



**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158  
70 Main Street  
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: [www.edgartown-ma.us](http://www.edgartown-ma.us)  
email: [HDCr@edgartown-ma.us](mailto:HDCr@edgartown-ma.us)

## **Edgartown Historic District Commission**

### **Minutes**

### **October 17, 2024**

Per Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will only be held through remote conference technology.

Julia Tarka, co-chair; Peter Rosbeck, co-chair; Ken Magnuson, Susan Catling, Hilary Grannis, and James Cisek were in attendance.

Julia Tarka called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm.

PH 40 Gaines Way was discussed by Patrick Ahearn, and the non-historical value of the structure, which has renovations cribbed together. I feel it is appropriate to consider demolishing the structure and building new. From the pre-discussion meeting, the comments we listened to and redesigned the house in a more cottage style. We reduced the glazing significantly. The house would be back from the 100' zone; it is slightly forward from where the existing house is, but we kept behind the neighbors' homes. We did simplify the design significantly and feel it is an improvement.

Julia Tarka opened the public hearing to the Commissioners. Ken Magnuson asked about the age of the decision. A. It is hard to tell, but these windows date from the 1960s. There is a tiny piece that could have one time been a shed. There is no way to pin the date of the house as 1955. The little cottage in the back that was stuck on could have been a bunkhouse from 1950, but it is impossible to tell here. Ken asked about fencing for the pool and anything visible. A. We have a pool cover that negates a pool fence per regulations; if there were a fence, it would not be visible from the public way as it would be in the back.

Julia Tarka opened the public hearing with public interests in favor of the project, seeing none, the public hearing was opened to public interests against the project. Lucy Dahl stated that this area is one of the most beautiful in Edgartown and that it would be a tragedy to see Edgartown built up more than it already has. Mr. LoBianco spoke how this structure is abutting his property. He discussed the percentage of his lot's square footage and looked at the proposed development, which is too much and will change the neighborhood, and the carriage house on the five-foot setback will loom into our bedroom and pool. I feel this is what the historic district is to present. Heather Lake stated that a two-year project on a one-way street would impact us, and the size of the proposed house looks like mine as we have the same architect. Geno Courtney is concerned about the stakes and goes back to square one regarding the rights of land and the use of his driveway, his lack of privacy, and the 40 years of plantings he has done will be torn out. He is also unsure about the wetlands and basement building, and this application should go to the Zoning Board of Appeals. Julia Tarka stated that for all committees mentioned by neighbors, the HDC would not address issues involving other committees and asked Mr. Ahearn if he wanted to address any concerns. Mr. Ahearn discussed the size of the lot and house, the total change is 26%. This house is similar to the Lake's house. The house size is 5900 sq ft, and I do not consider this overbuilt.

Julia Tarka moved to board deliberation as the public portion is closed. Ken Magnuson said he was on the fence about demolishing the house; if there were one to be demolished, this house would be a candidate. Patrick, you usually work with your neighbors, and I am unsure if this has been done this time. I would like to see something scaled down and work with the neighbors where there is something that everyone can get on board. Susan Catling is not in favor of 100% demolition; it is massing and not in favor of moving the house. When I viewed the site visit yesterday, I felt this plan was taking privacy away from the neighbors. Cari Williamson said the home is charming and represents how houses grow, as do families. This is not an architectural wonder, but your skills could make it a more comprehensible design. Hilary Grannis agrees that there is no historical significance and is not opposed to demolition. I favor this roof design, and you have reduced glazing, which is nice. I think this design could be scaled back and work with the neighbors. James Cisek is opposed to 100% demolition. Julia Tarka is not usually in favor of demolition and feels that the problem with this house is massing and would like to see a scaled-down house. Peter Rosbeck doesn't feel this house is significant as the additions have been so disrupted; making Patrick renovate this house could be more harm than good, and I am in favor of 100% demolition. Julia Tarka asked Peter Rosbeck if a more scaled-down design came back would you be in favor of it. Peter Rosbeck said that as long as the scale back is not to try and use some of the elements there now, we can still get some of the charm without dealing with issues we have with the structure now. Patrick Ahearn would like to withdraw his application and come back with a scaled-back version to address the neighbor's

concerns. Ken Magnuson made a Motion to Accept the Withdrawal, seconded by Cari Williamson. Unanimous vote by the board to approve.

75 School was discussed by Donoroma's Nursery regarding their plans to construct and install a wood pergola over the side of the bluestone patio. The pergola is not visible from the street. Julia asked for board questions, seeing none, Ken Magnuson made a Motion to Approve as Presented, seconded by James Cisek. Unanimous vote by the board to approve.

58 South Summer's guest house was discussed to replace siding, deck railings, and storm/screen doors. Julia Tarka clarified that the only non-replace in kind are the screen doors. Julia asked for board questions, seeing none, a Motion to Approve was made by Hilary Grannis, seconded by James Cisek.

80 South Water was discussed by Lucy Dahl regarding the structural integrity of the chimney as it was getting ready to collapse. This is not a true replace in kind because a cap is being asked for the chimney. James Cisek asked what the cap would look like, and a picture was shown. Julia asked for board feedback, and, seeing none, Cari Williamson made a Motion to Accept the Application as presented, seconded by Susan Catling.

27 Fuller had no one show up to the meeting.

#### NEW/OLD BUSINESS

The minutes of October 3, 2024, and September 19, 2024, will be voted on at the next meeting.

The meeting ended at 6:00 p.m. James Cisek made a Motion to Adjourn, seconded by Hilary Grannis. The board unanimously voted to approve.

Respectfully submitted:  
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 10/17/2024  
As voted

