



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: HDCr@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission

Minutes

September 19, 2024

Per Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will only be held through remote conference technology.

Julia Tarka, co-chair, Ken Magnuson, Cari Williamson, Hilary Grannis and James Cisek were in attendance. Peter Rosbeck and Susan Catling were absent.

Julia Tarka called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm.

108 Pease's Point Way North. Paul Pertile discussed replacing the Douglas Fir deck with IPE decking, which will stay natural and about 500 sq. feet. Julia Tarka asked if there would be any impact from a public way. A. No, I can show you all the photos around the house without a visual from a public view. Julia asked the board for input and questions. A Motion to Approve, as Presented, was made by Ken Magnuson, seconded by James Cicek. *Unanimous vote to approve by the board.*

61 Simpson Lane. Guy Grassi discussed the history and detailed changes to the house, suggesting that the house was originally a simple gable box and was constructed in the 1920s. He mentions removing the aluminum storm door and modern windows and replace with more authentic features. The plan also discussed demolishing the existing rear and side porches, replacing the cedar fence with a picket fence, which would go to the end of the property line without changing height, and creating a one-story addition to the house to provide a functional dining area, a mud room, and a rear entrance. The addition would have a hip roof and a small corner porch. A separate entrance porch would be built over the front door, and a brick apron would be added to the driveway. The shutters would be replaced with Atlantic shutters and natural cedar siding and roofing would be used. The trim would be painted white, and the shutters would be painted black.

On the second floor, the roof will be replaced with an over frame, and a little hip roof and a small shed roof will be created for the front entrance. Julia Tarka asked each board member for feedback and if a public hearing was needed and mentioned that the Vision Property Card talks about a demolition. The building inspector just informed me that this application would have to go in front of the ZBA, so this information may change some of the board member's minds about sending this application to a public hearing if you want to vote tonight. Ken and Hilary would like to vote tonight. Ken asked about the window and door plan. A. The window can be made smaller, and I would slide the door closer to the window. James Cisek asked about replacing all the shingles because you would be cutting them out and replacing them with new ones, and the look would not be presentable. Also, do you need both the hanging pendant light with a wall lantern? A. We would try to patch and if not, we would replace all of the shingles, and we could remove the hanging lantern. Julia Tarka asked the board their thoughts on Guy's revision of the door and window. Cari Williamson likes the change. It matches with the front façade and has more balance. Hilary and Ken agree with Cari. Julia asked if Guy were to redraw the site plan incorporating these changes, and she would sign and ask for a motion. Motion to Approve with the condition of resubmitting the changes to the door and window orientation of the addition and removing the hanging lantern on the front porch. Seconded by Hilary Grannis. *Unanimous vote by the board to accept with changes.*

40 Gaines Way. Patrick Ahearn. A detailed plan for renovating a 1955 home includes removing and replacing the existing structure with a new one behind the 100 ft. boundary. The new structure would be built on a 20,010 sq. ft. lot, twice the size of a legal buildable lot in the historic district. The proposed design features an H-shaped Gambrel, an office with double-hung windows, a covered porch, and a red cedar roof. The design also includes a carriage house on the back of the property, partially visible from the driveway. The applicant emphasized the new structure would not obstruct the views from the covered porch and would be set back from the houses on either side.

Julia Tarka led a discussion about a public hearing concerning the potential demolition of a 1955 house. Ken and Hilary expressed mixed feelings about the demolition, describing the house as a "hodgepodge mishmash." Both Ken and Hilary suggested a public hearing to discuss the matter further. Hilary expressed concerns about the similarity of the proposed house design to the Lakes House next door, questioning if it would create a street of virtually identical houses. Peter responded by explaining the site-specific challenges and the uniqueness of the lots on Eel Pond and highlighted the differences in design between the two houses. Cari and James also opposed demolishing a unique house in favor of a similar one next door. James suggested a public hearing for a 100% demolition in the district. Motion to Move to

a Public Hearing was made by Hilary Grannis and seconded by Cari Williamson.
Unanimous vote to approve by the board.

NEW/OLD BUSINESS: Motion to Approve past minutes as written by Cari Williamson, seconded by Julia Tarka.

Julia discussed updates on previous applications and violations. The VTA is continuing to move forward on wrapping the energy storage boxes on Church Street. 28 South Summer is compiling a list of all the renderings submitted to the HDC, and 52 South Summer will be sending in an application and also putting the pool fence back up that they took down.

James Cisek discussed the paint color for 114 North Water. The arbor is white and does not match the house, and the electrical pedestal by the arbor is out of place. Ken Magnuson noticed the color difference in the house; it seemed off-white. Hilary Grannis stated that a few people had asked her about the house's color. Julia Tarka stated the HDC approved white without a color code. If the board feels it is not white, we can ask 114 North Water to return to HDC. Joe Delory from 114 North Water was on the Zoom meeting and stated that Dove White by B. Moore is the color used for the house, and the pedestal is temporary and will be moved to the side of the house. The arbor is not Dove White but can be painted dove white. Julia also told the board that Harborside is working on their roof.

Hilary Grannis told the board that she is building a new house out of state and will be on the island for about a year. The board discussed finding an alternate. Ken Magnuson made a Motion Not to Allow Hilary Grannis to Move, seconded by Cari Williamson.

The meeting ended at 5:04 pm. A Motion to Adjourn made by James Cisek, seconded by Cari Williamson.

Respectfully submitted:
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: _____ 9/19/2024
As voted

