

Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~

Minutes



Thursday, November 15, 2018

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott, Chairman, Susan Catling, Cassie Bradley, Julia Celeste, Peter Rosbeck, Cari Williamson (A), and Ken Magnuson. Edith Blake-absent. Staff: Bricque Garber.

Mr. Scott opened the meeting at 4:09 pm.

Public Hearing: 40 Pease's Point Way N. (20D-71.12) David Schaefer. Sasha Robinson-White/agent. Applicant proposes removal of additions & new additions, porch, pool & fencing. There was a site visit just prior to this hearing. Chris Scott read the Public Hearing Notice and Mr. Robinson-White made is presentation to the Commission. Ms. Catling was recused from the Public Hearing. Mr. Robinson-White said that the primary goal is to preserve the original façade and make changes to the house as it sits. He described that one bedroom and a kitchen will be removed, both having been built at some later date. Additions in the rear, also not original to the house, will be removed. He reviewed the plans and drawings with the members. They plan to replace all the windows and roofing will be replaced and all roofs will then match. The current brick will be cleaned as it is currently painted pink. The chimney, as drawn, was discussed. Chris Scott noted that there is an approx 30% demolition of additions to the original structure. Q: will the height of the gable be the same height as the Pease's side gable? A: Yes Q: Existing vs. proposed square footage. A: The total existing sq. ft. is 3,100. The proposed is 4,200. The addition of approx 1100 sq. ft. is mostly on the 2nd floor. The current deck size with be reduced. A: Julia asked about the fencing. A: The pool fencing is planned to be buried in the hedge. Andi Schaefer, applicant, noted that the current fence will not be moved. There will be a visible gate that will meet pool code. It will be a double Chippendale style gate and the current hedge will be extended to the gate. Q: Pool shed materials? A: White painted clapboard to match the house. The entire house is clapboard painted white.

There being no further questions from the Commissioners, Mr. Scott opened the hearing for public comment. There were no public comment and one letter from the abutter at 5 Cottle Lane, in support of the project, was read. Mr. Scott then closed the public hearing.

Cari Williamson noted that the addition of the 1100 sq. ft in this plan, does not pose the usual concerns regarding mass. Julia expressed that it may be a good idea to use shingles painted white on the newer parts of the house to create the distinction between the original and additions. Discussion ensued. Andi Schafer is open to the suggestion. Chris said that he sees the overall aesthetic as very good. Noting further that the house has had many additions over time and it is a peculiar house, this design unifies the house and it is a clear plan that is in harmony with the district. Motion to approve as submitted, Cari Williamson. 2nd. Ken Magnuson. Unanimously approved.

72 Pease's Point Way N. (20D-83). Change to an approved plan. Shep Murray. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes to add a stair from porch to rear yard, add one 25x30" window on 2nd floor right side elevation, add a window well at basement right side elevation & add a door to covered porch. Patrick explained the changes requested by the applicant. He showed the plans noting the additions. The changes include a door, rear exterior stair, window well and small window. Changes were highlighted on the plans. Mr. Ahearn said that these changes came up when the plans were reviewed by the building department. Motion to approve Julia Celeste. 2nd, Peter Rosbeck. Approved.

93 School St. (19A-4.1) Jason Loomis. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes 100% demolition of house and garage, and construction of a new single family dwelling and carriage house. Patrick Ahearn provided plans to the members and began his presentation by explaining his reasoning why this house should be eligible for demolition. Mr. Ahearn said that, per MACRIS, the house was constructed in 1920 and had additions over time. Mr. Ahearn provided photograph. He noted that the house is in poor condition and is nearly uninhabitable at this point. He said that structurally the house is sagging and it sits on a small crawl space and that there is moisture penetration and the house smells of mold. He said that his clients want to build a new Greek Revival house that will be 430 sq ft larger than the existing house. He said that the new house will meet the set back requirements. Patrick described that the north side of the property has open space due to the location of the neighboring house. They plan to relocate the new house to create more open space. He said that the proposed design will create a sense of implied history. They plan a small garage with a 375 sq bedroom above the garage and a pea-stone driveway with cobble stone edge. Similar in character to other houses on School St. Mr. Ahearn completed his presentation.

