

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~

Minutes



Thursday, May 16, 2019

Members in attendance: Susan Catling-Vice Chairman, Cari Williamson, Julia Celeste, Cassie Bradley & Molly Costello (A). Absent: Christopher Scott, Peter Rosbeck & Ken Magnuson. Staff: Bricque Garber

Susan Catling, Vice-Chairman, called the meeting to order at 4:06 PM.

4:00 - PUBLIC HEARING: 73 N. Water Street (20D-289) Postponed from 5.16.19 Brian Mann. Applicant proposes to modify and/or add new privacy fencing and new brick patio. Fence to be painted white on the outside. Ms. Catling read the Public Hearing Notice. Mr. Mann presented his plan for the proposed fence. He described the various heights of the fencing proposed. He noted that the proposal is for white but he is not wedded to any particular color or style. The fence across the front is 5' for yard privacy from pedestrians on Water St. Mr. Mann asserted that the town norm is for 6 ft. fences in many places and he displayed several pictures taken throughout the district saying that these examples present the reasoning for his proposed fence. Members had copies of the site plan color-coded to illustrate the proposed fence heights and locations. He described the fence along Morse St. as 6' to provide privacy for the house and yard. Mr. Mann said that this fence will start at 5' and will transition to 6 ft. along Morse. Mrs. Mann discussed her need for privacy saying people can see into her house. Julia asked for a description of all fencing proposed, in all locations, which was given. Mr. Mann said that gate will be simple and there will be black hardware. The meeting was opened to the public for comment: Sam Stancati spoke in favor of the fence saying he is a neighbor but not an abutter. He noted that at a visit to the house there were people peering into the house through the windows. Opposed: Twanette Tharp presented and read a letter, outlining her reasons for opposing the fence. Ms. Tharp said that hedges and other plantings can provide privacy without a solid fence. There were no additional comments from the public but a letter read to the commissioners requesting denial from Michelle Casavant, attorney for abutter Tharp.

Mrs. Mann spoke to say the Tharp objection is biased. Mrs. Mann said that she suffers from the lack of privacy. She is uncomfortable and it is ridiculous that she should not have to beg for privacy.

Mr. Mann noted that he recognizes that the fence and the brick patio will need to go to the Conservation Commission for review and approval. He said that he does not see his backyard as open space. There being no further public comment, Ms. Catling closed the public hearing.

The members, in discussing the proposed fence, noted the visibility of the fence and the view obstruction. Cassie sees that hedges can provide privacy and she does not see the solid fencing as necessary, noting that a solid fence will distract from the current view and streetscape. Susan Catling, noting the location of the house, two primary street views and the iconic streetscape said that the HDC is concerned with the architecture and locations of proposed fencing, saying that this high fencing is inconsistent for this location. She further noted that neighbor's fencing is not a precedent for any current decisions. Fencing on the ground may have been approved by a prior commission or may have been in place prior to the formation of the HDC. Noting Mr. Mann's contention that there are other such fences in the Historic District and thus he should be able to build the proposed fence, Ms. Catling invited the Manns to view the HDC rather like the Supreme Court. Over time, justices change and so do opinions. The current Commission is viewing this application as unique and this location is quite different than other fence locations given it's a corner lot with two exclusive street views. Susan further described the importance of N. Water and Morse Streets for walkers in Edgartown, noting the tall fence will block a water view. Molly Costello, explained that the HDC is not a court of law and that privacy concerns and other people's fences are irrelevant. The guidelines are specific as to fencing. Julia notes that while privacy is not relevant for this proposed structure, such concerns can be resolved with plantings, further noting that his proposal is clearly in contrast with the HDC guidelines. Susan Catling read from the guidelines, regarding fencing. Cari Williamson concurs with Susan and Molly, noting that this is in the heart of Historic Edgartown and the fence does not contribute but would rather detract from the streetscape. Julia Celeste made a motion to deny the application as presented, based on the height of the fence and the view restriction on two public ways. Susan Catling provided a 2nd. The vote to deny the application is unanimous and the application is denied.

4:20 - 41 South Water St. (20D-326) Reed & DeFeo Frigoletto. Patrick Ahearn/Agent. Change to plans approved in 2009. Applicant proposed modifications: Window configuration, add cupola to garage, change front door and detail on garage door, adjust ridge height on connector, change porch steps and railing and change chimney configuration. Patrick made the presentation for the changes to a previously approved plan. This application makes changes to the plan that was approved in 2009. The footprint and location of the house will remain. The changes requested are showing in comparison to the previously approved plan. Patrick described the changes one elevation at a time. He noted that the mass and scale & footprint do not change. He said that the changes are fairly subtle and are better solutions than what was previously approved. He noted that the plans had been previously approved by the Conservation Commission. There was a discussion and members found that the proposed changes provide a better balance than the previously

approved plans. No public hearing was proposed. Motion to approve the changes, Cassie Bradley. 2nd, Molly Costello. Changes unanimously approved.

