



EDWARD J. COLLINS, JR. CENTER FOR PUBLIC MANAGEMENT
JOHN W. McCORMACK GRADUATE SCHOOL OF POLICY AND GLOBAL STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS BOSTON

100 Morrissey Boulevard
Boston, MA 02125-3393
P: 617.287.4824
F: 617.287.5566
mccormack.umb.edu/centers/cpm
collins.center@umb.edu

COMPENSATION AND CLASSIFICATION STUDY

TOWN OF EDGARTOWN

MARCH 2017

INTRODUCTION

The Collins Center for Public Management was engaged by the Town to create job descriptions, conduct a salary comparison and recommend a classification plan. After meeting with the Town, the project objectives were defined as follows:

- Develop new position descriptions with clear definitions of essential functions and requirements
- Evaluate and assign all positions to appropriate classifications in order to assure internal equity
- Conduct a salary survey of comparable municipalities in order to develop appropriate compensation levels, and to assure the external equity
- Recommend a classification system that provides for an equitable salary structure.

Position Descriptions

The Collins Center approach to creating accurate position descriptions is a comprehensive process. Rather than simply obtaining lists of duties, the Collins Center's practice is to gain a thorough understanding of the study positions. Employees are given a position questionnaire to complete. The position questionnaire elicits information about the position's core functions and responsibilities. For incumbents, the most difficult part about completing the position questionnaire is to remove themselves from the position and complete the position questionnaire as if it were for the position if it were vacant. It is important for the position to be evaluated, not the incumbent.

After the position questionnaires were completed, the Collins Center offered individual interviews with each of the incumbents. The purpose of the interviews is for the Collins Center to gain further knowledge about the position, understand the context of the position in the organization and to follow up on any information in the questionnaire that may be unclear. The interview also serves as an opportunity for the incumbents to participate in the process and explain the position they hold, which can be difficult on a standardized position questionnaire.

Once the interviews were conducted, draft position descriptions were created and distributed to employees and supervisors for comments. Comments were received by the Collins Center and used to create a final description. As a result of the comprehensive work done to create the draft, very few edits were requested. The final position descriptions, which are the result of the questionnaires, the interviews and drafts with employee and supervisor feedback have been delivered electronically under separate cover.

In addition to compliance with various laws, such as the Americans with Disabilities Act, having accurate position descriptions is an integral part of an organization's human resource management system. Position descriptions are key in recruitment, defining roles, responsibilities and expectations and evaluating performance.

Position Evaluation & Classification

Once position descriptions were drafted, the Collins Center used a point factor method to evaluate the positions. The application of an objective position evaluation system that is consistently applied to each position is critical in assuring the internal equity of a classification system. The point factor method is used to determine the internal groupings or classification of positions. Internal equity is often more important than external equity. If an organization does not have a fair and equitable classification plan, morale can suffer and turnover can be a problem. The ideas of favoritism and disparate treatment with respect to pay can be avoided with an objective, equitable classification system.

The evaluation system utilized by the Collins Center project team is one that has been administered successfully in many public organizations in Massachusetts. The factors used to evaluate the positions and recommended classification grades are:

Supervision Required	Complexity	Nature & Purpose of Contacts
Supervisory Responsibility	Confidentiality	Occupational Risks

Accountability	Education Required	Work Environment
Judgment	Experience Required	Physical Requirements

The above factors are also the sections of the position questionnaire distributed to and completed by the incumbents. By having the incumbents describe the position they hold with respect to each of the factors and then having the Collins Center follow up specifically in the interview to gain an understanding of how the position functions relative to the above factors is key in getting the ratings correct. Many of the factors are also sections of the positions descriptions.

The recommended classification system is comprised of 12grades which group positions based on similar ratings in the above categories. Each position was assigned a point factor in the categories above, resulting in a total point rating, which was used to determine the groupings of positions. The following table contains the recommended classification grades of each of the study positions.

GRADE	TITLES IN GRADE
A	Clerk - Collector Clerk - Finance Committee Clerk - Planning Custodian
B	Junior Operator - Wastewater Junior Operator - Water
C	Committee Asst. Affordable Housing Cook - COA Department Asst - BOS/TA Department Asst - Building Department Asst - COA Department Asst - Dredge Department Asst - Harbormaster Department Asst - Police Department Asst - Waste Water Department Asst - Water Department/Library Assistant Junior Operator - Wastewater Library Assistant

