



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: HDCr@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission

Minutes

September 5, 2024

Per Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will only be held through remote conference technology.

Julia Tarka, co-chair, Peter Rosbeck, co-chair, Ken Magnuson, Cari Williamson, Susan Catling, and Hilary Grannis were in attendance. James Cisek was absent.

Julia Tarka called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm and recused herself from 28 South Summer; Peter Rosbeck and Susan Catling chaired the application.

28 South Summer, Louis Lisboa discussed the overlapping shutters. Which the applicant states are common in Edgartown. Susan Catling reminded the applicant that these shutters and the color choice had not been approved. The meeting was open for public comment, and a statement was made on the size and hardware of the shutters, suggesting it was the hardware causing the overlapping. Also, there is no visible street number on the front door. A.: The applicant confirmed that there are address numbers on the side of the house but will relocate the marker to the front of the house. Public comment was closed, and the HDC went into deliberation. Ken Magnuson wants to keep the original dark green color and is not in favor of the arbor. Hilary Grannis and Susan Catling feel the mounting hardware is the problem for overlapping. Neither Ken, Hilary, nor Susan is in favor of having a folding shutter on the bottom right window. The applicant mentioned the height of the arbor and said it is in keeping with the neighborhood and will add more ground cover to lessen the arbor height to 8'6". Susan Catling stated that the arbor, which has not been applied for or approved, will still be the same height and needs to be lowered. A motion was made to withdraw by the applicant, who will submit a new application with measurements for the shutters, shutter hardware, and arbor and arbor height. Motion to Accept Motion to Withdraw was made by Ken Magnuson and Hilary Grannis. *Unanimous vote to accept by the board. After the application*

discussion closed, Julia Tarka suggested marking the house as number 28 for the fire department.

109 School, Jason Ferend discussed general repairs to the exterior, including adding one dormer, reconfiguring a covered porch on the front of the house, and altering a roof. Two old glass windows will be on the bottom right of the façade. Ken Magnuson stated he appreciated the applicant looking into the windows for age determination and made a Motion to Accept as Presented, which Cari Williamson seconded.

10 Pease's Point Way North, Sean MacDonald apologized for installing the PVC fence without an application; he wasn't aware this was needed for installation. The applicant discussed replacing 6' rotten stockade fences along his property and replacing a 4' fence with a 6' fence because his two very young children climb out of the property on them. Discussion was held on possible sanding and or painting the fence, but it was unclear if the paint would last more than a year or two. The board members would like to see the fence replaced with wood, Azak, or solid composite with the look and feel of wood, and has no problem with cobblestone around the fence. Julia Tarka would like a drawing submitted by the applicant suggesting what is ideal for his family and exactly where you want fencing and drawings of what was there prior. The applicant made a Motion for Continuance. Ken Magnuson made a Motion to Accept the Motion for Continuance seconded by Hilary Grannis.
Unanimous vote by the board to approve.

116 South Summer. Gary BenDavid discusses removing existing cedar roof shingles and replacing them with GAF Asphalt shingles. A discussion of the cost of new red shingles with the homeowners occurred; the applicant discussed cost estimates and mentioned that several other houses in the neighborhood had already switched to asphalt—a discussion of the pros and cons of switching from a wood roof to an asphalt roof. Ken Magnuson favored the wood roof, and discussion of the lasting durability of a wood roof ensued. Discussion of the age of the home and ownership history, including possible association with the Dorrance family and Campbell Soup. Susan Catling let the applicant know that it is not the HDC's job to make a determination based on the age or income of the owners; we are just looking at the property. The applicants must make the hardship case themselves. Ken Magnuson made a Motion to send to a Public Hearing and a Site Visit, seconded by Cari Williamson. *Unanimous vote by the board to approve.*

75 South Water. Joshua Gothard discussed the plans for constructing a new garage/guest house. We have taken into account the HDC's comments when redesigning our plans. The guest house/garage demolition and rebuild were discussed, ensuring compliance with the HDC guidelines. Julia Tarka asked the board for their comments and felt the application would go to a public hearing due

to the public interest in this property. Susan Catling still feels the building is too large and favors a public hearing. Cari Williamson is for a public hearing and stated the dormers were discussed to be further back, and I am not sure how different this plan is from the last design. A.: These are about 2.5 feet from the gable end, making them harder to see. We went with natural trim and no corner-boards. Hilary Grannis asked how the garage door opened, approved of the design, and said yes to a public hearing. A.: The garage doors swing upward due to the small space for parking. Julia Tarka requested examples of the proposed garage doors. Ken Magnuson likes the clear, concise presentation and has no problem with the design. I wasn't sure about the back shed roof; if it stepped down with another gable, it would be more concise, and I am not sure how it would look walking from Main Street. A.: If we had another gable there, it would make it look like part of the main house, and we kept the roof as low as possible. We show this as a steel roof, but we will have wood cedar shingles. The applicant will send in an amended application. Motion to send to a public hearing was made by Hilary Grannis and seconded by Julia Tarka. *Unanimous vote to send to a public hearing.*

55 Cooke. Ross Seavey, Esq. Discussion of demolition of the rear guest house and the front structure. Mr. Seavey noted the stable was demolished, leaving the land vacant until the construction of the main house in 1935. Also, the guest house was built in 1999, and it highlighted that the main house was built on piers and was considered an intruder into the historic neighborhood due to its construction after 1933. Ross presented a proposal for a new single-story home designed to fit in with the historic neighborhood while not mimicking existing structures. The proposal also included plans for sound attenuation and eliminating external line sets. Julia asked for board comment. Due to the application to demolish a 90-year-old home, this will go to a public hearing; please state if you are in favor. Hilary Grannis recused herself from this application. Susan Catling appreciates all the history he has found and states that whether the house is 90 or 100 years old, the house has history, and we look at houses not being cookie cutters in the district, and the HDC does appreciate the styles of other homes; I understand the need to add to the home but not to demolish. And I am in favor of a public hearing. Cari Williamson states the rear guest house has no historical significance or value, but the main house is undoubtedly part of the fabric of the historic district and has been for 90 years; a foundation can be dug underneath it, and design can be done where the façade can be left intact so there is a semblance of the original home while making the home to what the homeowner needs. Ken Magnuson agrees to a public hearing. Susan Catling made a motion to send to a public hearing, seconded by Ken Magnuson.

NEW/OLD BUSINESS: Julia Tarka discussed receiving a complaint about White Dove, a paint color by B. Moore, which 114 North Water used to paint their house and did not look white enough. Julia said it looked white when she drove by and

made a judgment call that it was painted white. She welcomed the board to drive by; if the board disagreed, we could bring this complaint to the entire board.

Julia thanked Susan Catling for reminding us about the VTA energy storage boxes, which are still not wrapped. Sharon Brainard is in touch with the VTA and also MV Screen Print.

There was no quorum to vote on the minutes of the previous meeting.

55 Cottage still needs to make the repairs required by the violation letter, but they hope to have everything completed by the end of September.

The meeting ended at 6:00 pm. Ken Magnuson made a motion to Adjourn the meeting, seconded by Susan Catling.

Respectfully submitted:
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: _____ 9/05/2024
As voted