4:45 - 92 South Water St. (29B-11.21) Stephen & Nancy Donovan. Good Neighbor Fence/David Dutton/Agent. Applicant proposes to construct a 6 ft. fence in the rear yard. The video depicting the rear yard was shown on the screen and members discussed the visibility of the fence from any public way and found that the view is minimal. Mr. Dutton proposed a 6 ft. solid board fence. Julia asked about the neighboring fencing and Mr. Dutton provided the neighboring fence design. Julia asked about a lattice top fence as an alternative fence style, with approx. 18” of lattice above the solid fencing. Mrs. Donovan was in attendance and said she does not object to the lattice topped fence. Molly Costello said that this fencing, in this location, does not prevent views from a public way and is appropriate in the proposed location. Motion to approve with lattice top, Julia Celeste Molly Costello provided the 2nd. Unanimously Approved.

5:00 - 92 South Water St. (29B-11.21) Stephen Donovan. Patrick Ahearn/Agent. Applicant proposes demolition of existing 1970’s house and construction of a new house, carriage house, guest house & pool. Patrick introduced the applicant, Mrs. Nancy Donovan. He described the parcel as one of the largest in the district as it is over 20,000 sq. ft. Mr. Ahearn told the members that the existing house was built in 1975 and is set back from the street 29 ft. The current site plan, for the new house, illustrates a setback of 34’2” from the street to align itself with the neighboring Gibson House, which was renovated a few years ago. The proposed lot coverage of this lot is 23.5%. Mr. Ahearn is proposing a shingled Federal Colonial house. Patrick displayed renderings of the plan and noted what parts can be seen from a public way. Commissioner Comments: Cari Williamson, noting the size of the lot, appreciates that this exhibits a relatively modest lot coverage. Julia Celeste asked about the preservation of the existing structure noting the difference between the size of the existing house and the proposed new home. Patrick said that the current ranch house was built 1975 and has no historic value. Further discussion illustrated the need for a public hearing as it was noted that this presentation is extensive and will require time to review. Motion to schedule a public hearing on June 20, 2019 with a site visit prior to the hearing, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Molly Costello. Voted to send to Public Hearing. Mr. Ahearn agreed to stake the boundaries of the proposed structures for the site visit.

5:15 - 38 Simpsons Lane (20D-220.2) Todd Bremmer. Miller’s Professional/agent. Applicant proposes to change the driveway/parking apron by removing the brick and replacing with pea stone, cobbles and brick walk way & bluestone stoop. Mr. Barbosa described the changes proposed hardscape at the front of the house and removal of the existing 3 ft. Edgartown picket fence in favor of arborvitae. Molly Costello noted the removal of the fence is in opposition to the Guidelines. Motion to approve, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Cassie Bradley. Voting to approve: Susan Catling, Julia Celeste, Cassie Bradley & Cari Williamson. Opposed, Molly Costello. The application is approved.

5:30 - 86 School St. (20C-199) Green Shand Lathrop, TRS. Berluti/buyer/applicant. Chuck Sullivan/agent. Renovation & addition to existing primary residence. Photos and drawings were provided. The history is not complete but the belief is a construction date of

approximately 1910 given the maps reviewed and the style of the construction. There is an addition to the house which is believed to be a 50's addition. Chuck noted a collection of low additions. A portion of the low structure will be removed and rebuilt but will remain one story. The plans were displayed showing the existing facades and proposed changes. The fence will be replaced with a similar but nicer fencing. The front and High St façade will remain the same. The roof overhangs will be extended as the overhang may have been removed in the past. Chuck went through the plans and described each elevation., including a change to doors and windows. Noting that there is no foundation under the historic house, he said it will need a new foundation. There is a variety of window ages and styles in the house. Chuck Sullivan noted that there are no materials changes proposed for the historic house. Further discussion illustrated the need for a public hearing. Motion to schedule a public hearing on June 20, 2019 with a site visit prior to the hearing, Susan Catling. 2nd, Julia Celeste. Voted to send to public hearing with a site visit prior to the hearing.

Old/New Business:

Bricque updated the commissioners on ongoing legal matters

Minutes: May 2, 2019

Motion to approve. Julia Celeste. 2nd, Cari Williamson. Unanimously approved.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ 6.6.19
Susan Catling - Vice-Chairman