

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~

Minutes

Thursday, May 4, 2017



Members in attendance: Susan Catling-Chairman, Carole Berger, Christopher Scott, Julia Celeste, Cassie Bradley, Edith Blake, Ann Floyd (A). Absent: Robbie Hutchison.

Staff: Bricque Garber

Chairman Catling called the meeting to order at 4:19.

Public Hearing: 8 South Water St. (20D-188). Eugene Courtney. Applicant proposes to dismantle existing structure and rebuild. Chairman Catling read the Public Hearing Notice. There was a site visit prior to the meeting. Mr. Courtney explained his plan for the property and exhibited plans and photos. It was noted that Mr. Healy has updated his engineering report. Cassie Bradley is recused from hearing this application. Mr. Courtney discussed the old glass and does not think the reuse of the glass would be energy efficient but noted the transom could be reworked with the original glass. It is not thought that the current transom is historic. Susan Catling does not see the need to redo the transom/date unknown/as it is intact. Ann suggested that just the windows on the first floor be old glass panes. Gino said that he has identified a total of 7 pieces are wavy glass currently existing in the building. There was discussion regarding the window placement. Julia asked if the current configuration of windows and spacing could be maintained as the drawing does not show the windows as correctly spaced, per the current configuration. Chris discussed configuration and Gino said it was no problem to configure as it is. Susan noted that while some of the glass may not be original, the house dates from 1775 so much of the glass is old. Carole noted that in many restorations the old glass has been used for those street facing windows on the first floor. Susan noted interior storms are available for energy efficiency and mentioned the Jonathan Monroe house noting the 2 lower windows kept the original glass. Ann suggested that only 2 windows be done with old glass. Julia Celeste concurred with Ann. There was discussion about the door on the right side facing the bank - door vs. window.

Carole questioned the retention of the Foundation blocks on the front. Gino said they may hold up but may crumble during construction. Chris noted existing building trim is quite wide and application does not show the wide trim, he would like to see the trim package, replicate what is currently there. Chris Scott noted this drawing looks like new construction and does not replicate the existing house very successfully. Chris suggested the applicant work with the designer to create a new drawing that will duplicate the existing building. Members noted that they are looking for changes on the front of the building to more closely reference the existing historic building with clapboard on the front, shingles on the side. The foundation was further discussed as was the location of a wheelchair ramp. Julia Celeste asked about fence materials. Susan opened the hearing for public comment. James Joyce said that the MV commission should hear this application as the building is over 100 years old. It was explained to Mr. Joyce,

that this application does not need to be referred to the MV Commission as it is located within the historic district. Mr. Joyce was asked by the applicant if he had been instructed by the Commission to request the referral. He said that he had talked to the Commission. Patrick Ahearn noted his thinking that the replication of the primary façade is a good solution. There being no further public comment, the public hearing was closed. Motion to continue this application to the next meeting to allow for a revised plan regarding: window spacing, trim materials and sizes, foundation, glass, change of door to window and siding singles to clapboard, Ann Floyd. 2nd, Julia Celeste. Voted to Continue to 5.18.17.

Public Hearing: 1 Dock St. (20D-322) Edgartown Yacht Club. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes to raise the existing dining room bldg. 24 inches to meet FEMA regulations, add shed dormers, add chimneys, remove side vents, addition of handicap access. Chairman Catling read the Public Hearing Notice. There was a site visit prior to the meeting. Mr. Ahearn explained plan for the property and displayed plans and photos. Patrick described the project as drawn, noting there is no change to snack bar part/on ground, the middle part is being reconstructed and the dining room is being lifted 2 feet. There is an addition of a small balcony and dormers as well as chimneys for venting. It is currently vented out the side of the building. Ann noted that the shingles are interesting. Patrick noted that they will not be changed. Susan opened the hearing for public comment. There was no public comment and the public hearing was closed. Julia Celeste is concerned about the addition of balconies. Patrick noted a long roof with no break in the long shed roof line without the dormers. Christopher Scott noted that this represents a lot of change to the building but that there has been much change to this building over the years. Carole Berger made the motion to approve. 2ⁿ. Ann Floyd. Unanimously approved.

124 N. Water (200D-274) Patrick Ahearn/agent. Change to approved plan. Applicant proposes addition of a 2nd floor railing. Change of some trim material from wood to composite, siding to be clapboard painted white & windows to be Pella STDL. Mr. Ahearn explained that the proposed railing was removed from the approved plan but now the parties would like to add it back noting their thinking that it will look better with the railing noting that it now appears, to the applicant, to have an unfinished look. The rail is decorative only on the front of the house, this is not a porch. It was explained that the original application was provided by another prospective buyer and designer and was changed for a subsequent owner and different architect and builder. The current builder was not aware that the original application called out wood trim and Mr. Rosbeck used a mix of wood and composite for the trim and railings. Edith thought the 2nd floor rail looked a bit heavy and Mr. Ahearn noted that the columns are not trimmed out below which may account for the heavy appearance. Mr. Rosbeck provided an update (from the original Sullivan list) and provided a updated materials list which includes an upgraded Pella windows, porch decking in mahogany, lanterns, brick chimney with stone cap, Pella balcony door, wood window casing to match existing, clapboard siding (painted white), railings, brackets and posts are wood and composite (painted white). Motion to approve as submitted. Julia Celeste. 2nd Christopher Scott. Unanimously approved.

