

**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.  
Edgartown, MA 02539  
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

# ~Historic District Commission~

## MINUTES

Thursday, February 16, 2017



Members in attendance: Susan Catling - Chairman, Carole Berger, Cassie Bradley, Christopher Scott, Robbie Hutchison, Edith Blake, Julia Celeste (A), Absent: Ken Magnuson. Staff: Bricque Garber. Julia Celeste is the alternate for Mr. Magnuson.

Chairman Catling brought the meeting to order at 4:00.

**4:00 Public Hearing –78 Peases Pt. Way North (20B-58.1)** Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes demolition of existing house and construction of a 4 bedroom home and carriage house + pool. Chairman Catling read the public hearing notice. There was a site visit just prior to this hearing. Mr. Ahearn presented his plans for the demo and new construction on the large computer screen. Mr. Ahearn noted a plans change from the original 3 car garage to a two car with pedestrian walkway. He noted that this property is owned by the same owner as the next door property. He said that the structure is not a traditional historic structure and that an interior leak reveals plywood and framing has been changed over time. Mr. Ahearn said that as a compromise his client is willing to move the house to the rear of the property to be considered as a small cottage or guest house. He stated that moving forward with the carriage house is the primary goal of the owner. He said that he thinks moving the house to the rear is a reasonable compromise and noted that the move of the existing house would replace the proposed new 4 bedroom house. Susan asked about the reason for the demolition is it 'lack of historic significance' or is it structural deterioration. Mr. Ahearn stressed his contention that this is not a historic house based upon current condition and construction materials. He said that the opening in the 3 car garage (pedestrian walkway) allows access to view the house in the rear. He said that he disagrees with the Chairwoman's Perspective that the house is historic. Christopher Scott asked, "So you are not now asking for demolition? Mr. Ahearn said, "Not if we move the house." Susan Catling asked how the house would be visible from the public way, behind the carriage house. Mr. Ahearn said you would see it across the lot.

The meeting was opened for Public comment: Three daughters of Rosalie Bassett, Ann Bassett, Lee Bassett Domont and Polly Basset, attended the meeting. Ann

Bassett, provided a detailed history of the house and showed a photographic montage illustrating the history of the house and the family ownership going back generations. Ms. Bassett noted her belief that the story and history of the house are not incumbent upon construction materials. She said the history of the house is long, noting that this is the house in which her mother was born and died and was originally built in this location though moved back on the lot in approximately 1969, as a car had hit the house. Mr. Daniel Santangelo attended the meeting and discussed the orientation of the house. He voiced concern about the orientation of the historic house verses a new construction project. Chairman Catling noted her concerns regarding visibility of the historic home if the house is moved to the rear of the lot and thinks that any view of the house will be very limited. Patrick Ahearn, again, asserted his firm opinion of the lack of historic value of the house. Susan Catling asserted her belief that this house and its history of an immigrant family, from the Azores, are very important to the village. Patrick said that the historic district is not a museum. Ms. Catling countered that this town is a walking museum and preserving historic streetscapes is the most important charge of the HDC. A discussion ensued with Mr. Ahearn maintaining that that one could see the house at a distance at the rear of the lot. Patrick noted that the owner paid 1.5 million dollars and there was no covenant in the sale, to keep the house in place. Patrick said that he thinks this application to HDC is a courtesy as his application to ZBA preceded the expansion of the HDC. It was noted, however, that the application to ZBA was made near the end of the appeal period and well after approval of the state Attorney General. The applicant could not have obtained approvals and a building permit prior to the formal confirmation of the expanded HDC.

Christopher Scott moved the discussion to the size of the lot and discussed a previous project where the HDC continued the application for construction on an undersized lot, until the decision of the Zoning Board of Appeals was rendered. Chris further noted that we need to see an application showing this commission that you have a lot you can build on. Patrick said that the zoning is not a problem and there will be a portion of the adjoining property added to this one to allow for the required set-back. Again stating that moving the house is a fair compromise. Carole Berger asked about a proposal of added square footage. Mr. Ahearn said that a new plan would have to be submitted after discussion with the client. Edith noted that historically there had never been carriage houses in the town until the 1930's. Ms. Rosalie Bassett Domont noted that they did sell the property to the neighbor and at the time of sale they were told it would not be demolished. She noted that many artists came to the village and painted the houses, she showed one of the paintings of 78 Peases. She and her sisters are concerned about the town remaining a walking town with views of homes and gardens and not views of carriage houses. She said the character of original houses and their gardens are valuable to the history of the town.

Two letters were read. One from former HDC Chairman, James Cisek who is opposed to the demolition, and one from Steven Pogue, abutter, who voiced concerns about the size of the carriage house.

Susan Catling noted that she not clear about the ZBA set-back issues and does not feel the HDC has the information needed to understand the siting of the buildings. Mr. Ahearn said that this plan does meet all the requirements for zoning other than the substandard lot issue, which is usual and common in the village. Julia Celeste noted that the recent Pent Lane application was viewed with concerns regarding massing and this application raises the same issue. Julia noted that we don't have an application for moving a house. What has been applied for is a demolition in favor of a new carriage house. Mr. Santangelo noted his thinking that this project does not respect orientation, scale and open space. He thinks that the HDC standards should be applied fairly and uniformly to all projects.

