

# Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.  
Edgartown, MA 02539  
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

## ~Historic District Commission~ Minutes



Thursday, December 6, 2018

Members in attendance: Susan Catling-Vice Chairman, Cassie Bradley, Edith Blake, Ken Magnuson, Julia Celeste, Peter Rosbeck. Alternates: Molly Costello & Cari Williamson. Absent: Chris Scott & Julia Celeste. Staff: Bricque Garber

Ms. Catling called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM.

**PUBLIC HEARING: 27 Thayer Street (19A-5.1)** Richard and Anna Zannino. Hilary Grannis/agent. Applicant proposes changes to a 1960's garage/guest house to create bunkroom and potting shed, reducing the overall size of the building. Susan Catling read the public hearing notice and noted there was a site visit just prior to this hearing. Ms. Catling outlined the procedure for the public hearing and Hilary Grannis made her presentation, describing the siting of the building and the surrounding structures. The current garage/guest house will be reduced in size and the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor removed. In 1996 the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor guest house was added which will be removed. The materials and trim details will match the current main house. This garage is not accessible as a garage since the construction of the new main house. The current garage structure matched the original Cape Cod house. Now the owners want to compliment the current house. The size reduction and the changes will make it more compatible with the current house. Discussion: Ken sees it as a good idea to down size the building. Q: Cari asked about the stone veneer of proposed. A: to match the current main house. Opened for public comment: In favor – Twanette Tharp thinks Hilary has done a great job in bringing the structures together. There is no one speaking in opposition and no letters have been received. Susan closed the Public Hearing. Board questions & comments: Cassie sees this as an improvement and a solid plan. Susan appreciates the complete history provided by the applicant. Ken, "well done" and Peter agreed. Cassie noted this is a good and very clear presentation and this will be much better. Molly appreciates the history. Motion to approve, Peter. Ken, 2<sup>nd</sup>. Unanimously Approved.

**31 Pierce Lane (20D-37.14)** Geoff Caraboolad. Paul Pertile/agent. Applicant proposes to remove wood gutters and replace with fiberglass gutters with copper downspouts. And, remove wood shutters and replace with Atlantic cosmetic shutters. Mr. Pertile explained that the plan for the shutters has changed the plan and will now restore the existing shutters. Mr. Pertile described that they wants to remove the old wood gutters and replace with fiberglass gutters with Copper down spouts. Will return with lighting and landscape plans. Motion to approve Ken. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Cari. Approved.

**73 N. Water St. (20D-289)** Brian Mann. Applicant proposes to add a single car garage, pool, detached bedroom & add/and modify pool fencing. Mr. Mann made his presentation for the addition of a proposed detached bedroom beginning with the site plan and noted that the addition as shown has not been built yet but has been approved. He showed many photos of the house and landscaping, describing the photos in detail. He also showed photos of neighboring homes and described them.

Twanette Tharp, abutter, attended with Attorney Casavant and told the members of her objections to the project, including the number of bedrooms, the view and green space loss, the proposed building proportions and the size of the pool and patio.

Mr. Mann described the proposed detached bedroom and plans to keep the existing fencing and add 41 ft. of 6 ft. fencing along Morse St. He said that the proposed garage is tucked back at 5'6" from the rear property line. He showed the elevations of the proposed garage and provided a photo to illustrate the planned garage. On south side proposed 6 ft. natural cedar and solid 4 ft fencing at the pool enclosure. Mr. Mann displayed fencing styles using photographs. He showed pictures of the planned pool with a bluestone patio located 60 ft back from N. Water Street. The pool equipment to be located in enclosure with sound proofing, just south of the garage and 3 feet from the parking area. Cassie asked about the pool equipment location asking if it is within the setback. Brian yes. Cari asked about detached bedroom. A: 30 feet from N. Water St. to the front of the detached bedroom. Susan noted that there is a lot to see here, mass is certainly an issue, and this project should definitely be sent to Public Hearing. Ken asked about the loss of green space. Mr. Mann said the lot coverage is approx. 21 per cent with the additions and 30 % with the addition of the pool. Mrs. Mann said that they are looking for privacy and wants to park the car. Susan noted that the current parking area is close to the transformer. Mann said it is difficult to park 2 cars.

