



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: HDCr@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission

Minutes

April 25, 2024

In accordance with Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will be held through remote conference technology only.

Julia Tarka called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm. Members in attendance: Julia Tarka, co-chair, Peter Rosbeck, co-chair, Ken Magnuson, Susan Catling. James Cisek, Cari Williamson arrived late.

The public hearing notices were read into record, Julia Tarka discussed the procedure for public hearings.

119 North Water, Conover Restoration discussed their plans. Two proposed changes for modification: 1. Azek for the railing, paint to match, traditional style 2. Extend the existing deck, moving stairs to allow decks to connect. Replacing a door and adding shutters. No one spoke in favor or against the application, the board deliberated. Motion to Approve as submitted made by Peter Rosbeck seconded by Ken Magnuson. *Unanimous vote by the board to approve as submitted.*

27 North Water, Sasha Robinson-White shared his renderings. **North Elevation:** Proposing to switch out the old gallery door to a door in-kind to the other existing entry doors, added side lights and the awning to match. **Kelley Street:** Add new bay window like NWS facade, cedar shingle roof, three windows in the back area for natural light, relocating the HVAC, wrap -a-round cedar shingle roof which will cover the bay windows and replace entry door matching NWS. Replacing roofing material and trim and adding copper downspout. **East Elevation:** Elevator entry foyer which accesses the residents, no stop at the retail location. **South Elevation:** The new roof wraps around, proposing two double hung windows in the back and also the entry foyer. Remove the metal chimney. A public question is when the work is to be done? Answer. The fall. Julia Tarka closed

the public portion, the board deliberated. Motion to Approve as submitted, except the chimney is omitted made by Ken Magnuson, seconded by Susan Catling. *Unanimous vote to approve as submitted except the chimney is omitted.*

2 Main. Andrew Kahl discussed replacing rotten trim with composite Azek painted to match existing. Molded trim will be replaced with molded trim. Motion to Approve as Submitted made by Peter Rosbeck, seconded by Ken Magnuson. *Unanimous vote by the board to approve as submitted.*

84 South Water, Chuck Sullivan shared his renderings, Johan Quintas discussed the property's proposal. Take off the back portion of the house and rebuild, existing garage take down and rebuild, reduce the size of the deck, revising the summer house. Front façade does not change except to replace the siding with wood siding and change two windows. **North Elevation:** Due to fire code, replace with seditious siding. **First Floor.** Built out toward the back, a garage bay, the summer house is refigured for a bathroom and the second floor is a bedroom. **South Elevation:** Is the new part, the dormers stay the same other than the replacement of windows, siding, roof and trim. **Front Elevation:** Replacement of new windows, siding, trim and roof. Questions from the board were: types of windows, the size of dormer with triple windows on the North elevation and the summer house roof line looks oversized. A loss of the viewing corridor where the drive thru garage is going currently. Answer: Loen's Aluminum Clad, one dormer exists and added this (photo) dormer and is the same size and scale of what is existing on South elevation and tried to simplify by joining the dormers together, we have revised to a shed dormer instead of a gable dormer. I have new plans drawn up but I missed the cutoff time period. The bay garage is in the way back and is part of the view currently. The roof is being replaced like-kind, asphalt. The proposed addition is moved back 4' from where it is now. Anything less than 5' is being replaced with seditious siding. The window orientation is changing due to the interior. The chimneys are staying and there is one new chimney being added. The windows on the front of the house are not old except for one on the front which was recovered on the stairs, front porch.

Julia Tarka asked for votes if this application should go to a public hearing and any other feedback before the public hearing. Motion to send to a public hearing made by Cari Williamson and seconded by James Cisek. *Unanimous vote by the board to send to a public hearing and site visit.*

131 North Water (20B-107). Rod Jane shared his designs and discussed his application. Approval on the Huxford Cottage, faces Fuller Street and seeking to make updates. We would like to replace the wood shingles with asphalt, weathered wood color that match the main historic building and the Roxana Building. (Photo) this is a picture of existing window 6/6, Brosco brand, a very low brand which were on the building when purchased with low energy efficiency. We would like to replace

with Pella lifestyle series, an aluminum clad, exterior window with a simulated divided light and double paned, energy efficient. We would also like to remove the shutters from the Huxford Building, most of the windows do not have shutters. The other cottages on the site do not have shutters. If approved, we would like to have the work start in the fall.

