

Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~

Minutes

Thursday, March 16, 2017



Members in attendance: Susan Catling - Chairman, Carole Berger, Edith Blake, Christopher Scott, Ann Floyd (A). Absent: Ken Magnuson, Cassie Bradley & Robbie Hutchison. Staff: Bricque Garber.

Chairman Catling called the meeting to order at 4:00.

~~**32 S. Winter (20D-347.115)** Dorothea Morgan. Megan Brown/agent. Applicant proposes to extend patio area & extend fence. Continued from March 2. *This application was withdrawn by the applicant prior to this meeting.*~~

17 Church (20D-116.2) Carole McManus. Raphael Magri/agent. Applicant proposes to replace 2 awning windows and cedar wall shingles. Mr. Magri presented his plan to replace the 2 windows and re-side one wall with cedar shingles. Motion to approve. Christopher Scott. 2nd, Ann Floyd. Approved.

61 S. Summer (20D-164) Gerret Conover/agent. Applicant proposes to remove rotted stockade fence and replace with board & lattice fence, painted white. Motion to approve as presented, Carole Berger. 2nd, Ann Floyd. Approved

19 Church (20D-116.1) John Roberts. Joe Monteiro/agent. Applicant proposes a 4 ft. Picket fence around outdoor dining area. Joe Monteiro described the fence proposed to define an outdoor eating area. Susan asked questions about the appearance of the loading dock area. Christopher asked about the existing fencing and which of the two proposed fences he is planning to duplicate. The applicant said it is his intention to avoid 3 fence styles but is unsure if the new fence can be exactly the same as the current pictured fence. It is his plan to match the existing fence as close as possible and paint it white. There was a discussion as to the location of the fence and the landscaping. Carole brought up the unsightly area at the loading dock. Discussion ensued. Applicant said the loading dock area is not part of the area he is leasing but assured the commission that the dumpster will be disguised. The new business will be called Wash Ashore Beer Tap and Oyster Bar which will be housed in the small building which is currently called Isola In and Out. Carole proposed a site visit to establish the location of the proposed fence. 2nd, Ann Floyd. Continued for site visit on 4.6.17. Applicant was asked to use a string to define the area for the site visit.

38 N. Water (20D-216) Chesca's. James McDonough/agent. Applicant proposes to remove and replace 2 large windows facing N. Water St. Wesley Doyle addressed the replacement of the 2 windows. Window style was discussed by the contractor, Jamie McDonough which is a Marvin from the Commercial line. The window has simulated TDL mullions. Motion to approve, Ann Floyd. 2nd, Edith Blake Voted to approve.

96 Main St.(20D-59) Steve Pogue/agent. Pre-application discussion regarding NEW plan for (a previously approved) renovation. The existing approved plans are being replaced. Steve Pogue showed the new plan elevations. The existing addition in the rear will be removed and a new addition constructed. Looking for feedback, Mr. Pogue asked members for questions. The pool was discussed. It was noted that the previous planned pool was not approved by ZBA. Christopher Scott said that he always thought that the current addition, to the right, was 'stumpy'. He likes the fact that the new addition does not go to the roof line peak and thinks the second Empire roof line is interesting. Mr. Scott said that he likes the way it will present on Main St.. Ann Floyd asked about the 2 roof lines as viewed from the rear. Mr. Pogue was using the gable roof to give a sense of reducing the scale. There was a discussion about the additions style changes from federalist to cottage style. Mr. Pogue noted that it is intentionally reading as an obvious addition to a Federalist style house. Carole sees this plan as more balanced but noted that the simplicity of the original house is lost with this complicated addition. Carole said she would like to see it kept a bit more simple, as it draws the eye toward the addition away from the historic box. Susan Catling feels the site visit will be helpful to better determine the scale and design on the streetscape but would likewise like to see some unification between historic house and the addition.

6 Fuller St. (20D-86) Christopher Kiersted. Clay Edwards/agent. Applicant proposes to remove asphalt roof over bump-out (8x8) & replace with standing seam copper roof. Mr. Kiersted presented is plan for replacing the small roof. He discussed and provided pictures of neighboring homes with similar copper roofs. Move to approve, Carole Berger. 2nd, Ann Floyd. Approved.

5:10 – 25 Simpson's Lane (20D-224.2) John Chirgwin. Heidi Raihofer/agent. Applicant proposes to remove stockade fence & replace with board fence. Lightkeepers Inn. Heidi presented her plan for replacing the 'falling-down' stockade fence. The new board fence was largely seen as an improvement over the stockade fence. The applicant would like a solid fence as it is their desire to block the view of neighboring buildings. Motion to approve, Chris Scott. 2nd, Carole Berger. Approved.

Main St. (20D-317) Wallace & Co. Leo De Oliveria/agent. Applicant proposes to replace the 36 x 60 window above front door (Santander Bank). Leo presented the plans and window tear sheet. Motion to approve as presented. Chris Scott. 2nd, Ann Floyd. Approved.

8 S. Water (20D-188) Eugene (Gino) Courtney. Applicant proposes to disassemble, install a foundation and rebuild utilizing salvageable materials. Gino Courtney discussed the poor condition of the existing building and provided a structural engineer's report from Kent Healy describing the building as being in "Very poor condition". Mr, Courtney thinks that the building has, maybe, one more year of

use due to the poor condition. The building structure is riddled with beetles and rot. This building was originally a twin of the building that was reconstructed, last year, at 6 S. Water. Mr. Courtney asked the board members for feedback regarding his plans: Chris Scott said he is sympathetic with condition of the building and looking at this building he sees rich detail in the fenestration, and would like to see the windows and doors stay where they are and would like to see the front detail reproduced. He noted that there is much historic detail around the door, specifically, and that should be preserved. Members agreed with Mr. Scott and promoted the use of a shed dormer rather than those drawn in the current plan. Carole Berger said she sees a shed dormer as a better choice. It was noted that the existing windows are 6x6. Mr. Scott said the 6x6 would be a better choice as they are period appropriate. Carole discussed the lack of shutters on the plan and noted that as the new #8 is not a 'twin' to #6 so the shutters could be added and asked for that consideration. Carole and Ann, too, would like shutters added. Members were unanimous in their thinking that the current fenestration at the front door should be respected. It was suggested that Mr. Courtney save the current transom window over the front door and replace it on the new facade. Gino read an interesting letter (date unknown) to the board concerning a long past demolition that resulted in a parking lot, rather than a reconstruction. Motion to send to public hearing Christopher Scott. Ann Floyd provided the 2nd. Approved for public hearing on April 20th, 2017. There will be a site visit prior to the hearing.

New/Old Business:

2 Beach St. Members were updated on the project for demolition and new construction that was approved by the planning board prior to the expansion of the historic district. The applicant has obtained a demolition permit but is only now applying for a building permit. The members were polled for their opinions regarding an HDC review of the construction plans, now that it is in the district and has not been reviewed by this body. The members voted unanimously that the new construction plans for 2 Beach St. should be presented to the HDC for approval.

The Yellow House: Members were advised that there will be a Public Forum to discuss the Yellow House on Wednesday 3.22.17 at 5:30 in the Selectman's meeting room. Members were encouraged to attend.

Minutes 3.02.14

Motion to approve to minutes: Carole Berger. 2nd. Christopher Scott. Approved.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber

Approved: _____ 4.6.17
Susan Catling, Chairman