

Town of Edgartown
~Historic District Commission~
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St. Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

Historic District Commission
HDC Minutes

Thursday, November 21, 2019



Members in attendance: Susan Catling, Chairman, James Cisek (A), Peter Rosbeck, Cari Williamson, Ken Magnuson, Julia Celeste & Molly Costello. Absent: Chris Scott. Staff: Bricque Garber

Ms. Catling called the meeting to order at 4:07 and provided the public hearing procedures.

4:00 – Public Hearing: 38 Morse St. (20D-239) Adam Moran. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes to reconstruct existing rear wing with similar footprint, add dormers, windows, new front door, extend side porch, add porch at rear of main house. New garage door on existing carriage house, new windows and entry door. Add French doors to cabana & construct new pool. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. The Public Hearing Notice was read.

Mr. Ahearn made his presentation and provided plans. He noted this is an oversized lot with existing cottage with carriage house from 1978. Bottom is clapboard and upper is shingles. He compared existing with proposed elevations, noting extension of the porch and roof line and continuation of the existing fenestration. Questions from the members: Q: Julia, shingles? A: Shingles to be natural with white banding. Q: James - discussion of the roof. A: Molly - shutter color? A: Essex green. Molly - Did you consider the original red color. A: Maroon would be considered. No consensus that it is an important factor but it was noted that this is a one of a kind house and does not necessarily need to be Essex Green. The applicant said he will consider Maroon. Q: fence. A: wood. No other questions from members.

Hearing was opened for public input. There being no public comment or letters, Ms. Catling closed the public hearing. Member comments: Molly described a positive renovation in keeping the house. Cari noted that the restoration is appreciated. Susan said the plan is respectful to the house. James noted he appreciates the continuation of the original theme. Ken sees this as a good job. Peter said that he particularly likes the side elevation noting it creates a good balance. Julia appreciates the trees will be left undisturbed. Cari noted that this

house is very different and it is an asset to the street and the district. Motion to approve, Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Molly Costello. Unanimously Approved.

4:20 - Public Hearing: 12 Mattakesett Way (45-25) Town of Edgartown/Katama Airfield. Hal Findley/agent. Replace existing hanger with engineered corrugated metal building to maintain appearance of historic grass airfield. HDC approval required per 2018 warrant approval. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. The Public Hearing Notice was read. Cari appreciates that it will be rebuilt in the spirit of the iconic structure that it is. Molly was affirmative in her comments. James noted it has been a long haul to get there. Great. Ken and Peter noting their approval said that it is a good plan and the existing hanger is long overdue for renovation. Motion to approve, Peter Rosbeck . 2nd, Julia Celeste. Unanimously approved.

4:35 - Public Hearing: 8 Peases Pt Way S. (20D-19) Change to approved plan. Ettinger& Simpson. Hutker Architects -Matt Cramer/agent. Applicant proposes to shift the main house 2' east along Peases Pt. Way and 5' East towards Peases Pt. Way to the 20'property setback line. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. The Public Hearing Notice was read and presentation made noting the shift of the house will help to preserve the rear yard and trees. The front porch will be in the 20' setback with the house front wall at 20'. They will need to gain permission from Zoning, to move into the setback, by using the average of other setbacks on the street as a measure. Questions: About the generator? A: Not shown on the site plan as the location has not been decided yet.

Ms. Catling opened the Public Hearing. Jane Chittick, abutter, noted concerns about moving the house forward by 5 feet might allow for enough or almost enough empty room that may allow for the owners to subdivide the parcel. While the lot is not large enough to subdivide, even if completely vacant, she wondered if they could get permission from Zoning for such a subdivision and her thought was that if the house is not moved, it could not be sub-dividable. Chairman Catling explained that land division is not the purview of the HDC. The applicant explained that this idea was not considered.