Julia Tarka asked about the age of the Huxford Cottage and Susan Catling asked if this was the building moved from Main Street. Answer: Unsure of the age and yes to being moved from Main Street. Ken Magnuson, Julia Tarka, James Cisek and Peter Rosbeck feel strongly for the roof to stay as wood not asphalt. The Collins and Luce Cottages have a wood roof the others have asphalt.

The windows and shutters are fine but the majority of the board want the roof to stay wood. Peter Rosbeck would like a site visit and a public hearing to see the windows. A motion was made by Ken Magnuson for a public hearing and a site visit seconded by Peter Rosbeck. *Unanimous vote by the board to send to a public hearing and a site visit.*

75 South Water Josh Gothard discussed the key changes to the application. On the Macris report it refers to other features of the house how the front is facing the harbor and his clients want to honor the history of the home. A new street entrance door and a bicycle door on the one bay garage. There is 42 feet to the property line with a 15' easement for viewing.

Julia Tarka asked for comments from the board. Ken Magnuson discussed the measurement of the sunroom, he is in favor of most of the project but not the sunroom. Susan Catling discusses the size of the garage which over powers the house. Cari Williamson wants the bicycle door on the side and the width of the garage reduced further. The two window option for the sunroom which is in keeping with the rest of the house. James Cisek likes the improvements in the garage, the two windows on the sunroom. Julia Tarka appreciates you working with the board, I am in favor of the garage and changes to the house outside the sunroom. I would be in favor of bringing back the widow's walk.

Josh Gothard talks about the size of the growing family for generations. The garage is also a guest house and we can't reduce the width much further without not allowing for headroom in the guest house. It is important for the family to keep the front façade the same which is why they want the sunroom so the front facade would be untouched and leaving almost 28' of view preserved. Agent asked what the board would want to make the sunroom feel less massing of the house. Ken Magnuson felt it creates an imbalance of the house. Susan Catling feels it is disrespectful to the iconic home. Motion was made for a public hearing and a site visit by James Cisek,

seconded by Ken Magnuson. *Unanimous vote by the board for a public hearing and site visit.*

NEW/OLD BUSINESS

29 Morse. Cari Williamson does not feel it is old glass, no bubbles or waviness. James Cisek said they are old but not original to the building. Susan Catling thought the windows are 1920's and historic. Cari Williamson, Susan Catling and James Cisek though they can be re-glazed. Agent: Owners want to replace windows for more energy efficient. The new replacement, are the exact same size of the windows and the exterior trim would remain all wood and getting rid of the storm windows. Ken Magnuson would not have a problem with a newer window which is more efficient. Susan Catling cited the HDC guidelines and was there any consideration to rebuild the windows. Answer: No. Motion was made by Ken Magnuson to approve the replacement window, seconded by Cari Williamson. Susan Catling and James Cisek were against the approval. Julia, Peter, Cari, Ken were in favor of the vote.

NEW/OLD BUSINESS

The Vincent Prada House: James Cisek attended the MV Commission hearing on the Vincent Prada House and found historical information which dates the home to 1875. A motion was made to send a letter to the MV Commission to relook at the historic facts was made by Susan Catling seconded by James Cisek. Susan Catling, Cari Williamson, James Cisek and Ken Magnuson voted in favor, Julia Tarka abstained as she is an abutter and Peter Rosbeck was not in favor.

Vineyard Northeast Offshore Wind Energy Development. The HDC board was asked to join as consultants on impact to any historic properties. More clarification was decided by the board to move further and will discuss at the next HDC meeting.

Sarah Jane Hughes asked if people who call into the zoom meetings need to identify themselves. Julia said we did not ask the audience to identify themselves when meetings were not online, Susan Catling thought we had a sign in sheet. Julia discussed the HDC board could look into this matter.

Violation letters: were sent out, 55 Cottage and 117 Upper Main. Ken has concerns that the railing is to code and there is a lantern on the deck at 55 Cottage. Susan Catling asked about 7 Starbuck Neck, Julia stated the Conservation Committee approved their application without Historic approval and the building department approved. I did talk with them and they are coming in to fill out an application.

Historic New England discussed deed restriction on 86 North Water, the building department works with HNE.

Motion to Adjourn made by James Cisek seconded by Susan Catling.

Meeting adjourned at 6:00 pm.

Respectfully submitted:
Sharon Brainard,
Administrator

Approved: _____ 04/25/2024
As voted