

Town of Edgartown

Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

~Historic District Commission~ Minutes



Thursday, January 3, 2019

In attendance: Chris Scott, Chairman, Susan Catling, Edith Blake, Cassie Bradley, Julia Celeste, Ken Magnuson & Peter Rosbeck.

Christopher Scott opened the hearing at 4:02 pm.

PUBLIC HEARING: 100 School St. (29A-9.122) Deborah McAneny. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes construction of a New Greek Revival house, carriage house & pool. Cari Williamson sat for this application as Peter Rosbeck is recused from hearing this application. Mr. Scott read the Public Hearing Notice and Mr. Ahearn made his presentation. There was a site visit prior to the hearing.

Mr. Ahearn noted that the owners of the vacant lot also own the adjacent house. They wanted to design a house that is a companion piece to their existing house, but this house will be smaller. The Greek Revival house has center entrance, a red cedar roof, brick foundation and Pella windows. It is planned for the sides of house to be shingled and left to weather. There is an open porch off secondary wing. The Carriage house mimics the house in style. Primary façade is 20 ft. front set back and there is 15 feet open-space at property line. Mr. Ahearn displayed drawings indicating the open space that will be left after construction. Q: What is the total lot coverage? A: 36%. Patrick noted that the streetscape 'falls apart' with the open lot and he sees this construction as contributing to the fabric of the streetscape. Shutters will be working and there will be working double shutters where appropriate. Q: Materials? A: The main façade is white clapboard with shingles on sides, wings and the dormers. Q: Is there a walk-out roof deck? A: No. The railing is decorative and does not provide roof access.

The hearing was opened to Public to comment. Mr. Tommy Fisher, abutter, is concerned about the scale. He appreciates a story and 1/2 but noted that there is not a history of captain's houses in this part of town and this house is overly decorative. He would like to see it be more simple and suggested a shingled house as more appropriate. Noting that this is a 2nd house for this owner he wonders at the need for a 2nd pool and noted that his understanding that this is being built as 'overflow'. Mr. Fisher thinks it would be just as pretty if the detailing was stripped down. He noted his hope that there will be no construction from June 15th –Sept 15th noting parking issues and size of the street regarding trucks and construction vehicles. He said that he basically appreciates that it is

lower than the neighboring house but again said that the sea captain houses were not seen in the area and this area is much more diverse, further noting variety is important in maintaining character. Mr. Ahearn thinks that the most successful Greek Revival houses have clapboard fronts to differentiate the main façade from the wings. He noted that there are a few painted houses in the area.

There being no other public comment, a letter read was read, from Mr. Hershfeld, in opposition to the overall size and extensive lot coverage. Patrick said that he is surprised by the letter noting the size of the Hershfield house. Michael Hegarty spoke saying that the driveway on the right may eat up some green space but noted that he sees this plan as a good one.

Chris Scott closed the public hearing and noted that some of the objections, in the letter, may be taken up by the HDC but are not under HDC purview. It is true that this plan with the inclusion of secondary structures covers much of the lot but it meets the zoning setbacks for a conforming lot and lot coverage is not part of the zoning by law. Mr. Scott said that he appreciates the experience of living adjacent to an undeveloped lot. He noted that this design does meet zoning requirements and feels the architectural style is favorable to the streetscape. Noting the proportion of the house and the mass, as viewed from the street, seems appropriate. Mr. Scott sees this plan as a nice rendition of a Greek Revival house. Mr. Scott noted his agreement with the Architect regarding the clapboard vs. shingle. Susan Catling agreed and noted the shingle wings cause some of the mass to recede. Ken noted that the 1 ½ story is advisable in this location and commended the attention to detail. Julia noted her agreement with the clapboard front of the house noting that it may appear to be the “original” front. Julia further noted that the house as designed seems appropriate on the street for a vacant lot but would not be appropriate to replace an existing house. Cassie agreed with Julia saying that there is extensive lot coverage but the front set back does allow for some green space. Susan noted that there are farm house structures on the street providing diversity in style and history and noted that this 1 ½ story Greek Revival will not overwhelm the streetscape. Chris noted agreement with Mr. Fisher that the Captain’s houses were historically gathered in the center of the village. Cari noted that the recessed portion may appear more subordinate without the railing as it seems to bring the recessed portion forward somewhat and a plain wing, without the railing, may look more subordinate. Cassie thinks the rail may fade into the background. There was no further discussion regarding the 2’ ft railing. As there was no further discussion Ken made a motion to approve. Susan provided the 2nd. Voting to approve: Chris, Susan, Cari, Cassie, Ken and Edith. Julia voted nay. The application is approved.

Of Note: The agenda notes a Public Hearing for 93 School St which has been postponed until February 7th, 2019, at the request of the applicant. This PH will be re-noticed in the Gazette twice and abutters notices will be sent noting the new date for the public hearing.

