

# Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.  
Edgartown, MA 02539  
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

## ~Historic District Commission~ Minutes

Thursday, April 5, 2018



Members in attendance: Susan Catling, Carole Berger, Cassie Bradley, Julia Celeste, Edith Blake & Ken Magnuson. Absent: Christopher Scott. Staff: Bricque Garber

**Public Hearing: 72 Peases Point Way (20D-83)** Shepherd & Margo Murray. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes a 2 story addition to the main house, on the North side, replacing an existing covered porch. Susan Catling read the Public Hearing Notice. There was a site visit just prior to the hearing. Patrick Ahearn provided copies of the plans and the plans were displayed on the screen. He described the wing added 5 years ago and the plan to add a matching addition which is the same size as the previous addition on the south side of the historic box. He represented that the windows are different but the mass is the same. The program is to enlarge a kitchen and a porch. He described additions added over time and noted a 6 ft. fence and tall privet hedge. This is a large lot and all set backs are met. The total added footprint will be 264 sq. ft. Susan Catling, vice-chairman, asked the board for comments. Ken Magnuson, thinks the current house looks unfinished and would have preferred there was no addition 5 years ago, but at that time this property was not in the HD, and given what is there, he thinks the addition balances the house. Julia Celeste asked about the chimneys. Discussion ensued regarding the chimneys with Patrick agreeing to an addition of one chimney (total of 2). One chimney is shown and a 2<sup>nd</sup> will be added, with both to be elevated 6 ft. above the ridge line. Julia Celeste asked about the porch as drawn, “is it double decker?” A: Yes, it is two floors with access off the master bedroom. Edith Blake asked about the use of the property. A: Private residence. It was noted that a small section of the porch is visible from the public way, viewed at an angle. The front and side of the house are visible and the back of the house is not visible. The foundation will be brick and will be painted green, to match the existing addition. All building trim profiles, matching existing, will be composite material, brush painted. There being no public comment the Public Hearing was closed. Motion to approve with the addition of one (for a total of 2 chimneys to be elevated 6 feet above the ridge), Ken Magnuson. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Julia Celeste. Unanimously approved. Carole Berger noted that increased landscaping would be helpful here as the large hedge hides the front of the house.

**1 Pierce Lane (20D-80)** Sal Giordano. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes the construction of a new cabana. Mr. Ahearn reviewed plans of the proposed cabana and noted that it sits several feet below the level of the street. Patrick described the plan and noted the roof line will likely be visible from the street view. There was a review of the

plans and photographs. He noted that about 6 ft of the structure will be visible. He is unsure if any of the structure will be visible from Peases Pt. Susan asked the commissioners for comments: Cassie Bradley asked about the overall height. A: 12 ft. to the top of the ridge & the cupola adds an additional 3 feet. Julia asked about the green space and site plan was discussed as to the grass vs. hardscape. It was noted that this is a conforming lot and will not require ZBA approval. Ken Magnuson and Susan think that without the cupola this structure will not be very visible. Cassie agreed and a discussion ensued regarding the removal of the cupola from the design. Mr. Ahearn had no objection. Julia Celeste made a motion to approve the design conditioned on the removal of the cupola from the design. Ken Magnuson, 2<sup>nd</sup>. Approved as drawn, removing the cupola from the plan. Mr. Ahearn altered the plan to remove the cupola and initialed the changes.

**16 Pent Lane (20D-50)** Brad Jensen & Carolyn Blackwood. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes demolition of cottage and construction of a new 3 BR house & garage with detached bedroom & pool. Mr. Ahearn displayed the plans as well as the decision, in favor of the project, from the ZBA. He reviewed the ZBA decision and read from the decision noting that this is a new design as other designs for this location have been reviewed by this commission. He noted the need for clarification of this new plan. The members had the redlined versions of the decision ZBA. The recordings of proceedings of ZBA were read and reviewed by the members of the HDC. Mr. Ahearn specifically noted the comparison of lot coverage, pools and carriage houses in the area. He referred to conversations with Mr. Scott, not present at this hearing. Mr. Ahearn noted the concerns of the neighbors, referring again to the record of proceedings. Mr. Ahearn read from the HDC guidelines regarding new construction. He referenced the history of the property and read from the minutes of Oct. 4, 2016 regarding history and a notation regarding the need for ZBA approval. Mr. Ahearn, read from and referred to previous hearings for this property. He attributed information to Ms. Catling which was disputed by Ms. Catling. There was a reference to a previous commission member's guess that the original part of the cottage may have been a 'garden shed". Ms. Catling noted that there is no evidence that it was a garden shed. Mr. Ahearn referenced the comments of Robbie Hutchison from the Nov. 3<sup>rd</sup> minutes. MACRIS notes year built as 1940 noting no architectural style.

