



**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158  
70 Main Street  
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: [www.edgartown-ma.us](http://www.edgartown-ma.us)  
email: [HDCr@edgartown-ma.us](mailto:HDCr@edgartown-ma.us)

## **Edgartown Historic District Commission**

### **Minutes**

### **July 11, 2024**

Per Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will only be held through remote conference technology.

In attendance: Julia Tarka, co-chair, Ken Magnuson, Hilary Grannis, Susan Catling, James Cisek, Cari Williamson. Peter Rosbeck was absent.

Julia Tarka called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.

**PH 115 South Water:** Louise Brooks shared the proposed renovation and additions. The proposed changes included reducing the height of the ridge and overall roof height, removing the non-historic 2015 addition and rear covered porch, and building a new addition covered porch. The gutters will be copper and the roof will be wood shingles. Julia Tarka asked for board feedback. The commissioners discussed a 14% increase in lot coverage and replacing the existing 6-foot fence. Also, the increase in square footage of the addition is 728 sf, with the roof ridge, is higher than the historic home. Questions were asked about the material for the steps leading to the breezeway, which will be brick. Julia Tarka asked if the lantern in the garage was for code. A.: The lantern is not needed for code it will be for pedestrian safety in the parking court in front. The commissioners also discussed their concerns about the proposed addition's dominance over the historic home and suggested changes to make it more subservient. Hilary Grannis expressed her concerns about the new addition's architectural style, it appears to be a two-story structure, not a dormer, with two architectural styles being proposed. She also noted the proposed gutter and dormer alignments did not match the original design, resulting in a discrepancy in architectural language.

Julia Tarka moved to public comment, first in favor and then opposition, seeing none, the public portion of the public hearing was closed and moved to board

deliberation. The consensus of the board was not in favor of the new addition, it is too imposing and the style does not represent what the historic house represents.

The applicant was given the choice of a vote or withdrawal, the applicant chose to withdraw and asked clarifying questions for feedback. Motion to Accept Withdrawal made by Ken Magnuson, seconded by James Cisek. *Unanimous vote by the Board to Approve Withdrawal.*

**42 South Water:** Steve Correll discussed replacing two wood columns with composite, explaining how the wood columns have deteriorated. Steve explained the plan to restore the columns, including the damaged capitals, with composite materials sourced from a company specializing in historical restorations that would closely match the original wood. Steve discussed his intention of repairing the original wood capitals if possible, but would not know their condition until he begins restoration. The Commissioners discussed if the capitals needed to be replaced, would the company he is using be able to make a replica or would he be using the closest they have for the capital and the gaps under the wood columns? A.: There are some minor details in the capitals but they are very close and the gaps under the wood columns are a metal base for drainage, the fiberglass does not need them. Hilary Grannis asked before he replaces the capital, to come back to the HDC and confirm the dimensions are exact. Motion to Approve with the exception of the capital needing replacement, to come back to the HDC and confirm the dimensions are exact made by Hilary Grannis and seconded by Ken Magnuson. *A unanimous vote by the Board to Approve with Exception.*

**53 Main:** Free-est Removal of blue and white awnings and replace with yellow and white awnings, approval of blade signs. Julia Tarka stated she spoke with the building inspector, and this is a formula retail store, the MV Commission has strict rules about formula retail stores, and this application is an automatic referral to the MVC. The HDC will pause hearing this application and the applicant will come back in front of the HDC after they have met with the MV Commission.

Julia will fill out the referral form and send a letter to the MVC. The motion to refer the application to the MV Commission was made by Julia Tarka and seconded by Ken Magnuson. *Unanimous vote by the Board to Approve Referral.*

**New/Old Business:** Motion to Accept June 20, 2024 minutes made by James Cisek, seconded by Ken Magnuson. *Unanimous vote by the Board to Approve.*

Discussion on new and updated violation letters

Cari Williamson made a Motion to Adjourn the meeting, seconded by James Cisek.  
*Unanimous vote by the Board to Adjourn the Meeting.*

The meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Respectfully submitted:  
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 7/11/2024  
As voted