

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158^{note} ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~ Minutes



Thursday, August 23, 2018

In attendance: Christopher Scott, Chairman, Susan Catling, Edith Blake, Cassie Bradley, Peter Rosbeck, Julia Celeste, Cari Williamson (A). Absent: Ken Magnuson
Staff: Bricque Garber

Christopher Scott called to order at 4:06 PM

4:00– 58 S. Summer St. (20D-145) McCowatt. Brooks & Falotico/agent. Applicant proposes renovations and addition to existing guest house. There was a site visit today prior to the meeting. Louise Brooks appeared as agent for the applicant. There is a proposed addition of 23 sq. ft. on the front right hand side of the building measuring 4' 4" by 5'. They plan to refurbish and retain the old windows. They will replace the siding and paint to match existing. The guest house will be converted to year round living space. Louise explained that the 23 sq. ft. accomplishes the applicant's goal and they have an over arching concern not to disturb the large tree. Cari Williamson noted she sees this as a reasonable request. Susan Catling noted that this is close to the property line but she does not see concern with neighboring properties that would necessitate a public hearing. Members concurred. Susan Catling made a motion to approve the addition. Peter Rosbeck provided the 2nd. Unanimously approved.

4:15 – 30 Cottage St. (20D-263.2) Addition to posted agenda (leaking windows). Elizabeth Balay. Applicant proposes to wrap leaking window sills with extruded powder coated aluminum. Tot & John Balay came to explain the proposed aluminum wrap the existing sill and brought a sample of the material. The members looked at the material that is proposed to use on the window sill. Mrs. Balay described this fix as a good option for them to help to winterize the house. Q: Chris Scott asked about the number of windows? A: Those facing cottage St. Where the weather is most severe. Q: How is the end edge of the sill/material accomplished? A: It wrapped on the end and the ends look like wood. Q: Is it a permanent fix. A: They have no other place to live and need to do this for warmth. Sills are leaking due to water damage. The existing sills are a bad angle for water run-off and the cost of replacing the sills with wood would be too much of a financial imposition. Q: How many windows? A: 6 (six).

Mrs. Balay said that the aluminum can be crimped to fit any trim and this repair is seen in other historic districts. Chris Scott noted that cost considerations are not generally a consideration of the HDC. Peter Rosbeck is not convinced that this will stop the water problem and encasing this may made the water problem worse. Mrs. Balay said that they are not sure what else to do. Chris Scott recommended that the applicants seek another remedy. Cari Williamson noted that aluminum will dent. Mr. Balay thinks that any dents are preferred to the current rotten sills. She argued that there is an aluminum storm frame and an aluminum storm door. Susan does not see this as a case for the addition of more aluminum. Peter noted that the only viable alternative is replacement of the sills.

Ms. Balay made a plea for help due to the expense of repairs which are not financially manageable. Peter is not sure that you might see too much difference, visually, as it is not a 'bright' finish. Chris Scott noted that this is not an historic house. Discussion ensued. Peter would like to see this as only a temporary fix. Chris Scott noted that the commissioners are not fond of this remedy as repair solution. Mr. Balay noted that this may be temporary as they would like to build a new house or may sell the property. He just wants something that works to provide a remedy as this is a full time residence for them and winter is coming. He noted that they are aware that if they want to replace windows they will need to make application to the HDC. For now they just want to make it livable. Motion to approve the application as temporary maintenance repair that is not considered by the HDC as a replacement. Motion to approve as a temporary remedy Peter Rosbeck 2nd, Julia. Voting in favor: Cassie, Edith, Cari, Julia & Peter. Opposed, Susan. Motion carries.

Old/New Business:

Minutes 8.9.18

Motion to approve: Cassie. 2nd, Susan Catling. Unanimously approved.

The meeting was adjourned @ 5:03.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber

Approved: _____ 9.6.18
Christopher Scott, Chairman