Moving to the presentation of plans as displayed on the screen and provided to the members, he illustrated the immediate neighborhood and the houses, out buildings and pools in the area. He also referenced other buildings, pools and outbuildings on substandard lots, with regard to lot coverage, displaying the neighborhood overview on the screen and on the plans. He noted the % of lot coverages for neighboring properties. Mr. Ahearn noted his analysis of the neighborhood and concerns of some neighbors, he said that there were some abutter concerns but many of the abutters provided their approval of the plans as submitted to ZBA. He noted that Agnes Williams (most closely impacted by the location of the pool) provided her support to the project.

Patrick showed the photos of the existing cottage and Susan noted that the assessor's records indicate dates of 1946 for the right side and 1952 for left side (with basement). The age of the middle part is undetermined. Mr. Ahearn documented, by photographic inventory all Pent Lane, illustrating the volume and scale of existing structures. The neighbor on the right ( Croteau ) has 1530 sq. ft. for a lot coverage of 29%. The proposed

project would have a 12 sq. ft. larger footprint and would result in a 34% lot coverage. They are proposing a 3 bedroom house, with a one car garage with detached bedroom above the garage. Plans and elevations displayed. It was noted that in the past, the concerns of abutters involved green space. Mr. Ahearn said that there is green space created with this plan, by moving the house away from the neighbor. Mr. Ahearn proposed that given these reasons and the history of the cottage, he believes this project is well developed for this property. He listed the materials proposed and noted this home mimics many of the farm houses in the district.

Susan began the commission's discussion with the demolition issue, noting that there was an early plan that used the existing building and asking Mr. Ahearn if his clients were aware the house was in the historic district when they purchased the house. He said that they did know and were aware of the bylaws and guidelines. With reference to a previous plan to move the existing home to the front of the lot, Patrick noted that neither the abutters, nor the commissioners were in favor of the moving of the building to the front of the lot. There was further discussion regarding the existing building. Patrick noted most houses in the HD are in the front of the lot with other out buildings in the rear. Susan noted that this building is not easily added to with subordinate structures. Commissioners agreed. Susan noted historical information indicating that this was a guest house at some time. Julia Celeste said she would like to see the retention of part of the existing structure and preservation of more of the green space. Patrick, noted the location of the proposed garage on the plan and noted that the existing structure does not meet current zoning setbacks. Cassie Bradley asked about a plan to repurpose part of the cottage as a detached bedroom rather than a new garage building. She said that she, too, would like to see the small cottage, across the lawn. She discussed the idea of a short front fence to allow a view of the cottage. There was discussion, including Mr. Ahearn and commission members, about how to repurpose the existing house as a renovation and restoration of the part of the existing building that is visible from the public way, versus a complete demolition. There was a further discussion regarding fence height and the requirements of pool fencing. The members noted their inclination toward a plan to retain part of the cottage. The loss of a garage in favor of the detached bedroom, preserving the street view of the cottage (right side of the cottage) was discussed as a favorable compromise. Mr. Ahearn, noting that this would have to be discussed with his clients, was not immediately opposed to the idea. Moving on the proposed new construction, Susan requested the members provide their opinions of the proposed new house. Carole Berger said she sees the new construction as respectful and noted it does not overwhelm the neighborhood. Susan Catling noted the size of the house is more consistent with surrounding structures on this size lot, than previous proposals, and other than the fence height has no objection to the new construction. Ken, Julia & Cassie saw no objection to the house but noted that a public hearing will be needed. Motion to continue for Public Hearing, Ken Magnuson, 2<sup>nd</sup> Julia Celeste. Unanimously approved for Public Hearing on May 3, 2018. The dates for mailing and publication, and any changes to the plans, were discussed with Mr. Ahearn.

**55 Cottage St. (20B-86.1)** Dick and Claire O'Hare. Sasha Robinson White/agent. Applicant proposes demolition of existing structure, alterations to existing foundation and construction of a new 4 bedroom home with attached garage and pool. Ken is recused

Sasha presented his plan for demolition for house built in 1986. It was not part of the HD when built. It is an oddly proportioned cape. Not historically appropriate to the town or streetscape. The HD began with the discussion of the demolition. Carole Berger noted she is familiar with the house which was built as a rental property noting it was not well built nor maintained, but noted the problem here is that they were built. Julia Celeste noted that it was an addition to the HDC (in the expansion) and was not built to any decent standard. Carole noted that there was no plan to use any of this house in the new plan. Cassie Bradley agrees that the house design and construction is not in keeping with most of the district. Susan Catling asked about the sq. ft. of the proposed new house, as presented to ZBA. Discussion ensued regarding the size of the plans as presented to the Commission and to ZBA. There was a removal of large dormers from the previous plan which reduced mass. Discussion ensued regarding the differences between the new plan and the plan as presented to ZBA. Sasha believes the issue with ZBA was overall mass. Susan noted the foot print has not changed from the ZBA hearing and perhaps ZBA should review this first. There was discussion about whether to refer back to ZBA. It was decided to keep the application for review noting it will have to be approved by ZBA, as well. There was discussion regarding the size of the house. Carole noted that she sees the house as massive and too large for the street. Cassie asked about the possibility of using the existing house.

