

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~



Minutes ~ March 21, 2019

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott, Susan Catling, Cari Williamson (A), Ken Magnuson, Peter Rosbeck. Absent: Cassie Bradley, Edith Blake & Julia Celeste.
Staff: Bricque Garber.

Chairman Scott opened the meeting at 4:11 PM.

18 Pent Lane (20D-49) David and Mary Ellen Croteau. Applicant proposes to add brick sidewalk, replace asphalt walkway at front door with brick, replace shutters, replace window boxes, new copper gutters and downspouts, replace fencing, replace dormer shingles, paint door, new screening for outdoor shower, new roofing shingles & storm doors. Mary Ellen Croteau provided pictures of the house noting that there are currently 4 types of shutters on the building. Members noted that most of the items on the list are minor changes to the building and site to clean up the various issues that have been created over time and replace with more historically accurate materials. Fencing was discussed and the shingles on the dormers which are currently only partly painted. Composite shutters are proposed. Christopher Scott discussed the long list as primarily maintenance. Members noted that this will not require a Public Hearing. It was noted, by Ms. Catling that this work will create improvements to the existing structure. Motion to approve as submitted, Peter Rosbeck. Ken Magnuson provided the 2nd. Unanimously Approved.

68 School Street (20-D-24.2) Lonna Wais. Brooks & Falotico-Chuck Wollette /agent. Applicant proposes to extend existing covered porch and move columns. Replace existing screened porch and deck above with a 4 season room, skylight and deck above. There was a site visit prior to the meeting. Ken discussed his arms length association with the partner of the owner but does not have a conflict. Peter Rosbeck noted that he was asked to do the work but is not contracted to do the work, and has no conflict. Mr. Wollette reviewed the plans and described the addition of the 4 season room in the rear replacing the screened porch. He displayed the drawings /designs and reviewed the materials and details list, noting the desire to conform to the existing structure. There were questions regarding the view of the porch as seen from School St. It was noted that the rear 2/3 of the house was constructed in 1964. There was a discussion regarding Public Hearing with members declining to send to public hearing. There are no proposed changes to the historic house. Mr. Scott noted that this, well considered, addition improves the appearance. Members agreed. Motion to approve as presented, Cari Williamson. 2nd, Peter Rosbeck. Unanimously Approved.

73 N. Water Street (20D-289) Brian Mann. Applicant proposes to modify and/or add new privacy fencing and new brick patio. The fence is planned to be painted white on outside. Brian provided a fence plan color coded showing the existing fencing and the

proposed additions to the fencing, part of which is a 6 foot board fence. Mr. Mann displayed a fence style but said he is open to changing the style if the HDC prefers a different style fence. Mr. Mann discussed transitions in height as the fence approaches the sidewalks and noted that the fence will be no taller than 6 feet. He displayed photographs of several privacy fences that exist on North Water and the surrounding area.

Christopher Scott noted that Mr. Mann has made a case for privacy fencing in the District but noted that this is an unusual location with frontage on 2 very significant streets in the heart of the Historic District. There was a discussion regarding the need for a public hearing as abutters were present and voiced a desire for a public hearing. Mr. Mann noted that the fence was included in a previous application which went to a Public Hearing and asked that this meeting be used as a Public Hearing. He was informed that the previous application was withdrawn and no conclusions were reached during the presentation of the previous application. Members of the Commission concurred that this application, regarding a major corner, should be heard at a Public Hearing with proper notice to abutters. Chairman Scott asked if wants to know if this fence application is an attempt to remove the view into the property so that Mr. Mann may disguise further construction on the lot. Mr. Mann said that he does plan to make further applications for improvements on the property, but said that the fence application is a complete application. Mr. Mann said that he is entitled to a fence and argued that the 4th Amendment to the Constitution guarantees his right to privacy.

