Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~ Minutes



January 17, 2017

Members in attendance: Susan Catling-Chairman, Julia Celeste (A), Christopher Scott, Ken Magnuson, Cassie Bradley, Ann Floyd (A), Edith Blake. Absent: Carole Berger, Robbie Hutchison. Staff: Bricque Garber.

Chairman Catling called the meeting to order at 4:00.

4:00 Public Hearing: - 87 Pease's Pt. Way North. (20B-81.2) Michael & Diane Whelan. Hilary Grannis/agent. Applicant proposes to demolish existing (1995) house and construct a new single family home with attached garage. Chairman Catling read the public hearing notice. There was a site visit prior to this hearing. Hilary Grannis made her presentation for removal of the 1995 house in favor of a new home. She described the current building materials and noted that they are not historically accurate materials, i.e. Aluminum gutters. The new house plan will take advantage of historically accurate building materials including, cedar shingles, wood trim, brick & copper gutters. She presented pictures of the proposed home and the neighboring houses noting that the new house will be more in keeping with the downtown streetscapes. It was noted that the garage is set back from the body of the house. At completion, the lot coverage will be 28%. Edith remarked about the gables and it was confirmed that they will be lined up. The new house is 2400 sq. ft.; the old house was 1800 sq. ft. Ann questioned the attic window, seeing it as out of proportion. Hilary noted that it is an attic window size and may be a bit large and offered to reduce the size of the attic window, which would be a reduction of approx. 6 inches in height and 4 in width. Ann Floyd questioned the size of the chimney and a discussion regarding the chimney ensued. Hilary said she will make it a bit larger so that the width will be 36 inches and will be placed in the center.

Susan directed a discussion of the demolition and read the guidelines to the commissioners. Ken noted that this is newer house and thinks any demolition should be taken on a case by case basis. He said he has not issue with this particular demotion as the house has no historic significance. Chris Scott noted

HDC Minutes 1.17.17 page 2 of 3

that the guideline speaks more to historic homes and he, also has no objection to demolition. Ann asked about salvage. Hillary said that fixtures in the interior are available for salvage. She said the house has already been offered to affordable housing.

Susan opened the hearing to the public. There were no letters received regarding this application. Steve Pogue, abutter, discussed gray painted clapboard and would prefer the clapboard be white. Hilary noted that the color idea came from a HDC meeting thus the applicant opted for gray but has no issue with painting the clapboards white. Most members prefer white. Hilary said there is no object to white. There being no further public comment, the public hearing was closed.

Cassie Bradley said she supports the project. Ken Magnuson is in favor of demolition in this case. Julia Celeste sees the demo. as appropriate for this house. Ann Floyd supports the construction of a new home and Chris Scott sees this as an improvement to the streetscape and noted the house fits comfortably on the lot. Edith Blake approves of the new home. Susan Catling, noting the age factor as a major consideration, has no objection and thinks the new house will benefit the streetscape. Ken Magnuson made the motion to approve the application with a modification of the attic window size and chimney width. 2^{nd,} Julia Celeste. Unanimously Approved.

- **4:15 6 Cummings Way. (29B-39)** Pamela Findlay. Thomas O'Brien/agent. Applicant proposes to add a side door, bay window and porch roof to the house and 12x14 addition to the garage including a door and 5 windows. Tom presented the plan for addition of a bay window & porch roof. Tom answered questions regarding the history. Wood trim will be painted white and wood shingles used to match what is existing. All trim detail to match exactly the work done a few years ago. All windows will match existing windows. Motion to approve as presented, Ken Magnuson. 2nd Edith Blake. Approved.
- **4:30 103 School St. (29A-6)** John Miskel. Mark Clark/agent. Applicant proposes to remove oval window and install new 5x7' window & install new window 2x3'window on 2nd floor. Mark Clark appeared to present the application for the replacement of a window and the installation of the new window. Members reviewed the pictures of the oval window, that will be

removed, and the new replacement windows. Chris asked about the age of the windows, which were described as not very old. It was noted that all are vinyl clad windows the new ones are planned to match the existing. It was noted that this is house is new to the district. Motion to approve, Ann Floyd. 2nd, Chris Scott. Approved.

4:45 - 129 Upper Main St. (20C-4.11) Fredrick Hurley. Charles
Ashmun/agent. Applicant proposes to demo. 20x20 garage and rebuild as

HDC Minutes 1.17.17 page 3 of 3

20x40' with 2nd floor guest space. This application was continued at the request of the applicant.

5:00 - 70 N. Water St. (20D-246) Mary Kate & James McKenna. Pam Scott/agent. Applicant proposes to enclose terrace on S. side of house, replace existing window with French door & make structural repairs in basement. Chris Scott was recused. Pam Scott made the presentation showed photos and plans. She described the addition of the porch to the south side of the house. Window change on the West (Back) side of the house. And, repairs to the front and side foundations that will necessitate the removal of some trees and fencing, all of which will be replaced. There was a discussion with the about the windows. The current fence has composite posts which will be removed in sections, stored and replaced. The repairs to the foundation are structural only. Motion to approve as presented, Ann Floyd. Edith Blake provided the 2nd. Approved.

New/Old Business:

- The owners of 2 Pierce have not responded to the violation notice. Members asked that a 2nd notice be sent.
- Discussion regarding the purpose of site visits.
- Discussion regarding the next meeting date, place and time. CPC will need the Selectman's room on the 2nd. A meeting date and determination will be made next week, if needed. Currently there are no applications to be heard on 2.2.17.

Minutes 12.20.16

Motion to approve minutes, Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Cassie Bradley. Approved.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber Assistant

Approved:		date	
	Susan Catling		