

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~ Minutes

Thursday, July 12, 2018

Members in attendance: Susan Catling-Vice Chairman, Cari Williamson (A), Edith Blake, Cassie Bradley, Peter Rosbeck (A). Absent: Christopher Scott, Julia Celeste, Ken Magnuson. Staff: Bricque Garber

Vice Chairman, Susan Catling opened the meeting at 4:07.

Chris Seidel, MV Commission. Regarding: Historic Surveys & Forms. Christina Mankowski (summer intern with MVC) attended with Chris to discuss the forms. New PDF form will now be available to fill in on line. CD is available and was provided to Bricque. It was noted that it is partially prefilled note yellow areas. Questions were exchanged due to the preliminary field work. Susan asked about the schedule for completion. Christina walked the members through 3 slides to help provide a common understanding of characteristics. She provided an example of a preliminary house view she conducted with Adam Turner. She described the point system and how they arrived at the point score for the examples. Questions were asked and answered and examples drawn. Cari asked about historically significant structures with modern additions and the criteria were discussed. Bricque has the CD for dissemination and Chris Seidel will send a link for downloading new forms on machines without CD drives.

131 N. Water St. - Harbor View Hotel & Mayhew Bldg. (20B-107) Sean Murphy/agent. Changes to approved plans for the Hotel and Mayhew building.

Hotel: Sean Murphy described the changes and the reasoning for the newest changes. He described that the Ballroom as being increased to two stories. There are changes to railings and window & trim change, providing a more simple design on the South façade (spa side). The roof line on South is being bumped up to allow for headroom from the stairs. The view from Thayer St. shows a change of windows. Noting that the neighbors had noise concerns, the windows are being changed to be smaller and more simple. The members reviewed the planned changes. Window style and configuration were described. There was a question regarding what appear to be decorative panels. It was noted that the panels add to what is already a busy elevation. Sean Murphy was not sure about the panels as drawn and said he would get more information from the designers. Peter Rosbeck thinks the drawing may be illustrating a decorative fascia board. Sean offered to get more

info on the panels and the trim detail. The window changes as designed were of concern to members. Again, Mr. Murphy will discuss and clarify with the architects. Elevation # A-301 invited additional questions regarding the windows style and configurations. The commission asked that the ballroom side windows and trim detail to be further fleshed out. Pictures of the existing buildings were compared to the various changes and previous approvals. The roofline was discussed and reviewed with photos and plans. The #A-304 elevation was studied as to the roof lines and changes to the trim details. It was noted that the spa windows style should match what is on the ground.

The Mayhew (button factory) building plans were displayed. The changes to the North elevation includes removal of gables and roof lines changes resulting from projected cost issues. Thus it is proposed to keep the roof line as it is, very square. The end view Dormers are removed on A-302, wavy shingles in diamond window at top were added. A trellis was added to break up the large block of flat space. Most notable is the removal of the dormers. Windows were described as 6x6. Edith Blake noted that the side #A-301 looks like a dormitory the members concurred noting a preference for the changes as approved. There is a discussion about the dormers and possible corrections or additions that would break up the space. North elevation dormer may not be significant as it is not very visible. There was discussion about breaking up the roof line with a gable that does not carry down and/or maybe smaller faux dormer. Wavy shingles were discussed and not endorsed as a detail. The East elevation faces the hotel and Thayer Street. Susan asked why the windows on the East elevation have been eliminated? Sean noted his belief that this is because of the elevator location and noted that a trellis was added to break up the space. It was noted that it may be a good idea that the right hand side have a trellis, as well. Sean said the windows located in the middle are outside a hall way. Sean requested a continuance to confer with the designers and obtain a clearer picture as to windows & trims and will get answer about the elimination of the windows on the East side. Moved and 2nd to continue. Unanimously voted to continue to 7.26.18 with a site visit prior to the hearing at 3:30.

2 Pierce Lane (20D-77) Continued from 6.21.18. Lee & Julie Moncton.

Lil Province Design/agent. Applicant proposes changes to existing, unapproved, fencing. There was a site visit just prior to this hearing. Lil came to discuss the latest proposed changes from the previous meeting. The applicant would like to remove the 6 ft. fence and replace with a 4' fence in the same location as the current 6 ft. fence which is the subject of the violation. There was discussion regarding the side, stockade fence edge as was constructed on the property line. The edge of this fence was not built as approved. Cassie noted that the location and height of the fence vs. the swoop (as approved) of the side fence. It was noted that there is a large tree near the fence edge which may be impacted by adding another section of fence and the addition might affect the visibility at the corner.

Cassie discussed the removal of the illegal fence and construction of the 4 ft. metal, pool fence as was approved but added no objection to moving the 4" fence to the other side of the small porch, providing more space in the rear yard. Cari Williamson added a concept for raising the 4 ft fence as it would be built on the lower elevation and would not appear as tall. There was a continuing discussion regarding the location of the pool fence. It was

noted, in response to Ms. Province's question, that the HDC does not have purview over plantings and that the applicant may increase the privacy of the pool with shrubs or other plants. The agent for the applicant agreed to the removal of the existing fence and Allison Stearns, caretaker for the owners, concurred and noted that she had the authority to make the plan changes as described. Cassie Bradley made motion to remove the white board fence currently in violation and approve a 4' (four foot) black metal fence on the Pease's side of the small exit deck. Due to the location of a tree, the current stockade/board privacy fence can remain as it is without the extension of one section, swooping down, as was originally approved. Cari Williamson provided a 2nd. Unanimously approved.

113 Main St. (20D-12) Jane Chittick. Chris Royal/agent. Applicant proposes Six (6) new windows. Marc Lima from Norwood Windows described the new 6x6 windows. He noted that the windows will match the existing window configuration. The members reviewed the window specs and Mr. Lima provided a sample window for consideration. Windows are all wood with Simulated True Divided Light with factory installed Mullions. Motion to approve the new windows as presented Cari Williamson, 2nd Cassie Bradley. Approved

Minutes: 6.21.18 - Motion to approve the minutes Cassie Bradley. 2nd. Cari Williamson. Approved.

New Business:

Carole Berger has resigned from the commission. She will be sorely missed by this commission. Carol is one of the longest acting members of the EHDC and her expertise and thoughtful consideration of each application has been a huge asset to this commission. Carole was the primary author of the study report which resulted in the expansion of the Historic District. Carol is simply irreplaceable.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ 7.26.18
Susan Catling, Vice-Chairman