GRADE	TITLES IN GRADE
D	Administrative Asst. - Water Administrative Asst. to TA/BOS Assistant Assessor Assistant Collector Assistant Town Accountant Assistant Town Clerk Assistant Treasurer Data Collector HEO, Laborer Program/Library Assistant
E	Administrative Asst. II - Wastewater Administrative Asst. II - Fire Administrative Asst. II - Harbormaster Administrative Asst. II - Police Deputy Harbormaster Deputy Shellfish Warden Library Collection Specialist Operator I - Water Plant Operator - Wastewater Working HEO Foreman
F	ACO/Inspector BOH Assistant Cemetery Superintendent Conservation Assistant HEO/Mechanic/Operator Historic District Comm Assistant Library Circulation Coordinator Outreach Worker - COA Operator II - Water Paramedic Parks Department Administrator Planning Assistant Purchasing Agent Technology, Reference & Patron Services Coord Young Adult & Youth Services Coord./Asst. Director ZBA Assistant
G	Chief Operator Wastewater Director of Senior Services Highway General Foreman
H	Ambulance Coordinator Conservation Agent

GRADE	TITLES IN GRADE
I	Asst. Water Superintendent COA Administrator Health Agent Human Resources Director Inspector of Buildings Library Director Principal Assessor Town Accountant Town Clerk Treasurer
J	Facility Manager - Wastewater Harbormaster IT Manager Shellfish Constable Water Superintendent
K	No positions in this grade at this time
L	Highway Superintendent/ Tree Warden

Salary Survey

While the classification of positions and internal equity is most important in creating a comprehensive classification system, external salary data is useful to gain an understanding of how a municipality is compensating employees relative to the market for similar positions. A key indicator is that of turnover in positions. If a municipality is losing its people because of pay, it is an indicator that the compensation is low. However, just because people do not leave, does not mean the compensation is high. An external salary survey can help measure where the market is and can assist the town in determining the appropriate pay for each classification.

Surveys were distributed to municipalities to obtain comparable salary data. The following Towns participated in the survey: Aquinnah, Chilmark, Falmouth, Mashpee, Oak Bluffs, Tisbury, and West Tisbury.

The Town is unique because it is part of an Island. Finding comparable data can be a challenge. Clearly, all island towns are comparable because they are on the island, but size, wealth, development, economic and income factors are not all the same. In order

to bring in potential comparable markets, the towns of Falmouth and Mashpee were also included in the survey.

In addition to location, the fact that each municipality is unique, truly comparable data is often difficult to obtain. The role and responsibilities for some positions vary across municipal governments. While exact matches are not always possible, averages, medians, trends and similarities are able to be studied and evaluated. The survey sample of the island towns, plus Mashpee and Falmouth provided a sufficient amount of data to evaluate and make recommendations on salary, particularly in the context of the recommended position classification and compensation schedule. The survey documents have been provided under separate cover.

Discussion

The Collins Center found most positions in the Town to be classified correctly. However, a few stood out as needing adjustment. Some of those included the administrative personnel in the regulatory departments. In many cases, what used to be secretarial support have grown to be staff or paraprofessional assistants. These positions, the Planning Assistant, the ZBA Assistant, Board of Health Assistant and the Assessing Assistant all work at a higher level than in the past.

The Town has clearly made the necessary move to recognize the critical need for a professional human resources professional. Municipalities expend the majority of their budgets on personnel costs. Especially in light of the increase in compliance and documentation requirements of federal and state laws and mandates, it is important from a practical and liability perspective to have a centralized human resources function and a professional human resources director. The role, responsibility, functions and comparable information from other towns warrants a change in the human resource position from a coordinator to a director.

The issue of longevity was reviewed. The intention of most longevity systems is to recognize and reward employees for year of service with the Town. In Edgartown,

longevity does recognize years of service with the Town, but has a disparate impact in the amounts of the awards given. By granting longevity as a percentage of salary, higher paid employees receive a significantly greater award for the same number of years of service as a lower paid employee. The Collins Center recommends the Town adopt a flat longevity schedule granting employees the same dollar value for the same increment of longevity. The Town may need to “grandfather” those employee receiving a higher amount until such time as those positions are vacated. The Personnel Board should review this issue and make a recommendation.

Recommended Compensation Schedule

The Collins Center evaluated the survey data in conjunction with the groupings of positions to determine the recommended compensation schedule. The median minimum salary contained in the survey was used as a guideline in determining the minimum of the recommended compensation schedule. Determining the salary range is not only a science but an art and uses an analysis of the median minimum salary of each position in the grade.

