


Town of Edgartown
~Historic District Commission~
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St. Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

Historic District Commission
HDC Minutes 
Thursday, August 15, 2019

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott-Chairman, Susan Catling, Cassie Bradley, Ken Magnuson, Molly Costello (A), Cari Williamson & Julia Celeste. Staff: Bricque Garber.

Chairman Scott called the meeting to order at 4:03 PM.

PHearing: 82 N. Summer St. (20D-91) Nancy Whipple. Chuck Sullivan/agent. Applicant proposes to add new side entry/mudroom, new accessory apartment addition to the rear, new front dormer, replace all windows, siding and roof shingles. There was a site visit prior to this hearing. Chairman Scott read the Public Hearing Notice and explained the procedures for the Public Hearing. Chuck provided a brief history of the property noting that much of the house is original. The site plan shows the proposed additions, pool, shed, hardscape and utilities. Chuck displayed the plans on the screen noting the location on Summer St. near Morse St. The proposed accessory apartment is in the rear of the eastern side of the property. Proposed addition will match the existing construction materials. Q: Height of the addition. A: Lower than the main roof. Main roof is 25' addition is 23' or approx 18" lower than the main roof. Q: Chimney is 2nd chimney going away? A: Chimney on the rear is removed and front chimney remains. Q: lot coverage? A: 50-55% including the hardscape, pool. Q: Tree to come down? A: Large tree in the rear will remain if possible. The spruce will be removed to allow for the walkway. 1/2 of the Spruce was previously removed. Q: Sq. footage? A: Currently 1820 sq. ft., new total 3324 sq.ft. Q: Street fence to remain? A: yes.

Opened for a public input: In Favor: There were no attendees or letters. In Opposition: Dan Larkosh, Attorney representing 3 abutters (Bulman, Bonventre & Kende) spoke saying that his clients would support a more modest proposal. He noted that this proposal doubles the sq. ft., per the Edgartown Assessor's records. These 3 abutters view the additions as overbuilt and think this dwarfs other homes in the area on undersize lots. Mr. Larkosh said that there is specific opposition to the pool and questioned the location of pool equipment. Mr. Larkosh asked the HDC to deny the application per section 6 of the HDC bylaw. Mr. Larkosh voiced his client's opinion that this will become a rental property. The owner of the property said that this property will not be used as a rental. Mr. Scott noted that the HDC does not consider use in making decisions. Mr. Sullivan noted that this

application is scheduled for review by the ZBA on August 21st. Mr. Scott, explained that there is often an overlap between ZBA and HDC, in hearing and making decisions on applications. He wondered if, in this instance, it would best serve the applicant to have ZBA review first. Members discussed and noted the prudence of going to ZBA first. There being no further comment, the Public Hearing was closed.

Discussion ensued, regarding massing, swimming pool and the value of the HDC reviewing the construction details if there may be any zoning issues, which may necessitate changes. Julia Celeste noted her concern about removing trees and the height of the dormer part of the addition, noting the dormer is of great visual impact. She sees no issue with the mud room addition but sees overall mass as concerning. Ken Magnuson agrees that the addition is very big. Molly Costello would like to see both chimneys retained. She further noted that the size and shape of the addition creates a very large structure. Susan Catling and Cari Williamson are likewise concerned with the shape and mass. Cassie Bradley, too, is concerned with the size and wondered if there is a reconfiguration that would work better? Chris Scott noted that additions to historic homes should be subordinate and the overall size of this addition is concerning. Mr. Sullivan would like to withdraw and resubmit after ZBA approval is obtained. Motion to allow the withdrawal of the application, Susan Catling. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Unanimously approved to withdraw.

Public Hearing: 92 South Water St. (29B-11.21) Continued from 6.20.19.

Nancy & Stephen Donovan. Patrick Ahearn/Agent. Applicant proposes demolition of existing 1970's house and construction of a new house, carriage house, guest house & pool. (Molly Costello, alternate for Peter Rosbeck, was not sitting at the beginning of the Public Hearing and is recused from this continuation). Chairman Scott read the Public Hearing Notice and explained the HDC procedures for the Hearing. Mr. Scott brought everyone up to date and reviewed the hearing for this project as there have been 2 continuations to the public hearing.

Mr. Ahearn provided plan copies with changes to the drawings, which accommodate some neighbor concerns. He explained the discussions with the Donovans and the thoughtful changes that they have made.

The primary façade of the main house has been simplified and the 3 dormers are smaller than originally proposed (option C). The dormer configuration and sizes were a topic of much discussion at the previous hearing. The applicant prefers this façade for the house. (2 other options were viewed.)

