

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~ Minutes



Thursday, November 1, 2018

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott-Chairman, Susan Catling, Cassie Bradley, Julia Celeste, Ken Magnuson, Cari Williamson (A), & Peter Rosbeck. Absent: Edith Blake. Staff: Bricque Garber.

Mr. Scott called the meeting to order at 4:04.

Public Hearing: 59 School St. (20D-143) Martha's Vineyard Museum, Inc. Phillip Wallis/agent. Applicant proposes restoration of the Cooke House including building restoration, site-work and creating a two utilitarian structures. Ms. Catling read the Public Hearing Notice. Mr. Scott is recused from this hearing. There was a site visit prior to the hearing today. Noting 3-4 primary elements Mr. Walls explained that the primary historic asset is the Cooke House. He discussed the drainage issues as they impact the Cooke House. The Gate House will be relocated to the rear corner for programming and shed. A restroom will be built at the School St. corner. Two curb cuts and lot line adjustment have been approved by the Planning Board. It was noted that they plan to maintain the Cooke House without making changes to the exterior other than the addition of wood gutters. Most work will be done on the interior of the house, when the grading is done, so they can deal with the water damage. The primary addition to the historic house will be gutters and downspouts (v shaped per historical view). There will be no gentrification of the exterior or interior. Q: Cari asked about a current brick path laid by High School students as noted on a plaque. A: They will retain the plaques though the pathway will be different. They plan to reuse the bricks and incorporate into this plan. Q: The herringbone pattern of brick at the entrance was noted and the history of that brick requested. Cari has concerns about removing the herringbone and changing the hardscape. A: It was explained that that brick was laid at the time of construction of the gate house. Is not old but still will be reused if possible. Peter discussed the curb cut and the tight area of turn around and closeness of the driveways across the street. The street and curb cuts were discussed. Julia asked about any new information, since the previous meeting. A: They will come back with hardscape plans, including use of the existing brick, paths, benches, bathroom design and gate house changes.

Susan opened the hearing for comments. There were no comments, from the public, for or against this project. Public hearing was closed: Cassie noted the need to review all plans for hardscape and auxiliary structures but is comfortable with the repairs to Cooke house and the grading as described. Cari agreed and complemented the overall site plan.

Peter & Julia noted their approval of the plan, as well. Ken noted the need of the HDC to review all structures and hardscape but noted his approval of the overall design. Susan commended the focus on front of the Cooke house and the walkway. Motion to approve the grading and repairs to the Cooke House & moving the fencing: Julia Celeste, 2nd Cassie. Unanimously approved.

27 Thayer Street (19A-5.1) Richard and Anna Zannino. Hilary Grannis/agent. Applicant proposes changes to a 1960's garage/guest house to create bunkroom and potting shed. Hillary described the history of the building noting that the lot was subdivided in 2015. At that time the existing house was demolished. A new house was built and the subject building is now in the rear yard without access as a garage. The addition to this garage was built in 1984. 1995 was the next addition to this building. They want to now remove the entire 1995 addition to lower to building and reduce the entire mass to be used as an accessory structure for their new house. The current structure is too large and architecturally incongruent with the existing new house. Hillary described a change of the roof pitch to 6 pitch and will copy the stone foundation from the primary house. She described the plans to reduce the size using the existing structure, minus the two additions. The trim details and stone to match the existing house and garage. Chris noting that there is a lot of positive change and is very well thought out but there is much change. The members discussed the desire for a public hearing and decided that though the commission views all the changes as positive, abutters should be notified as is the HDC practice with major alterations. It was noted that this is a very complete application. Motion to send to public hearing Cassie Bradley, 2nd Susan Catling. Approved to schedule for a Public Hearing on Dec. 6, 2018

86 Main St. (20D-61) Continued from 10.18.18. St. Elizabeth's Catholic Church. Joseph Capobianco/agent. Applicant proposes to remove 2 windows and replace with a sliding door. Joe came back to discussed the door, proposing Andersen in-swing French doors rather than the previously proposed slider. The French door is wood with STDL. Motion to approve the in-swing Andersen door, Peter Rosbeck, 2nd, Julia Celeste. Unanimously approved.

61 Simpson's Lane (20D-102) Carolyn R. Bernardi. Applicant proposes to remove and replace stockade fence with T&G cedar board fence with top rail & 4x4 posts with caps. Chris Scott noted that the application is complete and the proposed fence will be an improvement and will be more harmonious than the current stockade fence. Discussion. Motion to approve as submitted, Cassie Bradley. Susan Catling provided the 2nd. Approved.

Old/New Business:

Review of Plans for 66 Main St. for purposes of the Community Preservation Act. Members reviewed the approved plans and read the Secretary of the Interior Standards regarding Treatment for Historic Properties (part 68). The members of the Commission then voted unanimously to reaffirm the prior vote. Julia left the room as she has been recused from issues re: this project. Chris noted that several issues were brought forward at the Public Hearing and have been addressed. This is not to revisit the application but to

provide HDC clarification concerning support of the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

Ben Hall stated his contention that the Secretary of Interior Standard 68.3A does not allow for the project to go forward under historic preservation or rehabilitation. Mr. Hall further said that that the little building, when built had to be built as a duplicate.

It was noted that a copy of part 68 and copies of the approved Yellow House plans were distributed to the members. Mr. Scott read a statement of findings by the HDC noting that the HDC approval did comply with the Standards for Rehabilitation stated in the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Chris Scott made a motion to re-affirm the vote. 2nd, Susan Catling. Unanimously Approved.

Minutes:

October 18, 2018.

Motion to approve: Susan Catling. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Unanimously approved.

Adjourned: 5:12

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ November 15, 2018