Twanette Tharp and Atty. Michele Casavant noted that Ms. Tharp is a direct abutter. She described the lot coverage as closer to 40% of the open space. Ms. Tharp noted she objects for several reasons noting the entire project is seen from the public view. There is a public view easement and the view to the harbor will be lost and be replaced with an inappropriate building. Ms. Casavant noted that the integrity of the property is challenged. Noting that the auxiliary building too close to the corner. She said that this property is only approved for 4 bedrooms and maintains that 5 bedrooms as shown in the plan cannot be permitted. Ms. Casavant asked that the application not be referred to Public Hearing before it is permitted by the ZBA, Building, and Waste Water. She further noted that the detached bedroom is in excess of 400 sq. ft. She challenged the location of pool equipment in the flood zone. She described additions of more than 40 lights. She further described the landscape plan and noted that they have presented objection to the Conservation Commission.

Mr. Mann countered that the presentation by Twanette and Michele has several inaccuracies and he can rebut all the concerns by the abutter and will do so at the public hearing. Ken thinks this should go forward to a Public Hearing. Ken Magnuson and Peter Rosbeck described that many of the abutter concerns do not lie within the purview of the HD, and some issues of concern will be primarily looked at by the building inspector and

the Con-Com. Barbara Jordan of 83 N. Water discussed her concerns regarding the large pool that “is basically in the front yard”. It is a very big pool close the street and a 6 ft fence will not remediate the noise from the pool. The noise concerns are important and prevalent for neighbors. In addition she noted her concern that the planned detached bedroom may, in the future, be a noise concern. Charlie Blair, Harbor Master, sent a letter to the HDC and it was read.

Ken made motion to send to public hearing on Feb. 21, 2019, at the request of Mr. Mann. A site visit will precede the hearing and all proposed structures should be staked. Cassie provided the 2<sup>nd</sup>. Motion approved to send to a Public Hearing on Feb. 21, 2019

**86 Peases Pt. Way North (20B-60)** Lyn and Glenn Reiter. Dudley Cannada/agent. Applicant proposes to build a new garage and extend existing fence. Dudley Canada made his presentation for the addition of a garage in the small dog-leg part of the lot. He described the limited visibility of the proposed garage. Susan asked about the existing fence. A: Currently there is a fence that will be extended. The current owners have worked with the neighbors in designing the garage. This one car garage will be accessed from Wilbur lane. Susan asked members if this rises to the level of public hearing. The public hearing was discussed. Ken asked about the lantern. A: Dudley will bring the lighting example to the Public Hearing. Motion to send to public Hearing Ken, 2<sup>nd</sup>, Cassie. Approved to move to public hearing on January 3<sup>rd</sup>. 2018. There will be a site visit prior to the Public Hearing and the proposed garage should be staked.

**37 S. Summer St. (20D-182)** Kenneth Arrondando/Eson Family LP. Michael Carroll Construction/agent. Applicant proposes to repair/replace rake trim, ~~repair and replace windows and doors all sides of the house~~, replace vinyl fence (currently in violation) with wooden picket fence and cap rail and repair existing arbor at right front corner of the house. Mr. Carroll showed the members photos and described the replacement of trim and he noted one area under a slider, where he plans to use Azek. The fence that is existing will be removed as it was constructed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Window trim currently shows rot and will be replaced where needed & painted white. Motion to approve the replacement of the trim with treated pine, remove plastic fence and replace the fence along Davis to match the existing front sections of the fence, Cari Williamson. Ken Magnuson provided the 2<sup>nd</sup>. Unanimously approved.

### Old/New Business:

**Minutes: 11.15.18:** Motion to approve, Cari Williamson. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Ken Magnuson. Approved.

Respectfully submitted:  
*Bricque Garber*, Assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 12/20/18  
*Susan Catling, Vice Chairman*