

**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.  
Edgartown, MA 02539  
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

# ~Historic District Commission~ Minutes



Thursday, August 9, 2018

Members in attendance: Susan Catling-Vice Chairman, Cassie Bradley, Julia Celeste, Ken Magnuson, Peter Rosbeck, Cari Williamson (A), Absent: Christopher Scott & Edith Blake. Staff: Bricque Garber.

Susan Catling opened the meeting at 4:04.

**66 Main St. (20D-125)** Town of Edgartown. Christopher Celeste & Dudley Cannada/agents. Applicants propose renovations and additions to existing structures. Mr. Celeste and Mr. Cannada appeared and provided an overview of their plans for the renovation and additions to of the “Yellow House” and the plan for building a new small commercial structure to replace the current small building on the lot. Julia is recused from hearing this application.

Christopher Celeste acknowledged that he welcomes feedback and is very aware of the historic significance of the property. He noted the desire to move forward on the project with a sense of urgency, hoping to begin work on the project very soon. Mr. Celeste acknowledged community interest and requested a public hearing as soon as the calendar allows. Dudley Cannada reviewed the plans with the members of the Commission. Noting the members have some familiarity with the building he described the goal is to work with and maintain most of the existing building. The façade on S. Summer will be renovated as is. The windows, siding and shutters will need to be replaced with historically appropriate windows, shutters and wood siding. The parking lot side will be restored with a 13 Ft. addition in the rear. The Main Street side has some 20<sup>th</sup> century additions that don't work on the house. A one story addition is planned. The addition will be subordinate to the historic bldg. In addition, they plan to replace the small building, which is not historic, with a slightly larger building of 1 & 1/2 story. Reviewing the site plan he noted that the plan shows a representational use of the “plaza” space. The “plaza” and parking area is under the auspices of the town. The small commercial building will be rebuilt and will be approx. 6 feet taller than the current building. They plan to add a dormer across the back of the main building to add roof height and allow for the windows. The plan shows 3 residential units with the residential entrance on Summer St. Q: What is the setback for the new retail addition? A: 3 feet.

Motion to send forward for Public Hearing on September 6. Cassie Bradley. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Ken Magnuson. To help accommodate the summer hearing schedule the applicant agreed to a site visit on 8.23.18 with the Public Hearing on Sept. 6, 2018. Unanimously voted to send to public hearing. The applicants were provided a public hearing information notice.

**66 N. Water St. (20D-233)** Murrell. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes to reconstruct a new rear wing to be zoning compliant, reconstruct a 1 car garage & cabana to replace an existing 2 car garage and guest house. Relocate the new garage & cabana 63'-4" back from the existing 2 car garage & guesthouse into the lot. Restore main house façade, new wood roof and siding and restore widows walk. Mr. Ahearn presented the newest plans for renovations and additions to this house. The Murrell family attended the hearing. Fred Murrell spoke to tell of his association, love and commitment to the island having been on an off the Island for 22 years, and that their four kids have spent their childhood here. Noting that the house is exclusively for family use, it will not be a vacation rental. They boasted Patrick's many awards and they believe they are fortunate to have him as their architect. Mrs. Murrell provided pictures of the family vacations on the island and said that this house on North Water St. is their dream home.

Patrick made the presentation of the plan and noted that this is the preliminary hearing for this project which will be sent forward for a public hearing. Patrick noted that this lot is the largest lot on N. Water. He showed the renderings and site plan and described the removal of the previously added rear wing which is non compliant and the replacement addition as compliant. The new addition is 22 feet longer than the existing addition. He stated that the new 'wing' is not visible from the public way on the north side of the property. He explained that this project will not be subject to review by ZBA. The current 2 car garage will be removed and new one car garage will be built 155 feet from the road noting that the location of the proposed 1 car garage is 63 feet further back on the lot than the current garage. Mr. Ahearn read from the **Description of work-Overall** document that was provided to the HDC and is attached to the application, which describes measurements, set-backs, lot coverage and materials, including changes to the primary facades i.e.: remove and replace vinyl, asphalt etc. The "widows walk" (not original to the structure circa 1998) will be relocated to be more historically correct with 2 chimneys. He said that the mass of this house is in line with other structures on the street, saying this plan preserves and enhances the house and is respectful to its neighbors.

