

# Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.  
Edgartown, MA 02539  
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

## ~Historic District Commission~ Minutes



Thursday, May 3, 2018

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott, Susan Catling, Edith Blake, Carole Berger, Cassie Bradley, Julia Celeste, Ken Magnuson. Staff: Bricque Garber

Christopher Scott opened the meeting at 4:05 PM and recused himself from hearing the first application.

**90 N. Water (20D-256)** – Nancy Monahan, TTE of D&N Realty Trust. Twanette Tharp & Pam Scott/agents. Applicant proposes restoration of the main house, reconstruction of connector wing; reconstruction of detached bedroom cottage into an open pool pavilion, renovation of garage into bedroom and storage; pool and fences. Pam Scott described the plans for the renovation of the house. The plan for the main structure is a pure historic restoration. The connector wing will be reconstructed in place. The 2002 addition will be painted. The current garage will become the guest bedroom. Current detached bedroom will become an open pool pavilion. No garage will be added. Pam Scott used story boards to illustrate the site plans. Photos and diagrams were displayed on the computer screen, as well. It was illustrated that the primary façade will be updated in kind, including the dentil molding, doors and windows. The foundation will be shored up using the existing partial basement. Materials will match existing, including shingles and paint colors. The existing basement will be renovated for the mechanicals. All current HVC units will be moved to the rear. The detached bedroom building will be reconfigured to be an open pavilion with a fireplace. There will be blue stone terrace. Existing garage is a salt box shape. The detached bedroom will have 2 French doors and will no longer be a garage. Marvin windows added will be clad/white, no foundation changes are needed as it is on slab. There are no shutters planned. There will be a code compliant pool fence. The secondary fences are not visible and will be dark green mesh within the privet. Pam displayed the chosen lighting is Vaughn (English). The proposed pool is relatively small with spa. The meeting was opened for questions. Susan asked how much of the project will be visible from N. Water. A: What is seen is a part of the 1978 addition. However, the addition will be removed and replaced with a simple connector. Pam illustrated the views from the public way. Twanette noted that very little is seen from N. Water on either side. The lot is only 50' wide. Discussion ensued. The history provided previous construction dates. The original house dates from 1740. Julia and Ken discussed the facades with Pam Scott. It was noted that the existing walls will not be pushed out. The existing foundation is rubble. All materials for the historic structure will be in-kind materials, including the

retention of current windows. New storm windows will be the only window work on the historic box. Ken noted some objection to the 6ft. pool fence, as it restricts the view to the rear of the property and noted that only a 4 foot fence is needed for pool compliance. Twanette wants the fence to be 4 ft. solid and 2 ft. lattice, for privacy. The peripheral wire fence will be buried within the privet and thus not be visible. There being no further questions the motion was made by Ken Magnuson to send the application forward for Public Hearing. Julia Celeste provided the 2<sup>nd</sup>. Unanimously approved for Public Hearing on June 7<sup>th</sup>, 2018 including a site visit prior to the hearing.

**51-55 North Water St. (20D-300) Kelley House LLC.** Scott Little/agent.

Applicant proposes to add wood profile, fiberglass gutters and copper downspouts. In an effort to move water away from the house the gutters and downspouts are proposed. There may be site work done after the season. There are hydrology issues which are impacting the foundation. The proposed gutter matches the Newes building, with a copper downspout. There is no plan to change the fascia boards. There was a discussion of the new gutter which will be complete as a new gutter and not joined to the old gutter. Motion to approve the addition of gutters as presented, Julia Celeste. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Susan Catling. Approved.

**49 Davis Lane (20D-135.1)** Gregg Jubin & Christian Aragona. Christopher Pagliaro/Agent. Applicant proposes an addition to the historic house and construction of new accessory building (cabana, garage, accessory bedroom) & pool. Mr. Pagliaro presented his plan for the renovation/addition to the historic building. Mr. Pagliaro presented the plans for additions and renovations to the Davis Academy and the addition of an accessory building inc. bedroom. He showed the proposed streetscape along Davis Lane. Proposing a wire fence inside a 5' privet for pool fencing. The chimney will be maintained but will not be a working chimney (the addition of a 2<sup>nd</sup> chimney for mechanicals as flue). The accessory building is planned as a scaled down Greek revival. They plan to replace all the windows with Marvin TDL. Trim all painted white and the shutters will be repaired or replaced if needed. There is a classic beading that will be retained. There was discussion about the windows mullions and the fence style. Siding to match existing and painted. Foundation will have a granite veneer. There are no gutters and new gutters are not planned. Mr. Pagliaro showed an aerial site plan showing pools located within the area.