19 Church (20D-116.1) John Roberts. Joe Montero/agent. Applicant proposes a 4 ft. Picket fence around outdoor dining area. Continued from 3.16.15. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. Mr. Montero defined the area of proposed for a 4 ft. fence at the site visit. The new fencing will match existing, as pictured. Mr. Montero discussed the fencing. All street facing and gate, will be 36" match the existing on left. Property line fence matches the fence to the

right side and will be 30” to match existing. Chris discussed finials and members requested the use of a standard square with 4 sided shallow pyramid style top rather than ball. Ann noted that existing front facing (ramp fence) is peeling and would benefit from sanding the varnish or perhaps pressure washing. The applicant said that he would sand, scrape or pressure wash to correct the peeling. Motion to approve with standard square finials-natural left to weather, Chris Scott. 2nd, Julia Celeste. Approved

96 Main St. (20D-59) ARC Design. Steve Pogue/agent. Applicant proposes to demo rear addition, build new rear addition, dig new full basement, move existing garage to make into cabana/garden pavilion. Mr. Pogue displayed his plans for the renovation of this home. He showed the plans that have been reworked since his pre-applicant discussion. He showed updated facades. The lap pool has been removed from the ZBA site plan. Cassie Bradley asked about skylights and Mr. Pogue said that there are skylights. Ann Floyd asked about windows on the first floor. Windows discussion regarding mullion patterns ensued. Steve Pogue said he is open to changes in mullion style. Chris Scott asked the rationale for the change in mullion patterns. Mr. Pogue explained his thinking that these windows match the side windows. There was discussion regarding the upper round window. Susan noted that the round window is Federal style. Motion to send to Public Hearing, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Chris Scott. Approved to send to public hearing, with site visit before meeting, on June 1. 2017.

2 S. Water St. (20D-202) Edgartown National Bank. Gregory Knight/agent. Applicant proposes to replace ATM with new Rockland Trust Bank ATM. Mr. Knight described the modest change from one ATM machine to another to accommodate the changes of Bank to Rockland. The signage for Edgartown National Bank will remain in place. Motion to Approve. Julia. 2nd, Ann. Voted to approve.

53 S. Water St. (20D-330.3) Paul & Jacquelyn Ronan. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Conover Restorations/agent. Applicant proposes to add a street facing gable, change rear stairs, remove garage door & replace with windows, add pool and cabana. Carole Berger recused herself. Mr. Ahearn presented plans for the project. Patrick made presentation and described the history as a house built about 20 years ago. He noted that the garage access is down slope and is very difficult so has not been usable for the owner. Applicant wants to remove the garage door and add a service door for bike storage etc. The rear of the property has a large covered porch and small boat shed. Applicant proposes to add a small pool and change the rear staircase to the side. Addition of an open air pavilion and removing the existing storage building to create a cleaner view from the Harbor and to the Harbor. Red cedar shingles on the roof and white trim to match existing. Ann Floyd likes the boat house would like to see it stay. Motion to send to public hearing with site visit before Julia Celest. 2nd, Ann Floyd. Voted to send to Public Hearing. June 1. 2017.

54 Fuller St. (20B-95.1) 52 Fuller LLC. Harry Garvey/agent. Applicant proposes to add a 9 x 16’ pool pavilion and 2 gates to existing fence. Ann Floyd left the meeting. Mr. Garvey presented and the application and photos were reviewed by the members. It is a new house they want to add the cabana, continue the fencing and add gates. There is a 6 ft. fence on the property line with the Harbor view. Chris asked if there should be a site visit. Julia does not think it will be very visible and thinks only the top of the pool pavilion might be visible. Motion to approve as presented, Chris Scott. 2nd, Julia Celeste. Approved.

17 & 25 N. Summer (20D-342) Corrected as to address from S. to N. Village Green Condo. Janet Heath/agent. Applicant proposes to replace 4 doors to match existing. Wood solid doors painted green. Motion to Approve- Julia Celeste. 2nd, Cassie Bradley. Approved

5:20 - 61 Davis Lane (20D-44). Squire Rushnell . Kevin Cusack/agent. Applicant proposes addition of 2 lamp posts & gas lanterns. Bringing in the gas lanterns has been time involved, beginning with a renovation, when the house was not part of the HDC. Kevin Cusack made the presentation and showed photographs. Motion to Approve, Chris Scott. 2nd, Julia Celeste. Approved. Mrs. Berger left the meeting.

9 Norton St. (20C-190.2) Katherine Putnam. Michael Carroll/agent. Fullers Energy/agent. Applicant proposes to remove one story studio and replace with 2 story addition. Add solar panels to SE Side of roof. Katherine Putnam discussed the addition including the removal of the chimney. Susan recommended keeping the chimney as chimneys are quite important in maintaining the character of the village. Ms. Putnam said that it (chimney) would be an obstruction to the solar array. Julia Celeste, too, discussed the chimney and the character of chimneys in Edgartown. Katherine Putnam said that it (chimney) is not visible from the front of the house. Bobby Fuller for Fullers Energy discussed the addition of the bank of solar panels that are to be placed on the dormer and noted that there is no sidewalk on that side of the street. Cassie asked about retaining the chimney in another location on the roof. Katherine said it would require support. Julia suggested the preservation or addition of a non-working chimney to preserve the feel of the village. Motion to send to public hearing with site visit on June 1, 2017, Cassie Bradley. 2nd, Chris Scott. Voted to send to public hearing on June,1.17.

New/Old Business:

Election of Chairman and Vice-Chairman.

Motion to appoint Christopher Scott as Chairman and Susan Catling as Vice-Chairman, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Cassie Bradley. Approved.

Minutes 4.6.17 – There not being a quorum of members who attended this meeting, approval of the minutes will be postponed to the meeting on 5.18.17.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber

Approved: _____ 5.18.17
Christopher Scott, Chairman