



Town of Edgartown
Historic District Commission
Post Office Box 5158
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: www.edgartown-ma.us
email: HDCr@edgartown-ma.us

Edgartown Historic District Commission

Minutes

February 1, 4:00 PM

In accordance with Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will be held through remote conference technology only.

Peter Rosbeck opened the meeting at 4:00 pm. Members in attendance: James Cisek, Cari Williamson, Ken Magnuson, Hilary Grannis, Susan Catling.

Peter Rosbeck called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm and read the public hearing notice into record. There were no site visits this week.

4:00: PH 92 South Summer (29B-2.1) Casey Decker/Agent. Demolish rear portions of non-historic home. Keep front portion of home intact (renovate) interior. Extend existing dormers on South side of home to match existing. Extend first level mass for first level bedroom and entry. Casey shared changes made since the last HDC meeting on the renderings. First, the bulkhead door is to remain wood, second the side entrance looked too formal and a gable was removed facing the entrance and removed the side lights, the glazing was reduced from three to two windows, removed one of the windows from the front and pulled the dormers apart what the interior would allow. The gutters will be fiberglass and will try to replicate the downspouts. Other items were the North facing dormers which he broke up to look like the existing. The chimney will be removed and replaced with a faux chimney. The hardie board on the front will be replaced with cedar instead. Board remarks: Susan Catling asked about the North facing side, what is the depth of the first to the second story windows. Casey stated that the bedroom windows are longer than the first floor, James Cisek thought the dormer where the chimney will be looks awkward being off centered, there is no roof. Casey showed the floor plans to explain why the dormer is the size it, he could extend the dormer but would again, be against the chimney. Ken Magnuson asked about the age of the middle section which was between 1884 and 1915. Our intent is to save the roof and the walls on the

second floor. Hilary Grannis discussed composite gutters to match the original, and Casey agreed.

Peter Rosbeck opened the floor to the public, there were none. The public hearing was closed for the board to deliberate. Cari Williamson just wanted to reiterate that the board appreciates that Casey will come back before the HDC if there is a need for more removal to be done, as this has been problematic with a few applicants in the past. Susan Catling would like the windows in the laundry, powder room and bathroom longer to match the other windows to look more balanced. Susan Catling made a Motion to Approve with the changes to the gutters, laundry, kitchen windows and bathroom windows. Ken Magnuson seconded. Unanimous vote by the board to approve.

4:15 PH 117 North Water (19B-52) Louise Brooks/Agent. Selective demo and replacement of existing front entry, back terrace and non-conforming side entry. Replace exterior windows, doors for high-efficiency alternatives. Existing roof will be removed and reframed to address structural and water damage. The new roof will be built to match the existing hip roof lines and widow's walk. Louise shared her renderings and is proposing to remove both chimneys and construct a new chimney in the right rear corner. To address the structural and water damage the roof and dormers will be rebuilt but exactly as existing. The mechanical system will be upgraded and incorporated into the structure. The corner pilaster will be built with the same footprint. The front door will have sidelights and a transom. Left elevation windows have been reduced for privacy. The addition of a dormer on the rear floor and the addition of a chimney on the third floor, the decks have become narrower and added a door between the two existing French doors. South elevation has a new side entrance but is brought in to comply with the setbacks.

Peter Rosbeck asked for questions from the board. James Cisek wanted to know if the railings on the widow's walk is up to code. Answer: Yes.

The public hearing was open to the public, no one spoke. The public hearing was closed to the public.

Board comment: James Cisek asked if there was access to the widow's walk and if so are the railings up to code. Answer: The floor line is lower than the rail line and it is code. Cari Williamson is in favor with the traditional railing, Hilary Grannis asked about the glass railing and Pella and Anderson windows, and is in favor. Ken Magnuson is in favor with the change of the removal of the glass railings. Louise is going to change the composite to match the rest of the house. Ken Magnuson made a Motion to Approve with the change to the glass railings to traditional. Susan Catling seconded. Unanimous vote by the board to approve.

4:30: PH 131 North Water (20B-107) Rod Jane/Agent. Enlarge openings so existing window wall, presently the Menemsha Room. Remove existing windows. Install sliding French doors. Add small exterior deck in from wall with railings and solid side walls that include shingles and wood/Azek trim. Reconfigure pool fence. Rod Jane shared the renderings for the renovations. A small area buried in the center of the hotel by the Roxana Building is slightly visible from Starbuck Neck. The Menemsha Room will have a four door slider system, which slides into a pocket installed with an opening of approximately 16' and a small 4' deep porch which is self-contained, and there is no way to get off the porch to get to the pool or any other area. The wall outside the Menemsha Room will have cedar shingles and copper gutters. The gate will be moved to the right hand side. Mr. Jane addressed letters from the public. There is no direct pool access, there is no change in capacity nor use of the space. Since 2019 the applicant has been in litigation with neighbors, we are just looking for appropriateness which we propose.

Peter Rosbeck asked if the board has any questions, seeing none the public hearing was open to the public. There was no one from the public to speak either in favor or opposition. The public hearing was closed to the public for the board to deliberate.

James Cisek said he is in favor of the application, Ken Magnuson has no comments, Cari Williamson has no problem with the application since it has been explained that there is no egress coming downstairs and is in an enclosed space and not within the public view, Susan Catling, Hilary Grannis and Peter Rosbeck are in favor. Ken Magnuson made a Motion to Approve and James Cisek seconded. Unanimous vote by the board to approve.

5:00: 55 Cooke Street (20D-37) Paul Richardson/Agent. Demolish 1990 guesthouse. Demolish additions to original 1920's structure. Relocate and restore original 1920's structure. Construct new main house. Robert Moriarty shared the renderings. The historic structure will be moved to where the guest house is now, demolish the guest house. Board discussion: Cari Williamson suggests a public hearing and is in favor of the restoration of the 1920's bungalow. James Cisek agrees to a public hearing. Susan Catling agrees to a public hearing and asks how this fits with our requirements to have any additions be subordinate since now the gigantic, new main house has nothing to do with the existing cottage and the existing cottage has everything to do with the flavor of the neighborhood, I have no idea how this could possibly adhere to our guidelines. Ken Magnuson, Peter Rosbeck agree to a public hearing. Motion to Move to a Public Hearing made by Cari Williamson, seconded by James Cisek.

New/Old Business: Motion to approve the minutes from January 18th were made by James Cisek and seconded by Cari Williamson. Peter Rosbeck made a Motion to

Approve Carole Berger as an alternate on the Historic District Commission board, Ken Magnuson seconded. Unanimous vote by the board to approve.

A Motion to Adjourn was made by James Cisek and seconded by Susan Catling. Meeting adjourned at 5:30 pm.

Respectfully submitted:
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: _____ 02/1/2024
As voted