There was no further comment nor letters, the Public Hearing was closed for member's consideration. Susan, noting the very sensitive restoration of the captain's house. She noted that the original house had been moved over but remaining at the original 12 ft. setback and the plan for the new house was approved at 20 ft., thus helping to create a prominence for the historic building. Lenny Jason had approved the move at the 12 ft. setback with a 20 ft. setback for the new house, which helped to set the old house as primary on the street and the new house as a bit subordinate, despite the large size of the new house, again noting the original idea was to make the historic house as prominent as it could be.

Discussion ensued. Julia noted concerns about the many changes to the plans over time and asked for clarification on the site plan. James, too, noted the great job with the historic house saying that moving forward gives the abutters in the rear some relief. Ken does not see the move as a big issue noting a few feet does not significantly change the subordination issue. Peter does not think the move changes the plans significantly and does not think the garage aka original house will appear as dominant, as the new house is so large. He, too, noted that he is uncomfortable with so many changes to the plans. Molly does not see this as a size or change of the building facades. Cari noted she sees the original plan is preferable and would like to see it stay as approved. Susan agrees. Motion to approve. Ken Magnuson, 2nd Molly Costello. Voting to approve: Ken, Molly, Peter & Julia. Opposed. Susan and Cari. Motion passes.

4:50 - Public Hearing: 55 School St. (20D-143.1) Schlagater change to approved plan. Steven Schlageter. Gerrett Conover/agent. Change to approved plan. Applicant proposes to move garage footprint forward 6 ft. and 5 ft. to the right (also moving the pool and pool house 5 ft to the right) to make the connector hall more functional and improve the covered porch space in the rear yard. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. The Public Hearing Notice was read. Gerrett Conover explained the reasons for moving the garage forward noting the garage is still 30 feet from the front property line but this move diminishes the size of the asphalt parking area and increases green space. The move to the right creates a bit more breathing room between the structures. Pool and pool house will move with the garage to keep the structures in line. The pool equipment will be moved to the previously approved location of the outdoor shower. Q: the only change in structure size is the connector piece. Q: James, pool equipment sound proofing. A: There will be an enclosed sound proof structure around pool equipment. Q: Peter, Just pool equipment or all mechanicals? A: Unknown at this time. Letters, in favor, were read from abutter's Polly and McCowatt.

Public hearing closed: Molly does not see that this is much different, doesn't change the structure and the pool equipment location does not affect the building facades. She sees no issue with the change. Cari and Susan noted that the shift is more aesthetically pleasing. James sees this as having no impact. Peter noted that the additional separation makes the garage more subordinate. Julia agreed. Motion to approve, Cari Williamson. 2nd, Peter Rosbeck. Unanimously Approved.

5:10 - Public Hearing: 30 Pierce Lane. 20B-38. Change to approved plan. BRJ Holdings. John G. Early/agent. Applicant proposes to add an in-ground 18x36' pool, fencing & 2 gates. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. The Public Hearing Notice was read. Al Mark made the presentation noting that the pool was sketched on the original approved plan but was not voted at the time the renovation was approved. He showed the location of the fence noting the entire back yard will be enclosed. He presented the gate design. He showed a photo of the house and

fencing , before construction, noting they will replicate what was there. Photographs were reviewed. It was noted that the pool equipment will be located behind the corner of the guest house and soundproofing has not been planned. Gate design submitted will be used for both entry points. It was noted that the pool equipment is presented in the set-back , which may not be permitted by Zoning, but for the purposes of HDC approval is not visible from the public way. There were no comments from the public nor letters read. Therefore, the public hearing was closed. After brief discussion Ken Magnuson made the motion to approve. 2nd, Peter Rosbeck. Unanimously Approved.

Old/New Business:

Calendar change: HDC Meetings for the month of January will be the 9th & 23rd.

Minutes 11.07.19.

Motion to approve the minutes Julia Celeste. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Unanimously Approved.

Respectfully submitted:
Bricque Garber

Approved: _____ 12.5.19