



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: HDCr@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission

Minutes

October 3, 2024

Per Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will only be held through remote conference technology.

Julia Tarka, co-chair, Peter Rosbeck, co-chair, Ken Magnuson, Susan Catling, Hilary Grannis and James Cisek were in attendance. Cari Williamson and Sharon Brainard were absent.

Julia Tarka called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm.

PH 116 South Summer Barbara and William Everdell. Julia Tarka read the public hearing into the record, removing wood shingles for asphalt shingles. Gary BenDavid spoke about how many of the applicant's neighbors have asphalt shingles. Julia asked for board questions before public comment, but seeing none, public comment was open in favor of the application. The applicant discussed converting to asphalt for longer roof durability and future generations of their families. No one spoke in opposition to the project; seeing none, the public portion was closed and moved to board deliberation. Peter Rosbeck spoke about how changing the roof from wood to asphalt changes the neighborhood's character, and if a wood roof were installed properly, it would last as long if not longer than asphalt. He understands the financial obligation of wood v asphalt, but when asphalt is taken off a roof and moved to a landfill, the breakdown is very concerning. This has always been my opinion, and it is not personal. When it is pointed out that only a few wood roofs are left, I would hate to lose them. Susan Catling spoke about receiving the information very late regarding the asphalt roofs by the applicant, but the board did not have time to see if these homes came into the HDC with asphalt shingles. I hope the applicants want to be good stewards of their historic home. Ken Magnuson, Hilary Grannis, and James Cisek wish to keep the wood roof. Hilary Grannis made the

motion to accept withdrawal and seconded by Susan Catling. Unanimous vote by the board to approve the withdrawal. Julia Tarka stated if the applicant were to apply for a wood roof, she would sign it.

Julia Tarka asked if the applicant wanted to hear the board vote on the application or if they would like to withdraw it. The applicant also asked if owners of asphalt-roof homes would have to install wood when they need to redo their roofs. Peter Rosbeck stated that the board would encourage them to use wood.

PH 75 South Water. Josh Gothard. Julia Tarka read the public hearing into the record, constructing a new garage and guest house. The applicant discussed design changes made from the last HDC meeting comments. Josh presented changes for a new garage and guest house, including relocating the Candy Cottage, maximizing green space, and shifting parking to improve the historic home's appearance. He showcased dormer design options and stated the roof would be cedar while keeping the window, door package, and outdoor lighting unchanged. Julia Tarka opened the public hearing for public comment in favor of the applicant. Stephen Berger stated he was in approval of the design. Janes Bradbury said the position, form, and scale are excellent. Thank you for making the changes. Why was the overhang so large, and why did the three windows at the top seem squeezed? The public portion of the hearing is closed. Josh answered Jane's questions. The proposed roof details with the returns also provide a flat soffit in the main house. The owners and I are open to changing the overhang to 8". Julia Tarka moved the public hearing to board deliberation. Peter Rosbeck stated the design looks good and has listened to all neighbor's concerns. Susan Catling is in opposition due to the massing. Ken Magnuson is in favor, and if they want to simplify some of the trim, I am for it. The trim color is white. Hilary Grannis likes the design and prefers the slope cut on the rafters, an 8" overhang on the gable end, and the white trim. James Cisek likes the white trim and how the applicant listened to the neighbors and the HDC and has no problem with the design. Julia Tarka has no problem with the design as presented. Motion to Approve with the slope cut on the rafter tail, the 8" on the gable overhang, and the trim to be white, seconded by Ken Magnuson. Julia Tarka, Peter Rosbeck, Hilary Grannis, Ken Magnuson, and James Cisek favor the design. Susan Catling is opposed. Julia Tarka stated that Josh Gothard will redraw the plans, and she will sign them.

PH 55 Cooke. Ross Seavey. Julia Tarka asked the applicant if he wanted to move forward without a full board. Ross Seavey stated yes. Julia Tarka read the public hearing into the record, 100% demolition of the main house and guest house, except the foundation. Ross discussed the property, stating it was part of a larger parcel in the late 1800s and early 1900s, with the current main house built in 1935. He corrected an inaccurate build date listed on MACRIS and proposed a new structure

on the property designed to contribute to the historic feel and character of the neighborhood. The new structure would be built on a brick foundation, with a mixture of white clapboard and natural wood cedar shingles, and include historically appropriate shutters. Ross also discussed proposed structures, HVAC equipment, Essex green color paint for doors and shutters, hardware, foundation veneer, and lighting. Julia Tarka asked if any board members had questions. Susan Catling discussed a house the applicant stated was demolished; it actually was moved to be someone's guest house. Susan also clarified the mission of the Historic District Commission, emphasizing the preservation of the town's character, not just significant houses or events. This house has been a part of the neighborhood for 89 years.