Ms. Catling asked the members for questions. Q: Even with the garage moved back the addition on the south allows for no open/green space? Patrick referred to drawings. and discussed the drive way and fencing as current and as shown and noted a willingness to provide lawn in the area designated as the long drive way with a brick pad at the sidewalk to park the car. He described that the owners will only need to access the garage twice per season so they could drive over the lawn. There was a continuing discussion of the green space. Julia Celeste reiterated that the current

green space will be all house and the current view toward the tree tops will disappear. Peter Rosbeck discussed the green space vs. the rendering perspective, noting the perspective of the drawing may be deceptive. Julia asked the applicant if they might have considered moving part of the sq. footage into a 2<sup>nd</sup> structure.

A: No, as they cannot use the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor due to ceiling height and need 5 bedrooms in the house, thus the addition proposed is shorter but wider. Mr. Ahearn described the new wing/addition will be detailed to match the house.

Motion to send forward for Public Hearing on September 6<sup>th</sup>, Ken Magnuson. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Cari Williamson. Unanimously voted to send to public hearing. Ms. Catling read the disclosure information regarding the public hearing process and a copy of the disclosure was provided to the applicant. The public hearing will be on Sept. 6 with site visit prior to the hearing.

**73 N. Water St. (20D-289)** Brian Mann. Applicant proposes to remove existing mud-room and exterior storage and construct a new addition. Brian Mann displayed the plans for the addition to the house and noted that the planned addition will be an improvement to balance the current house. The plans show that this addition will allow for a larger bedroom and storage. On the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor there will expansion of the bath. Mr. Mann noted that his goal is to balance the house. He explained that parts of the house were added in the 50's, specifically noting a window addition. Mr. Mann provided views of all the façades of the current house and the proposed addition. There is no change to the view of the facades from Morse S. Q: Is there chimney on the house now? A: Noting that there is a chimney and there was a chimney that was removed. Applicant and members further discussed the idea of adding 2 faux chimneys, as it was noted by Mr. Mann that at some point in time there were 2 chimneys. There was a discussion about the window sizes and which should match. There was a preference expressed for the matching upper windows to be the smaller size. Q: How far does the lower bay window protrude? A: approx 2 feet. It was discussed that the bay may be a bit awkward as it may draw attention to the addition as an addition. They discussed the window as possibly 2 windows rather than a bay window. Peter Rosbeck thinks that a bay window may be OK and noting another such window on S. Water St. Mr. Mann said that he is very willing to reconsider the bay window as well as the window sizes. He noted his intention to repurpose original windows where he can. There was a discussion regarding the pitch of the roof and it was noted that the plan perspective may not properly depict the pitch. The members requested a sketch and or historic photos, if available, showing the original and proposed chimneys. Motion to send forward to public hearing on September 6, 2018, Julia Celeste. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Cassie Bradley. Unanimously approved to move to public hearing with a site visit prior to the hearing. Ms. Catling read the disclosure information regarding the public hearing process and a copy of the disclosure was provided to the applicant.

~~**58 S. Summer St. (20D-145)** McCowatt, Brooks & Falotico/agent. Applicant proposes renovations and addition to existing guest house. Postponed until 9.23.18 at the request of the applicant. There will be a site visit prior to the meeting on 9.23.18~~

**Old/New Business:**

Court house entry roof: Bricque described the leaking flat roof over the entry and the need to repair the roof. The County Manager has made application for the repair that will provide a copper edge for the roof. There was no objection to admin. approval of the project as a maintenance request.

**Minutes 7.23.18:**

Motion to Approve, Cari Williamson. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Ken Magnuson. Unanimously Approved

Meeting Adjourned 5:19.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber  
Assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 9.23.18  
*Christopher Scott, Chairman*