



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: HDCr@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission

Minutes

August 1, 2024

Per Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will only be held through remote conference technology.

In attendance: Julia Tarka, co-chair, Peter Rosbeck, co-chair, Ken Magnuson, Hilary Grannis, Cari Williamson. Susan Catlin, James Cisek was absent.

Peter Rosbeck called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. Julia Tarka is recusing herself from this application as she is an abutter.

28 South Summer, Louis Lisboa shared photos from homes in the Historic District of shutter colors similar to what he is proposing and an arbor of 8'6" for HDC approval. Peter Rosbeck asked the board for questions and if this should be sent to a public hearing. Hilary Grannis asked about the height of the proposed arbor. A.: 8'6", What is constructed now? A.: 8.6". The photos you have shown regarding the paint color for the shutters are not the same. A.: The color is 16.22 Highway by B. Moore. Ken Magnuson asked where the height of the arbor came from. A.: There are a few arbors on Cooke Street and Pent Lane, I am matching their height. Cari Williamson said the arbor is too high and there is a discrepancy of the color from what is on the house and the color you are proposing, and the shutters overlapping does not look like a neat finish. A.: The overlapping is original to the house. Susan Catling asked Sharon Brainard if the arbor was approved and why discuss the height if it wasn't approved. A.: The application for the arbor was withdrawn. I went back to 2015 and 2020 there was no mention of any arbor or shutter. Louis sent me the minutes for the approved shutters, but they were not mentioned or approved. A.: In the writing of the previous application for a fence, it did not have an arbor listed, but I am showing the renderings of the fence, which has an arbor attached. Susan Catling will review this before the public hearing. There was no mention of the size of the arbor or approval. A.: No, absolutely not. Susan stated that we are starting

over with this application. Susan Catling asked Sharon Brainard regarding the photos of homes the applicants presented and whether they had ever come before the HDC. A.: None of the addresses presented to the HDC ever came before the HDC to approve shutters or paint colors. A lot of the photos were part of the expansion in 2016. The overlapping shutters presented were also part of the expansion. A.: The original house had overlapping shutters and is historic. Susan Catling stated there seem to be some discrepancies, and maybe you can work with Sharon. Peter Rosbeck is concerned about pulling original information and pulling part of it and saying, "These are the shutters that were on the house, but we want to change the color," which is not true; you had new shutters made and want them to be a different color. I would be more comfortable if you kept the original shutters and original color of dark green, but you are coming to us after the fact and want a new color. You can't take part of an approval. As far as the arbor, I will look at the old plans. Motion to send to a public hearing and a site visit by Ken Magnuson seconded by Cari Williamson, *Unanimous vote by the board for a public hearing and site visit.*

99 South Summer, Peter Fletcher shared the existing site plan. We are adding on to a building built in 1973. Photos were shown from different angles viewing the property. The construction will be done in two phases, starting with the guest house, which will be blocked from the street and public view. The cabana at the back of the lot will be visible for a short time, but as the building gets built out, it will no longer be visible from a public way. Front elevation maintains the original box and a lift to restore the failing foundation, and the chimney is actually starting to fall away from the building. The single-car garage was rotated, and a proposed addition is 3' 2" past the existing line, with a single-story addition to the left being a 14' addition from the streetscape. Proposing cottage-style windows for a more historic look and a Nantucket Dormer. In the rear of the property, we are proposing a single-story addition that does not increase the ridge line, and we are reframing the ridge; the shed on the back of the building is going eave to eave, so we propose to bring in the side elevation and will read more as a gable and not a saltbox. The side elevation is a single-story addition with a cedar roof, double-hung windows, Essex Green shutters, and window boxes. On the side of the garage is a shed dormer coming down the side with casement windows; the back of the shed will not be seen in a public way. The cabana at the back of the lot will be visible for a short time, but as the building gets built out, it will no longer be visible from a public way. The 900 sq. ft. guest house will not be visible from a public way.

Julia Tarka asked Peter Fletcher if the back of the property could be seen from Water Street. A.: You can see a very small portion of the shed dormer on the back of the house. Julia: Where is the proposed pool house located? A.: The cabana is hugging the property line abutting the Harborside Inn parking. The guest house is in the corner, behind the back of the pool. Julia Tarka asked for board input. All commissioners said yes to a public hearing and site visit. Hilary Grannis asked if

one of the side elevations to the ridge to the main box is higher. A.: Yes, just slightly; we are trying to get some space; the building is set on a knoll. We might want to remove the carriage house from the knoll so that the roof line would drop and match the main house. Hilary: That is a great idea. Ken Magnuson asked if there was going to be pool fencing. A.: We have a stockade fence and 4' fencing. Ken: Do you believe that the pool and fencing cannot be seen by a public way? A.: I don't believe so. We can mock up for a site visit. We can also take the cupola off the cabana if need be. Cari Williamson asked about lot coverage. Julia Tarka stated that it is not in the HDC's purview. Julia Tarka asked about the sq. ft. in the main house. A.: I can get you the information that would apply to us. Susan Catling made a motion to send to a public hearing and a site visit seconded by Peter Rosbeck.

New/Old Business: Peter Rosbeck moved to Accept the July 25, 2024, minutes, which was seconded by Ken Magnuson.

Motion was made that Sharon Brainard was approved to work full-time by Susan Catling seconded by Peter Rosbeck. *Unanimous vote by the board.*

Hilary Grannis stated she would not be available for the next meeting but did a site visit at 139 Katama Road and they are old windows with ropes and weights.

Motion made by Hilary Grannis to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Susan Catling. The meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Respectfully submitted:
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: _____ 8/1/2024
As voted