

# Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.  
Edgartown, MA 02539  
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

## ~Historic District Commission~ Minutes



Thursday, December 21, 2017

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott- Chairman. Susan Catling-Vice Chairman, Edith Blake, Cassie Bradley, Minah Worley (A). Absent: Julia Celeste, Edith Blake & Ken Magnusson. Staff: Bricque Garber

Chairman Scott called the meeting to order at 4:00. There being a quorum in attendance.

**104 Main St. (20D-56)** Former Point Way Inn. RJH Realty Trust. Chuck Sullivan/Agent. Change to an approved plan. Applicant proposes to add a new dormer, add new exterior door and remove partition on 3<sup>rd</sup> floor balcony. Mr. Sullivan presented the changes to the approved plan noting necessary code changes including a door and walkway to provide for egress. This door is visible from Pent Lane. Asking for a change from approved shed roof to a gable roof to allow for headroom in the interior. On the first floor on Pent Lane side both windows will be egress and there is a further change to window configuration moving an upper window slightly. Christopher asked for drawings illustrating the changes. Mr. Sullivan said 3<sup>rd</sup> floor changes inc. elimination of a 3<sup>rd</sup> floor the partition wall. Comments: Chairman Scott noted that this building has undergone much modification over time and these plans are not inconsistent with the bylaws or guidelines. Carole Berger concurred. There were no further comments from the members. Motion to approve the changes as presented, Susan Catling. 2<sup>nd</sup>. Carole Berger. Approved.

**56 S. Water St. (210D-178)** Ann & Warren Vose. Joe Grillo/agent. Applicant proposes to add a 12x16 open porch, accessible through French doors and replace kitchen French doors to match. Warren Vose attended to discuss the plans for the open porch area. Mr. Vose is requesting the addition of 1, 2 over 2 second floor window to match existing windows (shown on the plan). Discussion ensued and photos were shown the members. Members did not think this needed a public hearing. Christopher Scott made the motion to approve, pending approval of the door & window manufacturer, style and description to be provided by the applicant. Christopher noted that this porch is an addition to a previous modification and is in keeping with the guidelines. 2<sup>nd</sup>. Minah Worley. Approved.

**22 North Water St. (20D-214.2)** 22 North Water St. Trust. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Continued from 11.16.17. Applicant proposes to construct a 16x22, free standing, retail building at the western corner of the N. Water side of the property. Mr. Ahearn could not attend but provided a letter requesting that this application be moved forward to a public

hearing. It was noted that the plans were reviewed by Mr. Jason, the Zoning Authority. Mr. Jason determined that this application would have to be heard by the Zoning Board of Appeals regarding size, setback and parking. After some discussion, it was moved that this application be referred to ZBA prior to scheduling a public hearing of the HDC. Motion to continue until ZBA hears the application, Chris Scott. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Susan Catling. Moved to send to ZBA for approval prior to scheduling an HDC public hearing.

**8 Peases Pt. Way S. (20D-19)** John Ettinger & Linda Simpson. Phil Regan/agent. Applicant proposes to relocate the existing 840 sq. ft. 1½ story historic house and renovate & convert to a garage and guest house. Demolition of the 20<sup>th</sup> century additions to historic house, demolition of the existing carriage house. Construction of a new 2 story 6,676 sq. ft. house. Mr. Regan appeared to present the application and the plans for the renovation of the Historic House and the new construction. A brief history concerning a previous application for demolition and new construction was provided by Mr. Regan. Mr. Regan showed the members elevations and a site plan. It was noted that the proposed plan does involve a change of curb cut. It was acknowledged that the curb cut will require Planning Board approval.

The site plan illustrates the repurposed historic house with a 20 ft. setback but noted that the house is currently setback 12 feet. There was discussion regarding leaving the existing house at the 12 feet set back. The assistant has discussed the setback with Lenny Jason, Building Inspector & Zoning Agent. Mr. Jason has indicated that he would approve of the 12 ft. setback for the existing house.

Mr. Regan explained the plans for the new house and noted the roof lines illustrate what may have been changes over time, making the new house appear more consistent with old houses that have been added onto over time. The site plan was explained in detail. Members reviewed the plans for the new house designs. It was noted that this design makes a “nod” to the original house. Mr. Regan showed all the elevations for the repurposed historic home as it becomes the new carriage house, illustrating the proportions and all detailing. There was some concern and discussion about the treatment of the sidelights at the front door and chimneys (specifically the chimney caps) on the new house. Mr. Regan noted ongoing consideration of changes to the chimney caps and front doors. Mr. Regan will provide an updated plan by January 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2018. The necessity of a public hearing was noted and the first available date will be January 18, 2018. Mr. Regan will provide final plans prior to public notice for the hearing. Susan Catling asked about the existing chimney on the historic house and noted a preference of the HDC to retain chimneys. Mr. Regan said it can remain though not functional. Susan noted the front door as not being typical for a Greek revival house. Mr. Regan noted his reasoning for choosing the different style door to illustrate that it is not truly an old house. Members and Mr. Regan discussed the 12 foot setback as a good idea as it helps to illustrate the distinction and influence of the historic ‘Box’. Discussion ensued. Mr. Regan described picket fencing to be typical and he is investigating composite fencing materials and fence makers, or it will be white, painted cedar. Christopher Scott sees the

compromise as a good idea for this project and commends the retention of open/green space. In a discussion regarding the materials, Phil Regan described the possible use of ‘dipped shingles’ for the side walls of the new house. These are wooden shingles that are stained. The elevation facing Pease’s Pt. Way will be sided with wood clapboards. In further discussion of the siting of the buildings and the green space, Minah Worley noted the current pull out into traffic is problematic, as owners must back out on to Main St. Motion to send to public hearing on January 18, with addition, to the plans, of discussed changes to be provided by Jan 2<sup>nd</sup>, including a proposed 12ft set back, Christopher Scott. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Cassie Bradley. Approved to send to public hearing on January 18, 2018. There will be a site visit prior to the hearing.

**New/Old Business:**

*\*May include matters not reasonably anticipated within 48 hours of meeting.*

**Minutes:** December 7, 2017. The minutes were not approved as the required quorum was not present.

Adjourned: 5:09

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber  
Assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ January 18, 2018