Chris Scott noted that the demolition of an existing house would require a public hearing. Noted to go to Public Hearing. Mr. Scott asked the applicant to familiarize themselves with the HDC Guidelines. Susan Catling asked about the history of the current farm house noting the provided history is not complete. She further asked was there mold in the house when they bought it? And did they have inspections? Mr. Ahearn, noting a long history with the house said that there was always a smell. He

said that the owners are working on the history. He said that the owners had always intended to build a new house. Susan asked if they have provided an engineer's report. Patrick said "no" but they can get one. Susan and Chris noted that application lacks information regarding the history of the house. Chris noted that mold can be remedied. Patrick said that the house has been 'bastardized' over time and the house lacks the 'reflection' of a historical farm house. Patrick said that the building is not code and the renovation will bring it up to code. Chris noted that most if not all historic homes do not meet current code. Patrick said that the neighbors are in favor of the new house. Tom Fisher, from across the street, attended the meeting and said that the house is older than 1920. And that there "are no houses that look like that, anymore". Mr. Fisher provided some history noting that the house was owned by Beriah Hillman. Mr. Fisher noted he would rather look at the new house, but the character of the neighborhood and these shingled farm houses do not exist and the character and variety has been lost. The date for the public hearing and site visit was discussed and January 3rd, was confirmed with Mr. Ahearn. Chairman Scott noted, from the HDC Guidelines, "there is a always a strong presumption in favor of retaining all existing buildings and structures". He then provided Notice of Public Hearing to Mr. Ahearn. Motion to send to public hearing on January 3, 2019, Julia Celeste. 2nd Susan Catling. Approved for Public Hearing and site visit.

100 School St. (29A-9.122) Deborah McAneny. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes construction of a New Greek Revival house, carriage house & pool. Peter is recused. Plans were distributed for the construction of a new house on a vacant lot. Mr. Ahearn explained that the applicant owns the neighboring house and noted that this property is new to the Historic District. Patrick described that much construction has happened in the area and that there is a "mixed bag" of architecture on the street. He described some the neighboring houses and the construction dates. The applicant has owned this lot since they bought the house. The house was described as a classic Greek revival. He said that this house meets all legal setbacks and is a conforming lot over 10,000 sf. Patrick described the house and garage elevations as he displayed them on the screen. He showed pictures of the other houses on the street and described that this plan fits well into the neighborhood. He sees this as sensitive to the volume and scale of this street-scape, noting that the current McAnney house is 32 ft. tall and this house is of a lower design. A neighbor discussed concerns about the grade and water runoff. Patrick noted there will be gutters and downspouts with dry wells and the onsite drainage system will not impact the neighbors. Susan asked about the Palladian window. Patrick described the focal vertical note of the window as having a good balance and adding small windows as a 'solid-to-window' balance. The wing sits behind the primary façade. He noted the detail is important and well thought out. Noting that it will create an implied history this will look like a house that may have always been here. This house design is a reference to the Carruso house, on South Water St. The owners want this house to read secondary to their current house. Ken likes the Palladian window and feels it adds something unique to the property and

does not think it is overstated. Ken noted that he sees square garage doors as a more appropriate choice. Chris agrees that the detail and scale are appropriate, but thinks that this will require a public hearing. Cari asked about the look of the addition (wing) size and does not see it as appearing subordinate to the primary façade. Patrick described the reasoning and the possibility of better disconnecting of the appearance of the addition. Cari noted that the lower scale bodes well for the plan. Susan noted that this new design works in creating the multi-style streetscape noting that 86, 110, 103 & 93 School St. are of a farm-house style. Motion to send to Public hearing and site visit on January 3rd 2019, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Approved

Old/New Business:

Bricque introduced a late application for the Chimney Cap on the Dukes County Court House. This application was not reasonably anticipated at the time the agenda was posted. An approval for the Chimney Cap design to keep the rain from the new heating system is needed. Pictures of 4 brick pillars and a blue stone cap was provided to the members. Motion to approve as presented, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Peter Rosbeck. Approved.

Bricque requested approval for an increase in her hours from 24 to 30 for the next fiscal year. Motion to approve, Cassie Bradley. 2nd, Julia Celeste. Approved.

Minutes: November 1, 1018

Motion to approve minutes, Susan Catling. 2nd, Peter Rosbeck. Approved with the addition of the document reaffirming the 66 Main St. vote, requested by Mr. Scott.

Adjourned @ 5:37

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ December 6, 2018