



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: HDCr@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission
Minutes
March 7, 2024 4:00 PM

In accordance with Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will be held through remote conference technology only.

The commissioners had scheduled site visits for the public hearings.

Julia Tarka opened the meeting at 4:01 pm. Members in attendance: Peter Rosbeck, James Cisek, Cari Williamson, Ken Magnuson, Christopher Scott, alternate. Julia Tarka discussed the procedure for each public hearing: the applicant will get to present without interruption, a short overview of the project, commission members will then have the chance to ask questions. The meeting will then open the portion to public comment, first in favor then in opposition. The applicant can respond to anything in opposition. The public hearing will then be closed and the board will enter into a deliberation phase to discuss the project further.

4:00: PH 55 Cooke Street (20D-37) Paul Richardson/Agent. Demolish 1999 guest house. Demolish additions to original 1920's structure. Relocate and restore original 1920's structure. Construct new main house. Demolition: 100% guesthouse, 53% main house. Robert Moriarty shared the applicant's plan for the property. The original house, built in 1920 is on pags, and would be moved to where the guest house is now. Removal of all vinyl windows, replaced with double hung wood windows and removal of plastic shutters. The 1999 guesthouse would be demolished. A new Greek revival style structure would be built using HDC approved material guideline. Agent discussed the owner had been before the HDC to demolish the original structure and was told it would be better to move to the back. Agent also understands that any new structure needs to be subordinate to the original structure, but by moving the original structure to replace the guesthouse would be better than demolishing it. We would do a view easement and parking in front for two vehicles.

Ken Magnuson asked about the exact dimension of the original box. Answer: The whole main house now is 920 sf. And the original main house is a little over 500 sf. The guest house existing is 450 sf. Cari Williamson asked for clarification of the new footprint of the structure. Answer: 2700 sf. 18 x 50 is the footprint. Ken Magnuson asked what is the proposed lot coverage size percentage wise? Answer: About 40%.

Julia Tarka opened the public hearing to the public. There were no public comments in favor or opposed to the application. Agent stated that there were six abutters in approval of this application. Peter Rosbeck asked about the location of the utilities. Answer: On the right side. Peter: It won't fit. Answer: We can't give a definite location now, if we can't get it on the left side, then in the back.

Julia Tarka closed the public portion of the hearing for board deliberation. Ken Magnuson understands the need and desire for more space but the original structure will be completely obliterated, the lot coverage is far too high and the A/C units do not fit on the plan so the application would need to come back to the HDC. Cari Williamson agrees with Ken, I would rather have the original structure with a foundation under it and other additions made to the back of the 1920 structure. The coverage of the structure would be more than 40% of the lot. James Cisek doesn't like the idea of the original structure being moved to the back, I think it should be moved closer to the street and any addition would be added on to the back end so the street scape would not change and the historic building still seen. Chris Scott agrees with the scale of the new structure. Julia Tarka also agrees regarding the size of the structure.

Julia Tarka asked the applicants if after hearing the commissioner's feedback, if they wanted the board to vote tonight or to withdraw and come back with a new application. Applicant is withdrawing the application. Motion to Accept the Withdrawal made by Ken Magnuson seconded by James Cisek. *Unanimous vote to approve Motion to Withdraw Application.*

4:30: PH 39 Main (20D-207.2) Longfellow Design Build/Agent. Remove existing windows and replace to match existing window pattern. Agent shared the designs. Julia Tarka asked the commission members any question they may have. James Cisek asked if they would consider replacing the front door with custom made, the threshold replaced and leaving the arch window above it, replacing the broken piece of glass. The windows on the side I have no problem with. Answer: It is feasible but the intention was to replace the windows, bring them up to energy code and maintain the wood windows and doors. James Cisek, Historically, they should remain as is and if not, they should be restored or custom made to replace what is there.

Julia Tarka opened the public hearing to speak in either opposition or in favor. There were none.

Julia Tarka opened the board deliberation phase to discuss the project further. Peter Rosbeck stated the concern is trying to replace a single pane historically accurate window with a high energy replacement. I do believe replacement is the best course at this point, the windows and doors have been re-glazed several times and the wood has been painted and repaired and at this time are quite rotten. A production window would be hard to fill on an historic main street. A semi-custom wood windows or doors that could use some of the existing glass and they make antique looking new glass and remake some of these windows and doors as a middle ground because it is going to be hard to duplicate that historic look of those particular windows with a production type of a unit. Ken Magnuson stated that these windows and doors are so unique and want to see everything exact, even if they are a hybrid, but I am not in favor of production windows. Chris Scott is in favor of a comprehensive repair or a configuration. James Cisek, Cari Williamson and Julia Tarka agree with all the comments that have been made.

