

Town of Edgartown

~Historic District Commission~

Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St. Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

Historic District Commission

HDC Minutes



Thursday, October 3, 2019

Members in attendance: Susan Catling-Vice Chairman, Ken Magnuson, Julia Celeste, Molly Costello, Cari Williamson & Peter Rosbeck. Absent: Christopher Scott & Cassie Bradley. Staff: Bricque Garber

Ms. Catling called the meeting to order at 4:06.

Public Hearing: 82 N. Summer St. (20D-91) Nancy Whipple. Chuck Sullivan/agent. Applicant proposes to add new side entry/mudroom, new accessory apartment addition to the rear, new front dormer, replace all windows, siding and roof shingles and pool. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. Ms. Catling read the Public Hearing Notice and explained the procedure for the public hearing. Mr. Sullivan presented the plans for the project and described the history of the bungalow style house. The applicant is proposing a one story addition on side with two story addition in the rear and a pool. Sq. ft. reduced from earlier proposals. He displayed photos of the house, plans inc. floor plans. 3D renderings were provided to the members, illustrating the look of the house after the changes. There is no garage on the property and the existing shed will be removed in favor of a new shed structure. The new addition plan is described as more subordinate to the house. The elevations were presented in contrast with the current elevations. The proposed addition has a ridge line 16 inches lower than the existing ridge line. The photo renderings were displayed. Materials will be consistent with the current structure. Mr. Sullivan completed his presentation. Commissioner questions: Pool equipment location? A: In the shed. Q: Where are the blue doors? A: Side doors, not front door.

Ms. Catling opened the hearing for public Comment. Speaking in favor Elizabeth Ward, neighbor.

Speaking in Opposition: Dan Larcosh, attorney representing abutters at 84 N. Summer, 80 N. Summer & 69 Peases Pt. Way (Mr. Kinde, present for the meeting, is owner of both 80 N. Summer and 69 Peases) asked for total of the proposed sq. footage. A: House-3,002 total living area. Footprint including decks is 2,229 shed 112. Mr. Larcosh noted this is almost double the sq. footage. He noted the abutter objection to the pool which “adds to the total area and could be a source of nuisance

for neighbors”. He further objected to the rear dormer windows, making for windows on both sides which will provide a view into neighboring bedrooms. He noted this is a very large house on a very small lot and parking is an issue for neighbors. Mr. Larcosh asked the commission to deny based upon Section 6 of the HDC bylaw saying this not appropriate due to the size.

Mr. Sullivan, in rebuttal, noted that this lot is bigger than the lots on either side of this property and that this is approximately the average amount of living space and lot coverage for the neighborhood. Mr. Sullivan further explained that there are 10 pools in the neighborhood and the houses on each side of this property are two story houses. This expansion, to the rear, extends into the open part of the lot. Mr. Sullivan provided picture to illustrate that the dormer windows do not look into the bedrooms of neighbors. Five letters of support were provided by neighbors and read.

There being no further comment, the Public Hearing was closed and the hearing opened to the members of the Commission for deliberation.

Susan Catling provided information, regarding bungalows in Edgartown, from the National Register. She noted that only 27 bungalows were built in the district and 6 have been demolished. She noted the importance of respecting various styles and architectural designs while keeping the homes livable. Ms. Catling sees that the HDC concerns have been met. Noting that the HDC comments and concerns have been addressed by Mr. Sullivan with the newest plan, Ken Magnuson agrees. Julia noted that the changes have made a considerable difference in making the additions more subordinate to the historic structure. Peter Rosbeck agreed, saying that the sq. footage does not decrease dramatically from the first plan but the mass definitely has been decreased. Cari said that the planned additions are much less intrusive, with this plan. Molly asked if the front façade might remain, as is, without the dormer. A: Head room and building code create a problem due the bungalow’s roof line. Mr. Sullivan said that they would not be able to build the master bedroom, per code, without the dormer. Ms. Costello said that the new plans pass our standard of review. Julia Celeste made the motion to approve. 2nd, Peter Rosbeck. Unanimously Approved.

Public Hearing: 29 Church St. (20D-115) Town of Edgartown - Vineyard Transit Authority. Angie Grant/agent. Applicant proposes: Brick pavers, granite pavers, brick seat-walls w/ down lighting & granite tops, wood pergola, wood covered seating area, light posts to match Main St. posts, H2O bubbler, covered walkway, new shade trees & landscaping along property line. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. Ms. Catling read the Public Hearing notice. Angie Grant made the presentation noting the desire to make the area more passenger friendly while new bus fleet can be charged. She noted a change from the

previous plan that swaps the location of the covered seating and pergola, due the set back. The pergola plan was presented as either wood left to weather or white washed, set against a gray and white painted building. She said that they are looking for the best solution to make it fit into the area and are open to suggestions. It was noted that the electrical equipment is the most unsightly part of the project. The electrical boxes may be wrapped with a type of plastic sheeting with graphics that would be of interest to bus riders and be attractive. It was suggested that wrapping the cabinets with recommendations for graphic design from the MV Museum or Vineyard Trust, may be a good way to approach this. Q: Fence style? A: not decided yet but open to suggestions. Q: wrap the boxes with what material? A: a plastic type wrap. Q: Can they be inside a structure? A: No, must have 4 feet air space surrounding area for work, per code. Q: Roof heights for additional structures? A: Not too high, current overhang on building approx. 9 ft.

