

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~

Minutes



Thursday, June 6, 2019

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott-Chairman, Susan Catling, Cari Williamson, Molly Costello (A), Ken Magnuson. Chairman Scott called the meeting to order at 4:03.

4:00 - PUBLIC HEARING: 28 High St. (29-B-1.2) & 86 S. Summer St. (29-B-1.1) Michael L. Herschfeld. Sean Buckley/agent. Solar installations on 2 buildings. Mr. Scott read the Public Hearing Notice. There was a site visit prior to this hearing. Mr. Buckley made the presentation to the Commission noting that the properties are abutting and have common ownership. Mr. Buckley showed pictures of the property and illustrated the location and limited visibility of the proposed solar installation. Chris Scott opened the hearing to the board for questions. No questions from the members. Mr. Scott opened the hearing to the public. Mr. Taylor, abutter, asked when the project will be completed. Mr. Buckley replied that they hope to be done by June 22. He said that after the panels are received the time on the roof should be less than a week, and the 2nd house will be done a couple weeks after the first installation. There were no further questions from the public; Mr. Scott closed the Public Hearing.

Ken Magnuson, noting the potential conflict between solar panels and visible impact in the district, noted that these panels seem to display a minimal impact. He further noted that there are currently panels on one roof, which precedes the expansion of the district. Susan Catling agreed. Cari Williamson does not see a big visual impact and Molly Costello agreed noting the flush mount and color that matches the roof. Susan Catling made a motion to approve. 2nd, Cari Williamson. Unanimously approved.

4:20 - PUBLIC HEARING: 2 Pierce Lane (20D-77) THC LLC. South Mountain - John Guadagno/agent. Applicant proposes to add solar array consisting of 30 black solar modules. Mr. Scott read the Public Hearing Notice. There was a site visit prior to this hearing. Mr. Guadagno made the presentation to the Commission. Panels are proposed to be added to 2 dormers which are visible from the public way. The panels will be black. Cari Williamson, noting the visibility asked about the location of panels on the dormers and asked if just one dormer is enough to provide the solar power needed. Mr. Guadagno said that panels on 2 dormers will not quite cover the energy use for the house and 1 dormer would be insufficient. He said the planned installation does not propose extra collection. He noted that the applicant understands the panels are visible and proposed the dormers, for installation, as a nod to the aesthetic look. The roof is asphalt. Mr. Scott opened the hearing for public comment. There being none, the commissioners discussed the application. Ken Magnuson noted again the

conflict of panels in the district, said that this installation is more visible, on an important street, than the previous application. Susan Catling, as well, noted her concern about visibility and asked if there could be a ground mounted system. The applicant said there is not enough space on the ground and the roof is the only choice for location. Chris Scott, noting that all are supportive of solar power, recognizes the concerns. Cari Williamson noted that she is bit 'on the fence' here due to visibility and would be more comfortable with one dormer to reduce the visual impact. Molly Costello asked about age of the house. A: mid 1800's renovated 3-4 years ago. Mr. Guadagno described "flush mounted" as 4-5 inches racking matching the roof color. There was further discussion regarding the visibility and it was explained to the applicant that there are 5 members in attendance and that the application requires approval of 4 commissioners for approval. While it is not certain that the panel for the next meeting will be larger, Mr. Guadagno requested to postpone hearing on this application. Motion to continue Ken Magnuson. Susan Catling provided the 2nd. Approved to continue.

4:40 – 49 Davis Lane. Gregg Jubin & Cristina Aragona. Christopher Pagliaro/agent. Applicant proposes to construct a 2 story addition, add 2 shed dormers, replace windows, roof, siding, trim and construct a new fence and improved parking area. Mr. Pagliaro described the project as proposed noting that the ZBA has approved the project. He said that the addition on the corner is not visible from School St. and there is limited visibility from Davis Lane. The dormers have been proposed in order to obtain headroom and usable space. The dormers are small in size and are tucked back as far as possible. They want to move the current parking area closer to the Gazette building to allow for more garden space. He reviewed the elevations. The trim package will match the existing house. Mr. Pagliaro noted that at 60 Davis lane there was another schoolhouse with a series of additions that likely happened over time. This project proposes 332 sq. ft. footprint addition.