Chris Scott noted that this is a very significant property and noted this plan is extensive, with a lot going on here, on a non-conforming lot. It was noted by the applicant that the Zoning Board review will be necessary. Mr. Scott explained that there is no prescribed sequence for hearing such an application and there was a history of the possible discrepancy of approval between the 2 boards. He suggested that the applicant may be better served by a move toward zoning first due to the planned pool and overall mass. Mr. Pagliaro said he understood the suggestion but would like to get some feedback from the HDC. Members agreed that a first move to ZBA may be most appropriate. Susan Catling asked for the % of ground coverage. A: Existing footprint is 1146 sq. ft. Proposed = 1491 sq. ft. (with addition) The accessory structure has 2 floors with attic space. Current lot

coverage is 20% the proposed coverage is 37%. The ridge height for the accessory building is 25'6". Main house ridge 31'9" and will stay the same. The addition has a planned ridge height of 28'9". Susan asked about the proposed addition of a chimney. A: The added chimney will create flue for mechanicals. Ken Magnuson asked about the property purchase and asked if the owners knew the house was in the Historic District when they purchased it. A: They did understand it is located in the Historic District.

The owner, Mr. Jubin, said that house is falling apart, noting that beetles have eaten much of the first floor. He said he is sensitive to the history and wants to restore the property. He said that water flows into the house through the foundation. Susan Catling noted there is a "special" sensitivity to this landmark house and sees the planned rear addition as quite contemporary. Ken Magnuson agreed. Mr. Jubin, noted that he is "not married" to the many windows in the rear of the house and would consider something less modern. He spoke to the need for the additional space and sees the garage structure is a mini-version of the main house. Mr. Jubin said that he wants to restore the house but wants more space. Susan Catling noted that the proposed dormers create a significant change to the look of historic home. The applicant noted that they have worked with a local architect in developing the plan and said that many houses in the area have shed dormers. Ken said that the dormers make a big change to the primary façades and Carole agreed. The applicant said that he had discussed, with a local architect, a 3 structure plan but thinks that this 2 structure plan is is better than a 3 structure approach.

There was a discussion regarding the size of the garage building. The front of the garage is planned as 12'6" the rest (rear) of the structure adds another 7' the whole building is 19' wide. Susan noted that the rear of the garage is wider than the existing house. Mr. Jubin told the commission that they had discussed the plan and design with Patrick Ahearn and that Mr. Ahearn provided guidance noting his HDC support. Mr. Jubin said that they have received support from a board member at the Gazette. Julia Celeste asked about the 2 balconies and if they would be accessed from the interior. A: Yes, the balconies will be accessible from the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor. Chris Scott noted that he understood that they want to have some separation from the Gazette building. However, the overall size of the buildings may create too much mass, when reviewed by the ZBA, as well as this board. Edith Blake said that she thought the plan is lovely but noted that her belief that these buildings are too large for the site. Motion to refer the application to ZBA, Julia Celeste. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Ken Magnuson. Unanimously voted to refer to ZBA.

Cassie Bradley had to leave the meeting. Minah Worley took her seat for the final application.

**63 Peases Pt. Way N. (20D-97) (20MVAH1 LLC.)** Mark Nicotera/agent. Applicant proposes changes to a ZBA approved plans including: 3 floor window design, column style & pergola. The history of the project was presented to the members by Bricque and Mark Nicotera. This project was never heard by the HDC. The approval from ZBA and subsequent issuance of a building permit, took place prior to the expansion of the HDC. This board is being asked to approve or disapprove changes to a plan that was not approved, by this board, to begin with. Mr. Scott noted his objection to this board making

any decisions regarding this plan. He suggested a referral to the building inspector if needed. Members noted that any disputes regarding the details of the plan, as approved, exist between the applicant and the architect, or the building department but not the HDC. Motion to decline a vote on this application given that the HDC has no jurisdiction

to approve changes to a ZBA approval, Ken Magnuson. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Voted to decline to vote on this application.

**New/Old Business:**

*\*May include matters not reasonably anticipated within 48 hours of meeting.*

- Yellow House update: Mr. Scott told the members that there was a YH meeting this week. Town attorneys, Ron Rappaport and Karen Burke appeared and discussed sketches and proposed changes to the RFP going forward. There were discussions about the lease terms and the Selectmen will meet to discuss the performance bond, parking spaces, and flexibility on dimensional changes and the protection of the tree roots. Items are on the next agenda for the Selectman.

**Minutes:** April 19, 2018

Motion to approve, Julia Celeste, 2<sup>nd</sup>, Susan Catling. Unanimously Approved.

The meeting was adjourned @ 6:07.

Respectfully submitted;

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 5.17.18  
*Christopher Scott, Chairman*