

Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~
Minutes 

Thursday November 3, 2016

Members in attendance: Susan Catling-Chairman, Christopher Scott, Edith Blake, Carole Berger, Robbie Hutchison, Ken Magnuson, Cassie Bradley, Julia Celeste (A).

4:00 - PUBLIC HEARING: 16 Pent Lane (20D-50) Chuck Sullivan/agent. Applicant proposes a 100% demolition of the existing house and reconstruction of new single family home.

Hearing the continuation of this application: Susan Catling, Robbie Hutchison, Carole Berger, Cassie Bradley, Edith Blake & Julia Celeste. There was a site visit just prior to this hearing. Chairman Catling read the Public Hearing Notice. She noticed the room that the applicant would present first then the hearing will be opened to the public for remarks both in favor (first) and then opposed.

Chuck Sullivan, as agent for the applicant, made his presentation of the plans for a complete demolition and construction of a new single family home. Mr. Sullivan noted that the plans have changed since they were first introduced to the HDC. He reviewed the site plan and noted that the new plan saves part of the original house as a shed and noted that this piece is likely the original structure. He described the house as approx. 18 feet from the front of the property line noting that the house at 18 Pent Ln. is 5 ft from the line. The roof height has come down to 29'6" and the garage was moved to the other side of the building. He compared the height with neighboring houses. The house plan was flipped from the original plan. Plans were given to the members. Edith Blake noted that there is no chimney on the plans to which Mr. Sullivan said a chimney can be added.

Susan Catling opened the meeting to the public. David and Mary Ellen Croteau, new owners of 18 Pent lane have significant concerns as to the proposed size and location. Mr. Croteau discussed the concerns provided a slide presentation (including handouts) and a shadow study. Noting the unique character of variety of homes in the village and describing density, he

noted his objection to the project as it is currently drawn. He referenced the guidelines of the commission. He noted that there are 114 properties that are of a similar age saying "I think the age is important." He described the building ratio to land and noted the relationship of density in the village from the center to the perimeter. Mr. Croteau suggested that any house on Pent Ln. should be 2,000 sq. ft. or less. The Croteau's did a shadow study showing that this new construction overshadows 18 Pent as well as the Stewartia tree, throughout the year, which conflicts with the HDC guidelines, that new construction should not overshadow existing homes. The current house at 16 does not cast a shadow over 18 pent. There was further discussion regarding the that large Stewartia tree, which is listed on the Polly Hill Arboretum walking tour. The concern is both that it will get no sunshine and that the proposed construction may harm the root system as it violates the drip line. He displayed the proposed footprint, superimposed on Google Earth map. Mr. Croteau further noted that guidelines specify that any addition should be subordinate to the existing house and strongly believes this proposed construction is simply too dense for this lot. Chuck Sullivan in rebuttal, noted that the house is not historic given its age. He described very large houses in the neighborhood and noted that this house is only 4-5 ft taller than two existing houses on the street. He noted that this house is about 2300 sq. ft. without the attic or the basement. He said that accommodations have been made to respect the tree and the neighborhood. There was discussion back and forth between Mr. Sullivan and Mr. Croteau regarding height and width and the attached garage with room above. Chuck Sullivan was asked by Mary Ellen Croteau about the critical root zone of the tree. Chuck Sullivan said he is not an arborist but would gladly retain an arborist if requested to do so by the HDC.

Bricque read a letter from John and Judith Tankard in opposition to the application. Susan Catling provided some HDC background. She discussed the history of the expansion that has promised protections of houses within the district. She read from the bylaw Standards of review and the HDC Guidelines and provided a chart showing a sampling of homes and sq. footage in the immediate area. There being no further public comment, Chairman Catling closed the public hearing.

Members reviewed photos provided by Susan and Susan noted that the lots are slightly larger and the houses are slightly smaller. Robbie does **not** think that the original building is sufficient in size and noted the use of original bldg. to be maintained as a shed. She is not very concerned with the street set back but the overall size of the house is the "elephant in the room". Carole Berger noted that the shadowing was well illustrated and made a good argument that the house is too big. Julia Celeste is concerned with the loss of

the open, green space in front. It was noted that normally the attention of the HDC is to features rather than size as is this case here and little attention has been paid to the actual house plans. Carole Berger made a motion to deny the application and Edith Blake provided a 2nd. The applicant asked, before the vote, to continue the application. The commission agreed and the application was continued to Dec. 6, 2016, as the agenda for the meeting on 11.16.15 has been closed. Applicant will provide any plan changes prior to Dec. 6, 2016. It was noted that if there is a significant change to the plans another public hearing will be warranted.

4:15 – 73 N. Water (20D-289) Brian Mann. Applicant proposes to construct a 6 ft. fence at the rear side of the property. Mr. Mann could not attend the hearing. Bricque provided the pictures and a sample of the Klear composite material sold at Cottles. It was noted that the fence is in the rear side of the property and will run along the current bush/tree line. Motion to approve as presented as a stick built fence to be painted Dark green, Ken Magnuson. 2nd. Robbie Hutchison. Unanimously approved.

New/Old Business:

Public gathering to erect new HDC sign. 11.12.16 @ noon. Members will gather in front of the Harborview to place the 1st of 3 sign posts and celebrate the achievement of the expansion of the HDC.

Change of meeting day discussion will be continued.

Restored 1855 Hand Tub at Fire Station today. Members encouraged to go see it.

Minutes 10.4.16 Motion to approve the minutes Ken Magnuson. Julia Celeste provided the 2nd. Approved.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber
Assistant

Approved: _____ 11.15.16
Susan Catling, Chairman