The home owner, Mr. O'Hare, discussed the need for 4 bedrooms and could not see any way to add a bedroom with the existing house. It was noted that a 3<sup>rd</sup> floor was not agreeable to ZBA. He illustrated the lot coverage is 26 % with the current plan. Virtually all the neighboring lots have a coverage of 30%. Patrick Ahearn asked about interior ceiling heights and suggested some variation to the solid front, noting the differences between true scale and perceived scale. Susan noted the window styles might change the perception of the mass in the front of the building. Susan noted some concern about the left hand side porch, facing the street. Sasha noted that this deck is similar to other deck porches on N. Water St. Owner said that he can guarantee that there will be no future plan to enclose the porch. Julia noted there is no sidewalk on this side of the street. Susan asked about the proposed ridge height for the garage 21.6" 14 feet wide. Julia asked about the front setback. A: will remain as is approx. 20 ft. Susan questioned the height of the garage saying it looks out of proportion to the building. A: The 4th bedroom is above the garage with 3 bedrooms in the house. In addressing the rear side of the house, Susan Catling noted the rear of the house appears to be quite contemporary in style and is quite visible due to the corner location. Carole does not see the value of the style of the windows and window placement and she sees the porch on the side as out of balance with the house. Cassie noted that the rear side of the house appears less vertical. Noting that the white space of the front facade feels massive. Julia suggested the applicant provide pictures of similar houses for the public hearing as reference photos. Motion to send to public hearing. Julia Celeste. Carole Berger, 2<sup>nd</sup>. Approved for public hearing on May 3.

**74 N. Water St. (20D-243)** Sunderland Family Trust. Jim Shepherd/agent. Applicant proposes to remove and rebuild 2<sup>nd</sup> floor porch using a composite material, brush painted. Members reviewed the photographs of the existing decking. Motion to approve Ken Magnuson, 2<sup>nd</sup>, Julia Celeste. Approved.

**53 Main St. (20D-209)** Hall Department Store Realty Trust. Gwenn Bukowiec/agent. Applicant proposes a new Sunbrella awning (burgundy, black & white). The applicant did not attend the meeting. Members viewed samples of the proposed fabric. Motion to continue with guidance to the applicant regarding preference for a solid color id: dark green, black, dark blue, as the chosen pattern distracts from the architecture of the building. Ken Magnuson made a motion to continue, Julia Celeste 2<sup>nd</sup>. Approved to continue.

**New/Old Business:**

*\*May include matters not reasonably anticipated within 48 hours of meeting.*

**Minutes:** March 15, 2018 Motion to approve, Julia Celeste. 2<sup>nd</sup>, Carole Berger. Approved.

- 45 Cottage St. (Plan Review): Patrick Ahearn provided a change to an approved plan to address the visibility of a Cabana from a public way. Susan noted the changes of a cabana, side windows and roof from the application submitted to and approved by the HDC. Patrick documented, by photograph, the views of the cabana from the public way. It was noted the application did not note the cabana on the original application. Patrick noted that the cabana was on the plans but not the application as he did not see it as visible from the public way, saying that mistakes happen. There was discussion. Patrick suggested a change to enclose the rear of the cabana with lattice thus masking the visibility. Discussion ensued and members agreed that they did not want to see a solid lattice wall at the back of the carport. Patrick described why he didn't apply as he felt it was not visible from the public way and has completed an application to make a change to approved plan to add side windows, roofing and cabana. Motion to approve the changes as seen on the plan and described in the change to approved plan, application. Julia Celeste, Ken Magnuson 2<sup>nd</sup> Approved.
- Member review of ongoing HDC construction projects. Tabled until the next meeting.
- Annual Town Meeting will be held next Tuesday. The HDC has two warrant items. Both deal with listed exclusions in the bylaw. The HDC proposes to remove lighting as well as driveways, sidewalks & paths from the list of exclusions for review. Mr. Scott will speak to the proposed bylaw change at the meeting.
- Susan Catling: 9 Green, being reviewed by the MVC, has been sent to a public hearing. She encouraged members to attend the hearing.

Adjourned @ 7:15

Respectfully submitted:  
Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 4.19.18  
*Susan Catling, Vice-Chairman*