Julia Tarka asked the applicants if they wanted the board to vote or to withdraw and come back with a revised application. Applicant withdrew the application. Motion to Accept Motion to Withdraw made by Cari Williamson and seconded by Chris Scott. *Unanimous vote to approve Motion to Withdraw Application.*

4:50: PH 75 South Water (20D-336) Josh Gothard/Agent. Two single story additions and one two story addition to the existing house. Construction of a new 2 car garage/guest house. Agent discussed the modifications made to the structure exterior over time. He noted the loss of historic architectural elements such as the parapet along the roof line and the Candy Cottage. He plans to maintain the original front door and honor the house's history aiming to preserve its historic elements and relocate non-historic elements out of public view. The plans for this property include demolishing small sheds and shower, relocating or concealing non-functioning shutters and a bulkhead, reducing and relocating the existing parking area and placing the garage on the North side of the property. The current lot coverage is 7.1% and plan to demolish 1.6% which are the small sheds and the shower. The main house is 12% lot coverage for a total of 15.4% of lot coverage which also includes the garage/guest house. Agent stated they are leaving a 25' view corridor that is far greater than existing in the area across a private residence. The additions are similar in nature that are in the Historic District area. The garage front is 11.5 ft. tall, others in the neighborhood range much higher. Josh's proposal also included changes to the fencing layout and parking arrangement. He confirmed that the new foundation would be cast-in-place with a brick veneer, and the height of the building would not change.

Julia Tarka opened the meeting to the public comment. Jim spoke in favor of the proposed design stating that the view easement is currently 10' and the owners are extending the easement to 25' and that the designs have already been approved elsewhere in the historic district. John Britton spoke in opposition suggesting removing the external chimney, reducing the size of the addition and changing the roof ridge line.

The board discussed potential improvements, Chris Scott opposed the proposal of raising the house and the additions on both sides of the building. The board also discussed the sunroom, Ken Magnuson suggesting a simpler design and that it was too contemporary and stating his dislike for second story decks. Julia Tarka clarified the process of house lifting and the need for a structural plan before proceeding. She also agreed with some of the feedback and suggested that the garage could be made a smaller. Julia Tarka then offered the option of either voting on the proposal or withdrawing the application. Josh asked for further clarification before making a decision. Josh decided to withdraw his application following public feedback and proposed to resubmit it in a future hearing.

A Motion to Accept the withdrawal was made by James Cisek and seconded by Ken Magnuson. *Unanimous vote to accept the Motion to Withdraw.*

5:15: 10 Daggett (20D-298.2) Juliet Mulinare/Agent. Replace existing wood gutter, trim and downspout with PVC Gutters, trim and downspout on the Northwest side of the building. No color change. Agent presented her plan to replace existing wood gutter, trim and downspout with PVC for the Council on Aging building. Lyndsay Famariss, Administrator of the Council of Aging also discussed the issues with the wooden gutters, including water handling capacity and safety concerns, and proposed replacing them with effectiveness being a consideration. There was also a discussion about the overflow water's destination and the need to replace the gutter facing the building. Peter Rosbeck suggested using fiberglass to match the profile of the wood gutter which is stronger on long runs. James Cisek made a Motion to Approve. Ken Magnuson seconded. *Unanimous vote to approve.*

5:25: 114 North Water (20D-271) Joe Delory/Agent. Parry Windows & Doors unable to accommodate window order given current workload. Therefore, request to change window manufacturer for front elevation windows, design & material to remain the same as approved on 1.18.2024. Specifically, a like-kind change from Parry (Chilmark, MA) hand-crafted wood windows to Phist & Lassing handcrafted wood windows. A Motion to Approve was made by James Cisek seconded by Ken Magnuson. *Unanimous vote to approve.*

5:35: 77 Peases's Point Way South (29A-2.2) Sean Buckley/Agent. Install an 8.88 KW roof mounted solar array consisting of (23) Hanwha Q. Cell .405W panels on existing dwelling. No battery storage. Agent shared renderings and photos of the application which was discussed by the commissioners. A motion was made by James Cisek to send the proposal to a public hearing for further discussion and visibility assessment seconded by Ken Magnuson. *Unanimous vote to send to a public hearing.*

New/Old Business:

A motion was made to accept last meetings minutes by Cari Williamson, seconded by James Cisek. *Unanimous vote to Accept.*

A Motion to Adjourn was made by James Cisek and seconded by Ken Magnuson. Meeting adjourned at 6:00 pm. *Unanimous vote to Adjourn.*

Respectfully submitted:
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: _____ 03/07/2024
As voted