The drawings of the revised plans for the 2 outbuildings were reviewed. The garage, with living space above, is smaller in volume, more simple in style and thus becomes more secondary to the primary structure. It is a shingled building that will weather to gray. They have eliminated the gambrel roofs, cupola and trims as were

originally proposed. The guest cottage has, likewise, been redesigned to eliminate the gambrel style roof and adornments. The current plan shows this building as a more simply designed.

In opening the hearing to the public, Mr. Scott noted the “full room”, the number of letters received & reviewed and the many comments heard at the last meeting. Mr. Scott asked attendees to avoid reiterating previous comments and asked the abutters to limit the remarks to new or previously unheard concerns. Mr. Bradbury said that he feels a great deal has been done to alleviate his concerns. He remains concerned about the number of bedrooms, but understands that the interior plans are outside of the purview of the HDC. Steve Brown asked about the planned location for the pool mechanicals. A: inside the carriage house. John Tankard thinks there has been much accommodation in providing a quieter design. Sarah Jane Hughes asked about the inclusion of a 3 bay garage and still has concerns about overall mass but appreciates the work that has been done since the original plans were submitted. There being no further comment, Mr. Scott closed the public hearing.

Julia Celeste asked if the doors are painted white? A: Garage and front door will be Essex green all else to be white. All fencing has been previously approved. Chris Scott commended the applicant, the architect, the neighbors and abutters. The close review, concerns, suggestions and flexibility of all concerned parties have created a project that is clearly better for it. Christopher Scott discussed the HDC guideline regarding 3 bay garages which are described as inappropriate in Historic Districts. Mr. Scott noted his interpretation that this guideline rejects any view of a 3 bay garage within the District. But, said Mr. Scott, in this case, much of the garage is behind the house and is mostly not visible from the sidewalk. Thus, he does not see this garage as in conflict with clear intent of the guidelines. Julia Celeste noted her belief that this 3 bay garage is inappropriate per the HDC guidelines, although only moderately visible.

Ken Magnuson concurs that the changes to these plans have created a new plan that is simpler and better. Cari Williamson noted that the simplified plan will fit in better in the streetscape. Cassie Bradley sees that the work done on the plans makes the house more fitting on the street but still sees it as very large. Susan Catling noted the small dormers help to display the look of “an attic” and she finds the current plan fits better on the street and in the neighborhood. There being no further discussion, Mr. Scott made a motion to approve the plans as submitted with the primary façade being Option C. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Voting to approve: Ken Magnuson, Christopher Scott, Cassie Bradley, Susan Catling, Cari Williamson. Opposed: Julia opposed. The motion passes. The plans were approved.

4:40 - 56 N. Water St. (20D-226) RJH Realty Trust. Edgartown Inn. Chuck Sullivan/agent. Applicant proposes to remove and rebuild back building on lot

within the same footprint. Chuck presented the plans and discussed the reasoning behind the plans as drawn. He noted that this plan must go to ZBA for approval. Chuck said that the Assessor records show this building as dating from 1940. Chris Scott polled the members regarding a Public Hearing for this application as it is at least 80 years old and members concurred that a Public Hearing is warranted. Motion to send to Public Hearing, Chris Scott. 2nd, Susan Catling. Unanimously approved to send to Public Hearing on 9.19.19.

4:50 – 144 S. Water St. (29A-61.1) Nicholas Stiassni. Rick Serpa/agent. Applicant proposes to replace 11 windows (Marvin Integrity), 2 wood doors (Simpson), cedar sidewalls; all to match existing. The house is old and needs updating. It was noted that the roof was replaced 3 years ago. Mr. Serpa noted that the windows are failing. All windows will match existing configuration. The screen door will be removed on the front of the house. Members do not see a need for a Public Hearing. Motion to approve Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Julia Celeste. Unanimously approved.

5:00 - 41 Winter St. (20D-218) Edward Kuchinski. Hilary Grannis/agent. Applicant proposes to add a 207 sq. ft. addition and add basement under existing house. Hilary showed the site plan and displayed pictures noting that the house is on a fieldstone foundation and the addition will have a fieldstone veneer. There will be no change to the front of the house The new basement will be dug under the house without lifting the house. Hilary noted that the only change to the Summer St. side is the removal of the screen door. While the addition is small, given the location, members see a Public Hearing as appropriate. Motion to send to a Public hearing, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Cari Williamson. Approved for Public Hearing on Sept 19, 2019.

Old/New Business:

Minutes 7.25.19: Motion to approve, Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Cassie Bradley. Unanimously approved.

Bricque will be away on October 17th. Therefore the members voted to change the October meeting schedule to October 3rd and 24th.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:35.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ September 5, 2019

Christopher Scott, Chairman