Q: Have you considered doing this somewhere else, the bus charging part? Yes, but it is not a practical idea. Discussion ensued about other locations for charging buses. Angie said that no other location choice is operationally sound for many reasons, including operational costs and passenger considerations. There was a discussion regarding lighting including down lighting on benches. The current building lighting to stay as is and new light posts, matching those on Main St. will be added. The current light on the telephone-pole-light will be gone as the 2 of the wood telephone poles will be removed and the electric will be buried. Trees were discussed as some must be removed per the plan. Fencing was further discussed and it was noted that Stockade fencing is not preferred though 19 Church currently has a stockade fence at the driveway trash area. Ken asked about the heights of proposed structures. A: Any height is fine really we are looking for aesthetics to blend with the environment and provide some shade. The meeting was opened for Public comment and there being none, the Public Hearing was closed.

Commissioner's Deliberation: Peter Rosbeck asked for specific heights for pergola and covered walk-way before taking a vote, sees the wrapping of the large transformer boxes as something where the board should have more information and a more concrete plan. Julia Celeste agreed that the "wraps" should be seen before any approval & final plans including measurements are needed. Ken asked about the noise concerns regarding the charging. A: Much like the sound of a window air conditioner. Angie said they are open to ideas and want to be a good neighbor as well as increasing the comfort of users. Susan Catling agreed that the "wrap" details need to be considered for final approval. It is important to have the details of structures and graphics, said Cari Williamson and a discussion with the Trust and or Museum may be helpful in finalizing any plan. Molly Costello noted that the area is pretty bad now and the proposed changes are good but the plan is not complete. Motion to indefinitely postpone this application for further

information was made by Julia Celeste. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Unanimously approved to postpone.

65 N. Water St. (20D-293) Ed and Kathy Ludwig. John Thayer/agent. Applicant proposes to repair or replace porch columns in kind and addition of fence and gate, to match existing, across the front driveway. Mr. Thayer presented the plan to repair and replace. The existing will be replaced with the same materials. Mr. Thayer provided a drawing of the planned fence across the driveway and the new gate. Fence height to be approximately 33 inches. Julia asked about posts caps for the 4x4's A: if the posts are taller than the gate they will have a post caps. Julia motion to approve with the condition that the Posts (if taller than the fence gate) will have post caps. Ken Magnuson provided the 2nd. Unanimously Approved.

59 School St. (20D-146) Paul and Chari Polley. Conover Restorations/agent. Change to an approved plan. Applicant proposed to add a pool and pool cabana. Gerry Conover made the presentation for the addition of a pool to the project currently under construction. He provided a photo of a pool house that was built across the street as an example. Materials to match the approved materials list for the house renovations. The pool will be located behind the garage will not be very visible from the street. The site plan was reviewed. The planned black iron, 4 ft. pool fence location was reviewed. Pool equipment location is on the right side of the lot. The Polleys own the abutting property on the right. Motion to send to Public Hearing, Cari Williamson. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Approved for public hearing on November 7, 2019.

38 Morse St. (20D-239) Adam Moran. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes to reconstruct existing rear wing with similar footprint, add dormers, windows, new front door, extend side porch, add porch at rear of main house. New garage door on existing carriage house, new windows and entry door. Add French doors to cabana & construct new pool. Patrick made the presentation noting the property has access from Morse and from the rear of the property on a private lane. The '4 square' house with a porch was probably original. Plans and site plan were reviewed. Pool equipment will be next to the cabana. The lot is conforming. The character of the house will be maintained. Vote to send to public hearing. The house is an anomaly. It is unique in its strangeness. The fenestration as drawn is and improvement as it had been inappropriately changed over time. Susan asked about the bay window. Patrick said that there was a discussion with his client regarding the bay window and they are not wedded to the bay. Cari mentioned that the dormer on the north elevation, feels a bit out of place and that it might be more appropriate if the dormer replicates the one closer to the street. Discussion ensued. Ken asked about the ridge line height. Motion to send to public hearing Julia Celeste. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Unanimously approve to move forward to a Public Hearing and site visit. Date will be November 21, per request of the applicant.

117 Upper Main St. (20D-13) Sara Piazza. Chris Royal/agent. Applicant proposes to replace railings balusters, trim and decking to match existing. Chris Royal described the only change will be the decking material which will be mahogany. Motion to approve as presented, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Ken Magnuson.

Old/New Business:

Minutes 9.19.19: Could not be approved as the original quorum was not present.

Minutes 9.5.19: Motion to approve Cari Williamson. 2nd, Susan Catling. Unanimously Approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:27.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ 10.24.19
Susan Catlin -Vice Chairman