planter. Robbie Hutchison seconded. Unanimously approved. The applicants will present awning info and umbrella fabric at the next meeting.

113 South Water St (29B-31) Vivek & Anne Kushwaha. Patrick Ahearn- Agent. Applicant proposes restoration of original home, add a basement and replace existing rear 1960's addition with new addition and replace existing shed with single car garage. A public hearing will be needed. Edith Blake commented that the fence in front is the best part of the house, and hopes that the applicants intend to keep it. Mr. Ahearn stated that the new owners of the home intend to do as much restoration as possible. The wing put on the back of the house in the 1960's will be replaced with a wing of a similar footprint, without the dormer. There will be a new foundation, and a full basement, but no change to the house itself; the original windows will be kept. The new foundation will be veneered in brick. A minor change will be made to the corner porch, where a window will become a square bay window for a better view of the harbor. At the rear of the property, there is an elongated shed that will be converted into a small garage to house a mini cooper. The large open yard will also remain. David Thompson commented that open space is becoming rare downtown. The Commissioners were glad that the new owners are keeping the whole house yellow and restoring the fence. Robbie Hutchison moved to refer the application to a public hearing. Ken Magnuson seconded. Unanimously approved.

6 South Water St (20D-188) Eugene Courtney. Applicant proposes a 25% demolition and renovation of multi-use building. The architect for this project has not been in touch with the applicants, so they are not prepared for this meeting. The application was continued to the next meeting.

2 Pierce Lane (20D-77) THC. LLC. Jonathan Parkes- Agent. Applicant proposes renovation, rear addition and pool. Ryan Newn, a representative for the architect, explained the plans. The house was built in 1870. The goal of the project is to preserve the historical parts of the house, and make the newer additions fade away. There is currently a three-foot fence on the corner of Peases Point Way and Pierce Lane; the cedar picket fence will be continued around the corner, and be raised to a six-foot fence along the back property line for privacy and to enclose the pool area. The roof, siding, and windows of an existing detached garage in corner of the property will be replaced to convert the structure into a pool house. Nothing will be done to the historic façades of the house, but one chimney will be demolished. The Commissioners decided the application would need a public hearing. Robbie mentioned that there are significant changes in grade on the site. Carole noted that the plans make the house look better, and more balanced than what is there currently. She recommended that the applicants bring larger plans on foam boards for the hearing. Robbie asked about the windows. Mr. Newn stated that the windows were not original, and will not be saved. The replacements are Marvin integrity fiberglass with white exterior and wood interior. The Commissioners stated that there are no sizeable objections to the project. Robbie Hutchison moved to bring the application to a public hearing. Ken Magnuson seconded. Unanimously approved. The Commissioners would like to see specifications

on the new windows, as well as examples of the trim, gutters, fencing and garage doors. They also recommended that the lighting fixtures be more traditional and less nautical than what was presented.

Minutes: Ken Magnuson moved to approve the minutes. Robbie Hutchison seconded. Unanimously approved.

David Thompson announced that he will not signing up for another term on the Commission. A discussion of the historic district expansion ensued.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:50 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

Lucy Morrison

Approved: _____ 4.21.14

James Cisek, Chairman