Mr. Scott noted that he finds this application troubling given that there are 2 front yards on a very significant corner and this Commission's bylaw says that architectural features are open to view without reference to fences or plantings to obscure structures. Further, this commission is not in favor of tall fences along prominent streetscapes. Ken Magnuson noted that he believes a 6 ft. fence on Morse Street is inappropriate and noted that he has not and will not vote to approve a fence, this tall, in such a location. Mr. Magnuson also noted the proposed fence that would bisect the lot from Morse to the side of the house. Mr. Scott explained that the HDC often offers advice to applicants in situations where the Commissioners do not appear to support an application and urged Mr. Mann to obtain professional advice with regard to his plans. He noted that the fence application is clearly only part of Mr. Mann's plans for the property. Motion to send to a public hearing Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Susan Catling. Unanimously approved for a site visit and public hearing. Date for the public hearing will be provided after the April meeting schedule is determined.

44 Main Street (20D-196) New Moon Property LLC/Behind the Bookstore. Jefferson Mercier/agent. Applicant proposes to remove 2nd floor deck, repair sidewalk, replace vinyl siding with cedar shingles, add a new deck and garbage surround with a 'walk-in' under deck. Chris is recused from this hearing. There is some vinyl siding with wood shingles under. Siding will be removed and replaced with cedar shingles. It was noted that these repairs & changes are visible from the sidewalk. Ken Magnuson noted these changes, cleans it up. Motion to approve, Ken Magnuson. Peter Rosbeck, 2nd. Approved.

62 S. Summer Street (20D-147) Anthony Giordono. Louis D'Agostino/agent. Applicant proposes to replace 2 double hung windows with French doors. Members viewed the photos of the existing windows. The Simpson wood doors will be 15" wider than existing windows. Surrounding vinyl siding will be removed. Doors are fir and will be painted green to match existing house doors with white trim.

Motion to approve Ken Magnuson, 2nd Susan Catling. Approved.

8 Beach Street (29B-78.1) Tony & Shipley Salewski. James Moffatt/agent. Applicant proposes 360 sq. ft. addition to house, replace roofs, trim, flashing & sidewalls, replace & add windows and doors, replace railings and widow's walk. Work on shed, add pool & pergola. There was a site visit prior to the meeting. Mr. Moffatt provided the history beginning in 1870-1880. The major renovation was done in 1927. There was further with renovation and additions through 1975 with updates after 1980. Mr. Moffatt displayed the site plan illustrating the significant hardscape. He explained the plan adds a 17 sq. portico and an 8x20 ft. extension/addition on first and 2nd floor. He discussed the proposed materials including copper gutters, cedar shingles, white wood trim & composite shutters. The brick chimneys to remain intact. He described and compared each façade existing and proposed, noting the quirky and charming details that exist on the house. He detailed the windows on each façade comparing and contrasting the windows, doors and the railings (not code), and the widow's walk. The presentation was continued by Chris Horuchi, Landscape Architect. She explained the plan to make a single drive way, maintain retaining walls and addition a new pedestrian entrance. She described all the proposed and existing hardscape. It was noted that approval must be sought from Con-com as this is in the shore zone. A pool is planned. The pool fence planned as a 2 ft. stone wall with 2 ft. white picket fence on top of the wall. There will be a large brick terrace on the water-side of house. The plan is for less hardscape and more plantings. It was noted that there is a 15 foot grade change on the lot. Chris Scott noted that the historic house has been vastly changed, by many additions, over time. Ken noted that his plan does not make many changes to the overall style and sees many small improvements. Shutters will be yellow as currently exist and all will be workable shutters with the exception of the shutter planned for the 10ft. window. The applicant noted that they are going to the trouble of improving the house while retaining the house. Cari discussed the vertical boards as planned and questioned the choice. Q: outdoor showers location. A: between the garage and the house. Cari noted concern about the pool and wall around the pool, as it may obstruct the view to the house. There was a discussion about the loss of some large trees. It was noted that this is very visible from the harbor/public way. The applicant's calculation of lot coverage is approximately 40% including hardscape, decks and pool. Motion to send to a public hearing, Ken Magnuson. 2nd. Cari Williamson. Approved for public hearing.

Old/New Business:

Minutes: February 21, 2019.

There being no quorum of members from the meeting on 2.21.19 was present to approve the minutes. The minutes for 2.21.19 will be continued for approval until 4.4.19.

Respectfully submitted:
Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ 4.4.19
Susan Catling, Vice Chairman