Julia Tarka opened the public portion of the hearing and invited the public to speak in favor of the project. Paul Richardson, Ted Gage, Mark Engerman, Ian Smith, Mike Iaccarno, and Patrick Ahearn expressed their support for the project, praising its design and the efforts made by the project team to communicate with the neighbors. There was no opposition. The hearing was open to the board. Peter Rosbeck has no comments or questions. Susan Catling does not oppose the 1999 guest house being demolished, but improvements can be made to the 1935 house. It can be altered to make it perfectly acceptable. Ken Magnuson does not like demolishing a 90-year-old house in the district; the house is small and simple, but it is part of the fabric of the street. James Cisek has no problem with demolishing the guest house but does not want the main house demolished; it will change the streetscape. Julia Tarka asked the applicant if they wanted to go forward with the vote tonight or explore a plan where they could change plans. A. No, let's go forward. We went through the exercise of trying to have the main house reworked, and it just isn't there. Julia Tarka stated she has a hard time demolishing a 90-year-old house in the district; I think the other example you showed on Water Street, I did not vote in favor of demolition, and I have a hard time demolishing houses of this age in the district. I think you can build something on this lot; you can expand the house and do something creative there. I don't have a problem demolishing the guest cottage. Motion to Deny the application made by Susan Catling, seconded by James Cisek. Julia Tarka, Susan Catling, James Cisek, and Ken Magnuson are in favor of the denial, and Peter Rosbeck is in favor of the application. The applicant stated he looks forward to reading the decision to deny the application.

114 North Water Street. Joe Delory. The color used on the outside of the house and the electric panel was only temporary and was moved. James Cisek says the arbor stands out from being different from the house as it is white and the house is an off white, if they both could look the same it would work. Ken Magnuson stated we approved a white, and a Dove White was used on the house; the arbor makes it stand out. Ken discussed the B. Moore colors. Hilary Grannis discussed the colors of B. Moore and asked why they chose this color even though it would not match the

rest of the houses in the district. A. White Dove is on the garage; we could have been specific on the application. James Cisek would like the arbor painted the same color as the house. Julia Tarka stated that moving forward, we are asking for the color code and company of the paint color used.

52 South Summer: Teles Landscaping. The applicant discussed what he is responsible for on the property, as there are many moving parts. We are removing the bluestone around the pool because the pitch was off. The patio is going to be extended closer to the house. Discussion of removing the wood fence, which was done by the general contractor for the pool house. Teles Landscaping only installs plants and fixes the bluestone patio by the pool. Julia mentioned her confusion about Teles Landscaping having a fence on the new plan he submitted to the HDC. A. The fence is the original and is on the plan because it will be replaced when the bluestone is replaced. Motion to Approve bluestone work made by Hilary Grannis, seconded by Ken Magnuson.

Julia Cisek asked Carole Berger, HDC's alternate if she voted on 55 Cooke Street. A. No. Julia: Did you want to vote on 55 Cooke? A. I wish I could see the plans first.

NEW/OLD BUSINESS

Julia discussed 27 Fuller and explained that they did not submit an application to HDC and did not get a permit from the building inspector's office. They started the roof and were told to stop, then filed the permit with HDC, which would have been like-in-kind, but they took off the dormer siding to install .5" plywood under the dormer siding. So I could either sign it, like-in-kind or have them come on 10.17.2024. Ken agreed they should come to a meeting.

80 South Water. Lucy Dahl. Taking down the chimney. Julia Tarka stated that she did not sign a permit; this application is coming in on October 17, 2024.

The meeting ended at 5:30 p.m. James Cisek made a Motion to Adjourn, seconded by Hilary Grannis. The board unanimously voted to approve.

Respectfully submitted:
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: _____ 10/03/2024
As voted