Noting it is a corner lot with visibility on two important streets, Ken asked about the balconies and if there are there access doors. A: Yes. Mr. Pagliaro explained the addition's ridge is lowered by 30+ inches from the original house. Q: Ken asked about the materials proposed for the dormer siding? A: it is proposed as a solid but could be clapboard. Chris Scott noted that similar shed dormers have been approved in the district and additions have been approved when appropriate in scale, subordinate to the historic home and appropriate for the street and neighborhood. Mr. Scott noted that this building is architecturally rich and is a very historic and iconic structure. Q: Ken asked about why they are moving the chimney. A: It is currently in an awkward location. Susan expressed that addition feels cohesive and flows nicely but the SE elevation seems "a bit out off kilter" and there is a lot of glass on the SE side. Ken agreed. There was discussion regarding the upper door and railing which if removed, may be cleaner. Cari also addressed the two railings. There was a discussion regarding bay window and the location of the two chimneys. Motion to send this application forward to a Public Hearing on July 11, 2019 with a site visit prior to the hearing, Ken Magnuson, 2nd Chris Scott. Approved for public hearing. After this discussion Mr. Pagliaro will make a few changes to the plans and provide updated plans.

5:00 – 66 N. Water St. (20D-233) Murrell. Norman Rankow/agent. Applicant proposes the construction of a 6' temporary board fence, painted green. Juliette Mulinare, from Mr. Rankow's office explained that the construction must be continued until the spring and this fence will provide a visual barrier to the construction, which has begun. There was a discussion of the proposed calendar for the temporary fencing. Motion to approve Temporary 6' board fence painted green, Columbus Day, 2019, Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Susan Catling. Approved.

5:10 – 73 N. Water St. (20D-289) Brian Mann. Applicant proposes the addition of a pool & bluestone pool deck, 4' pool fencing, 6 ft. fencing at parking area and rear of property, 15" brick retaining wall at the edge of the pool deck. Mr. Mann appeared to describe the application for pool, patio and fencing. It was noted that this application for the pool and fencing must be approved by the conservation commission which will require a public hearing. Mr. Mann was offered the opportunity to continue for a larger commission. He said that he wants to move forward and asked for commission input. Mr. Mann made his presentation: Along Morse St, the fence proposed is a 4 ft. picket in compliance with pool fencing requirements. He proposes a 4 ft solid inboard fence but willing to adapt the style to picket if requested by the Commission. The pool/picket fence will swoop up to 6 feet at the property line with abutter. He noted that the house is quite visible with the 4 ft. picket fence. The pickets will be spaced at 1 ¼ to be in compliance with building code. Mr. Mann showed an old photo of the corner depicting a taller fence, in the past. The application proposes a 15" retaining wall at the edge of the patio. The wall will be flush with the lawn in the view from N. Water. He likes stacked stone for the retaining wall but will use brick if preferred. Mr. Mann showed a few pool pictures from the area. He noted that he has abandoned the idea of adding a garage. Opened for questions from the members, Ken Magnuson asked for picket fence rather than solid fence inbound to the house. Molly noted that the fence along Morse is shown as 4 ft. per code for pool enclosure. The hearing was opened to the Public for comment. Ms. Casavant, attorney for the abutter, Ms. Tharp, made reference to the HDC Guidelines regarding pools and provided arguments for denial of the pool. There being no further comment, the Public Hearing was closed.

Chris Scott noted that this board has not historically exercised jurisdiction over swimming pools. There was a discussion of Bylaws and Guidelines. It was noted that in the past most pools were reviewed by the ZBA for non-conforming lots and/or were not visible from a public way as pools are usually proposed behind the house. Chris noted that Ms. Casavant, attorney for the abutter, Ms. Tharp, made reference to the HDC Guidelines regarding pools noting her interpretation that that the HDC has jurisdiction over appropriateness of pools. It was noted that the most current change to the bylaw addresses driveways, walkways and decks, essentially at grade and as such this pool is reviewable. Mr. Scott reiterated that this pool & deck is a more unusual than most pools, given the shape of the lot and proposed proximity to the sidewalk and visibility from public ways. Notwithstanding the Public Hearing that will be required by the Conservation Commission, Mr. Scott recommended that this application be sent

forward for a Public Hearing and site visit. Motion to send to public hearing, Mr. Scott. 2nd, Susan Catling. Unanimously approved for Public Hearing on 7.11.19.

New/Old Business:

Minutes 5.16.19 The minutes could not be voted for approval as there was not a quorum, from 5.16.19, present.

Alternate: James Cisek was the only applicant for the Alternate position advertised last month. James Cisek was a long time member of the Commission and served as the Chairman for many years. The members voted unanimously to recommend Mr. Cisek's appointment as an alternate to the HDC.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber
Assistant

Approved: _____ 6.20.19
Christopher Scott, Chairman