Cassie Bradley noted that there is no application regarding the proposed relocation of the house and asked the applicant if he wants a vote on the application before the commission. Mr. Ahearn said that he would like to hear from the board members as to moving the house. Susan Catling asked if they had entertained a consideration to move a garage to the rear and leave the house where it is. Mr. Ahearn replied, "I might." Susan asked if Mr. Ahearn would like the application voted, as submitted. Mr. Ahearn asked for a 'straw poll' of the members.

The members were polled: Robbie Hutchison: Sees that much historic fabric is gone and she is open to compromise of moving the house but would like to see a change in the carriage house plan that would move the cars off the street. Christopher Scott: There is some ambiguity as to the history but thinks the best project recommendation would be to leave the cottage where it is in the front and create parking and garage space in the rear. Edith Blake: would like to see the applicant leave it in the front as it has history and has charm. Susan: Agrees the house should remain in the front of the house, not all historically significant homes are sea captains homes. This is one of the last small farm houses. She would like to see a plan developed for a garage in the rear. Carole: It should not be demolished, it is architecturally valuable and has historic features. It is a landmark and has historic value and is quite charming. Julia Celeste: would like to see the house preserved in the front of the lot, if at all possible, and requests a further understanding of the mass of buildings on the lot. Cassie Bradley: would like to see the original house be maintained in its current location. Locating the carriage house in the rear will protect the streetscape. She prefers to see it remain where it is.

Patrick discussed an option that would preserve the house, and included the Bassett family members present, in discussion asking for their opinions. Mr. Ahearn proposed a possibility of moving the house forward, closer to its original location on the street, thus removing the cars from the streetscape. He noted that the required set-back would place the house at 20 feet from the road. He suggested removing the dormers (added in 1969) and rear wing addition, to bring the house back to its original historic façade. He created a picture of the house with flowers and landscaping, adding a pea stone driveway on the right to access the rear of the property for parking and garaging, thus moving the car parking from the street. The commissioners received this alternate proposal favorably. Mr. Ahearn withdrew his application and will reapply with a new plan for this project.

**4:30 - 105 Main St. (20D-65)** Dan Santangelo. Applicant proposes repairs to front threshold area/door trim. Removing and replacing rotted wood in kind. Mr. Santangelo noted that he will do repairs in wood. He had previously used a wood putty but it was not holding up. Bricque will take more pictures for the file. Motion to approve repairs, Julia Celeste. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Christopher Scott. Unanimously Approved.

**4:40 – 75 School (20D-156)** Keith Stafford. William Wing/agent. Applicant proposes to reroof with Cedar shingles, extend existing dormer & add new dormer on opposite side. Applicant did not appear. Application continued to 3.2.17.

**5:00 – 32 Winter (20D-347.115)** Dorothea Morgan. Megan Brown/agent. Applicant proposes to extend patio area & extend fence. Current fence is more than 9 feet tall and would require a building permit for extension of fence due to the height. Megan Brown described the plans to extend patio, provided drawings, and answered questions regarding the location of features on the property. She noted that the shed is planned to be moved but does not belong to them. The property owner desires to have the shed moved. There were questions about the shed and relocating the shed. Carole asked about the moving of the shed and how it will look when moved and how will it be supported. There were concerns about the view and the density of the neighborhood. Board reviewed pictures. The Chairman does not think this requires a public hearing but would like a site visit. Julia Celeste made the motion to continue for site visit on March 2. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved to continue pending site visit.

**5:15 - 44 Main St. (20D-196).** New Moon Property, LLC. Sean Murphy/agent. **Continuation of Public Hearing from Oct. 18, 2016.** Applicant proposes the addition of a 22 ft. center post, a rain canopy and attachments, for the 2017 Season. Mr. Murphy noted that in October there was discussion regarding height of the post. Inquiries with installer (Sperry sail people) indicate that they can't

lower the post and still make the rain sail work. Mr. Murphy noted that the recent approval for the change in roof line for one building will reduce the view of the Post, noting one can only see the post across the Scoops parking lot. The approved change of roof line will/should block all, if not most, of the post from public view. He is asking for approval for 2017 season only saying that if the Post & rain sail remain an issue after in the 2017 season it can be re-addressed for the 2018 season. Gino Courtney asked about arrangements for drainage issue. Gino does not want to see the HDC permit something that causes drainage problems on his land. Mr. Murphy noted it is illegal to cause a draining issue on a neighboring property. Cassie noted the roof at 18 ft. and the post is 22 ft. so should still be visible. Sean Murphy conceded that but noted that there is tension on the post which may reduce height. Robbie Hutchison said she sees it as a low risk of looking at it for the season. Julia Celeste noted the stars on the white tent made the rain tent very visible and asked if there will be a new, different color for the rain shield. Mr. Murphy said it will be the same tent/color as last year. He said they will come back to HDC prior to the end of the 2017 season to address any concerns for 2018. Susan noted that a big problem was the lighting which was corrected. Robbie made a motion to approve for 2017 only. Carole 2<sup>nd</sup>. Voting yea: Carole, Susan, Christopher, Cassie, Edith, Robbie. Voting nay: Julia. Approved for the 2017 season.

### **New/Old Business:**

51 Cooke St. Fence. Bricque explained that the owners of 51 Cooke Street have applied to do repairs, replacing pickets, in kind, on the front fence. Application has been received with photos. Expedited approval has been granted.

### **Minutes 1.17.17**

Motion to approve: Julia Celeste, 2<sup>nd</sup> Robbie Hutchison. Approved.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 3.2.17  
Susan Catling, Chairman