4:25 - 16 Pent Lane. (20D-50) Brad Jensen & Carolyn Blackwood. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Change to an approved plan. Applicant proposes to relocate window wells. Peter is back on the panel. This is not a public hearing but is a change to a previously

approved plan. Patrick handed out a drawing. He described the approved window wells and noted that they were previously approved and recorded but when the contractor went to obtain the Building Department he was informed that the window wells were in violation of the set back. Mr. Ahearn argued that there are many houses that have window wells in the set-back; that this has been allowed before and permits have been obtained in the past by the Building Department. Still, the building inspector has not allowed the window wells as proposed and the foundation permit eliminated the window wells (as drawn) from the plans. The applicant now wants to relocate the window wells on the west side of the house which moves them away from the side set back in accordance with the zoning bylaw. The proposed relocated wells will be flush with the drive and have grates over them so they can be driven over. Mr. Ahearn reiterated that this change is due to the change in procedure of the Building Inspector's office

Q: Chris Scott asked if Mr. Ahearn is proposing any changes to the driveway? A: No.

Q: Susan asked, will you have to do more construction at the site to accommodate these wells, noting concern for the health of the Stewardia tree? A: The foundation was poured without the window wells and they need to be cut in. Mr. Ahearn said they will be hand-dug and concrete cut from inside the basement. Chris addressed the need for a public hearing. It was voted by members that this does not rise to the need to have a public hearing. Q: Julia asked if Arborist will on site for the cut. A: Yes, the arborist is on call for any new construction. Susan asked about the light from the basement and noted these are planned for the side facing the neighbor. Susan further noted her concerns regarding the tree and the roots, which have already been subject to disturbance saying that any digging around the tree is concerning. Patrick noted, again that the arborist will be on site for any new digging. Mr. Crouteau, abutter noted their concerns regarding the care of the tree have been satisfied and they have no concern regarding light from the basement. Mr. Crouteau requested that the board revisit the chimney on the detached bldg. Mr. Scott explained that there is a previous approval re: chimney and this hearing regards only the window wells. There was no further public comment but Mr. Tankard, abutter, wrote a letter, in opposition, which was read to the members. Q: Chris Scott asked Mr. Ahearn if there any plan to change the driveway, in any way, or to move or remove the Stewardia tree? A: No. Motion to approve conditioned on hand digging of the wells and an Arborist being on site for digging, Julia Celeste. 2ndd, Cassie Bradley. Unanimously voted to approve.

PUBLIC HEARING: 86 Peases Pt Way N. (20B-60) Lyn & Glenn Reiter. Dudley Cannada/agent. Applicant proposes to construct a garage. Chris read the public hearing notice. Dudley presented the plan for the construction of a garage. There was a site visit prior to the hearing. Dudley noted it is a simple garage white cedar shingle sides with white trim & swinging doors. It is visible despite substantial landscaping. The lantern has been removed from the plan. There was some confusion and concern from neighbors but Dudley noted that the applicants plan to have further discussions with the neighbors prior to the required ZBA hearing. Chris Scott discussed the ZBA requirement. Chris opened the hearing for public comment. There was no public comment but there was a neighbor's

note objecting to a cupola and guest house (rather than garage) which were not part of this plan. Dudley addressed the concerns and noted that the concerns of the neighbor

had been addressed by the current plan or that they are Zoning issues. He again noted that abutter's Zoning concerns will be discussed with the neighbor and the cupola is not on this plan. Motion to approve as submitted, Julia Celeste. 2nd, Cassie Bradley. Approved.

Old/New Business:

Minutes:

Motion to approve the minutes of 12.20.18: Cassie Bradley. 2nd, Susan Catling. Voted to approve by Chris, Susan, Cassie, Edith & Cari all present at the meeting on 12.20.18.

- Bricque explained that the Yacht Club was approved to remove a window and would now like to put the window back to create more natural light. They will provide an application for the window addition. It was agreed that this is minor and will receive a "desk" approval.
- Mr. Scott provided a Menaca Hill (8 Caleb's Pond) update. The abutter is not opposed to move to the Chappy Beach club property. The Beach Club will continue to explore the possibility of completing the move. It is noted that the building on the Beach Club property, will be visible from the road.
- The HDC further discussed support for the Zoning bylaw amendment that will be one of the proposed Zoning bylaw changes. There will be a, Planning Board, Public Hearing on January 22, 2019 at 6:00 PM. The previous draft of the warrant had allowed for the possibility of a special permit to permit greater lot coverage. That part of the warrant was eliminated as it was noted that HDC does not have Zoning permitting authority. The members, again, signed a notice of support for the bylaw change with the change as described.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:47 PM.

Respectfully Submitted:

Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved: _____ 1.17.19
Christopher Scott, Chairman