

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~

Minutes



Thursday, January 17, 2019

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott - Chairman, Susan Catling, Edith Blake, Peter Rosbeck, Cari Williamson (A), Molly Costello (A). Absent: Cassie Bradley, Ken Magnuson, & Julia Celeste.

Chairman Scott called the meeting to order at 4:05 pm.

56 North Water St. Edgartown Inn (20D-226) RJH Realty Trust. Chuck Sullivan/agent. Applicant proposed the addition of a 9x22, 2 story addition to accommodate egress stairway from all levels. There was a site visit prior to this meeting. Chuck Sullivan explained the application and provided plans and drawings to the members. They want to replace all windows with wood windows which will eliminate the storm windows. There will not be an increase in room numbers. The addition of square footage is to allow for an interior stair way. They plan to use the original trim style and materials to replace a mismatch of current trims. Chris Scott asked about history and noted that this is a fair amount of work to do here. The history was provided. Mr. Sullivan said they would like to get an approval without an HDC Public Hearing, noting that there will be a Public Hearing (PH) for ZBA and they would like to begin the foundation. Chris noted the most visible part of the change is the dormer. Peter Rosbeck said that enclosing the exterior stairwell cleans-up the façade a bit and removing the bay window is a good idea. Surprised that they could operate, this long, with the existing exterior stairways. Peter sees the new plan as an improvement. Chris Scott asked if the commissioners feel that this change would necessitate a Public Hearing, noting that most of the proposed work is in the rear. Chris explained that the reasoning for the PH is for the public input. Chuck noted that they are matching the existing elements. Susan asked about the windows. Chuck noted that there are a variety of differing stock windows that have been added over time and that will be remedied. Chuck provided a cut sheet for the proposed Norwood windows. Peter noted that Norwood is a fine architectural window. As there will be a ZBA hearing, Mr. Scott asked the members if they see a need for an HDC, Public Hearing. The members were polled and did not see the need for a PH given there will be one for ZBA and all abutters will be noticed. Chris sees the design as balancing the building and is favorably disposed to the plan noting that sometimes additions can be charming. Susan agrees noting that the historic façade is preserved. Cari concurs noting that from the Carnegie Bldg. the view will be improved. Motion to approve as presented attaching a detailed list of window changes. Susan Catling. 2nd, Molly Costello.
Unanimously Approved.

4:15 –30 Pierce Lane. (20B-38) BRJ Holdings. JG Early/agent. *Changes to an approved plan.* Applicant proposes changes to include: Doors, windows, siding, roofing, dormer, roof height of garage, cupola, skylights and outdoor shower. Part I: Scott Stearns provided plans to the commission showing the changes that they would like to make to the approved plan. The changes are highlighted in red. Noting that the gutters and lighting were not part of the original plan, he noted the addition of the gutters and lighting and highlighted the various changes. Chris asked about the gutters. A: The gutters will be copper. The Dormer on the back side of the main house is the biggest change to the plan. The members reviewed the drawings of all facades showing the approved plan and the proposed changes. It was noted the reason for removing the side lights, at the mud door, is to allow for closet space. There are changes to window sizes and modifications including the removal of the Juliette Balcony. Mr. Sterns discussed the siding noting a change to shingles for the recessed addition rather than white vertical siding as was drawn originally. Members reviewed the plans and discussed the siding. Chris noted that the changes, while several, do not appear to be substantive. Susan noted that the back of the house is not visible. Q: Cari, will there be shingles everywhere except the front façade which will be clapboard. A: Yes. Peter noted that the changes clean up the plan and create more simplicity. Susan said that the removal of the skylights is good idea. The proportion change to the cupola is positive and does make for better proportions.

Part II: The guest house/garage: Plans were provided, again showing the differences between what was approved and what is proposed. The site plan was provided to show the visibility of the garage building. There is a ½ dormer on the rear side to allow for head room for the bathroom. There are changes to the window dimension. A proposed addition of an outdoor shower and two windows were added on the rear side. Chris noted that the visible part is the transom, which gets a bit taller, with the roof going up approximately 2 feet. Members did not see this as significant. Susan noted that the changes, that can be seen are neutral or positive changes. The applicant was complimented on the thoroughness of the presentation. Motion to approve the modifications as presented, Edith Blake. 2nd, Susan Catling. Approved.

4:35 - 59 School St. (20D-146) Bud & Chari Polley. Conover Restoration/agent. Applicant proposes to lift original 1840 house relocate & restore on a new foundation. Remove non-historic additions to main house and replace with new additions and garage. Gerry Conover presented the application, providing plans. He showed pictures noting that the original house is 27x22' and the additions were added over time. The house is located in the R5 Zoning district on a "conforming" lot. The applicant would like to restore the original Greek Revival house and add an addition and attached garage. Noted the 28% ground coverage. He showed the members a plot plan. He showed the various facades. Chris noted that this is the main Museum building the historic part is in the front. There have been significant additions to the historic building. Gerry provided the plans for the proposed new construction part of the project. Mr. Conover noted that they will use best materials and the highest level of reconstruction will be employed. Chimneys will be put back where they are. All they will keep is the 1840 structure. Noting an addition dates from the 1940's and there is a big addition from the 1970's. Mr. Conover said that 28% ground coverage is proposed for the project and there is currently more ground coverage with the existing additions. Chris asked if there are plans for the rear-yard of the property? Is there a pool or outbuilding planned? A: No plans for the rear yard. The existing house has 5,715 sq. ft., the proposed is 4,635 sq. ft. When asked why the connector to the

garage, Gerry said the connector works given the small house width and height, and the need to provide access to 2 bedrooms above the garage. This necessitates the connection of the two buildings. Chris Scott explaining that these very visible changes will require a public hearing. Chris asked the members for their initial impressions of the plan. Susan Catling noted that the large garage dimensions appear, from the untrained eye, to be the same size as the historic 'box', which does not set the historic building apart as the prominent building. Chris concurred but noted that the 2 car garage does have a bit of setback. Peter asked about moving the house forward to help set it apart from the additions, noting that most of the houses on the street are closer to the road. Susan asked about 2 car garages in the area? Gerry discussed moving the house forward a couple feet and perhaps shrinking the volume of the garage. Chris noted that it is a peculiar property as it has not been used as a residential house and noted the positive attempt to preserve the historic house in its original use. Chris sees the plan as moving toward a good direction. Noting that there will be a site visit prior to the public hearing, Christopher Scott made the motion to advance the application to a Public Hearing on 2.21.19. 2nd, Cari Williamson. Approved.

Old/New Business:

Bricque provided pages (bylaw presentation materials, letter from the Board of Health, Letter from Patrick Ahearn) regarding the proposed zoning changes, specifically the bylaw regarding lot coverage. Members were provided a Public Hearing notice for the Planning board hearing on January 22, 2019 @ 6:00. Members were encouraged to attend the hearing.

Minutes:

January 3, 2019. Motion to approve. Cari Williamson. 2nd, Susan Catling. Approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:45.

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____

February 7, 2019