The following table reflects the recommended pay ranges:

GRADE	MINIMUM	MAXIMUM
A	\$19.75	\$25.18
B	\$21.23	\$27.07
C	\$22.82	\$29.10
D	\$24.53	\$31.27
E	\$26.37	\$33.62
F	\$28.35	\$36.13
G	\$30.48	\$38.84
H	\$32.77	\$41.77
I	\$35.23	\$44.92
J	\$37.87	\$48.28
K	\$40.71	\$51.89
L	\$43.76	\$55.80

The Collins Center recommends a step system be put in place and merit be the basis for any increases and should be evaluated and recommended by the Personnel Board. A sample classification schedule is attached. It represents a schedule of 15 steps, with 1.75% between steps. The Collins Center recommends the Town develop a policy with respect to moving employees through the recommended compensation schedule. The Town will need to address the issue of the step rate anniversary. The Collins Center recommends all step increase be granted on July 1 of each year, making budgeting and processing simpler.

To avoid falling behind in the labor market, the Town should conduct a salary survey every 3-4 years to determine if the salary ranges are still comparable.

CLOSING

It has been a pleasure for the Collins Center for Public Management to work with the Town. We would particularly like to thank Ms. Elaine Graves for her assistance.

GRADE	TITLES IN GRADE
A	Clerk - Collector Clerk - Finance Committee Clerk - Planning Custodian
B	Junior Operator - Wastewater Junior Operator - Water
C	Committee Asst. Affordable Housing Cook - COA Department Asst - BOS/TA Department Asst - Building Department Asst - COA Department Asst - Dredge Department Asst - Harbormaster Department Asst - Police Department Asst - Waste Water Department Asst - Water Department/Library Assistant Library Assistant
D	Administrative Asst. - Water Administrative Asst. to TA/BOS Assistant to the Assessor Assistant Collector Assistant Town Accountant Assistant Town Clerk Assistant Treasurer Data Collector HEO, Laborer Program/Library Assistant Food Inspector
E	Administrative Asst. II - Wastewater Administrative Asst. II - Fire Administrative Asst. II - Harbormaster Administrative Asst. II - Police Deputy Harbormaster Deputy Shellfish Warden Library Collection Specialist Operator I - Water Plant Operator - Wastewater Working HEO Foreman EMT - Basic
F	ACO/Inspector BOH Assistant Cemetery Superintendent

GRADE	TITLES IN GRADE
	Conservation Assistant HEO/Mechanic/Operator Historic District Comm Assistant Library Circulation Coordinator Outreach Worker - COA Operator II - Water Paramedic Parks Department Administrator Planning Assistant Purchasing Agent Technology, Reference & Patron Services Coord Young Adult & Youth Services Coord. ZBA Assistant Local Building Inspector
G	Chief Operator Wastewater Director of Senior Services Highway General Foreman
H	Ambulance Coordinator Conservation Agent
I	Asst. Water Superintendent COA Administrator Health Agent Human Resources Director Inspector of Buildings Library Director Principal Assessor Town Accountant Town Clerk Treasurer
J	Facility Manager - Wastewater Harbormaster IT Manager Shellfish Constable Water Superintendent
K	No positions in this grade at this time
L	Highway Superintendent/ Tree Warden

FY18 Wage Scale (Scale A) - proposed by Personnel Board

	Step	Step	Step	Step	Step	Step	Step	Step
GRADE	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
A	\$19.75	\$20.54	\$21.36	\$22.21	\$23.10	\$24.02	\$24.98	\$25.98
B	\$21.23	\$22.08	\$22.96	\$23.88	\$24.84	\$25.83	\$26.86	\$27.93
C	\$22.82	\$23.73	\$24.68	\$25.67	\$26.70	\$27.77	\$28.88	\$30.04
D	\$24.53	\$25.51	\$26.53	\$27.59	\$28.69	\$29.84	\$31.03	\$32.27
E	\$26.37	\$27.42	\$28.52	\$29.66	\$30.85	\$32.08	\$33.36	\$34.69
F	\$28.35	\$29.48	\$30.66	\$31.89	\$33.17	\$34.50	\$35.88	\$37.32
G	\$30.48	\$31.70	\$32.97	\$34.29	\$35.66	\$37.09	\$38.57	\$40.11
H	\$32.77	\$34.08	\$35.44	\$36.86	\$38.33	\$39.86	\$41.45	\$43.11
I	\$35.23	\$36.64	\$38.11	\$39.63	\$41.22	\$42.87	\$44.58	\$46.36
J	\$37.87	\$39.38	\$40.96	\$42.60	\$44.30	\$46.07	\$47.91	\$49.83
K	\$40.71	\$42.34	\$44.03	\$45.79	\$47.62	\$49.52	\$51.50	\$53.56
L	\$43.76	\$45.51	\$47.33	\$49.22	\$51.19	\$53.24	\$55.37	\$57.58